

### Bando per giovani coinvolti in progetti di ricerca - 2018

# Temporary relocation projects as safe and protected spaces for human rights defenders.

Guidelines for the creation in Trentino of a "città in difesa di" for women human rights defenders under threat.

SCHOLAR Marzia Deflorian HOST INSTITUTION Centro Studi di Difesa Civile

**Organizations involved** Yaku Onlus, Forum trentino per la Pace ed i Diritti Umani

> Scientific Responsable Luisa Del Turco

Academic Responsable Prof.ssa Ester Gallo





#### INDEX

1	NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT	6
	1.1 Human Rights Defenders	6
	1.2 Women Human Rights Defenders	7
	1.3 Special Rapporteur on the situation of Human Rights Defenders	7
	1.4 EU guidelines	8
	1.5 EU mechanisms	9
	1.6 OSCE guidelines	. 10
	1.7 Council of Europe declaration	. 11
	1.8 The efforts of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights and the Inter- American Commission on Human Rights	. 12
	1.9 The Resolution of the Italian Commission of External and EU Affairs	. 14
	1.10 The Italian National Action Plan for the implementation of Resolution 1325 of the Unite Nations Security Council	
	1.11 The Italian network "In difesa di" (In defence of)	. 17
2	1 THE DUTCH "SHELTER CITY" – JUSTICE & PEACE NETWORK	. 19
	2.2 The Dutch context	. 20
	2.3 The actors involved	. 21
	2.4 The selection of defenders	. 22
	2.5 Activities organized by the Shelter City network	. 23
	2.6 Holistic Security Training	. 24
	2.7 The Shelter City model during the COVID-19	. 24
	2.8 The meeting in Barcelona and the guidelines on the well-being of defenders and defenders	. 25
	2.9 Support during the stay	. 26
	2.10 Return to the country of origin	
	2.11 International Shelter Cities	
2	12 BASQUE TEMPORARY RELOCATION PROGRAMME – CEAR EUSKADI	. 32
	2.13 The Spanish context: The Royal Decree 1257/2007	. 33
	2.14 The Basque context	
	2.15 The actors involved	. 35
	2.16 The selection of defenders	. 36
	2.17 Activities	. 37
	2.18 The temporary relocation programme during COVID-19	. 38
	2.19 Support during the stay	. 39

2.20 Return to the country of origin	. 41	
2.21 The Spanish temporary relocation network	. 41	
COMPRATIVE TABLE OF THE BASQUE AND DUTCH MODELS	. 46	
3. THE PROGRAMME "JOURNALISTS IN RESIDENCE" – EUROPEAN CENTRE FOR PRESS		
3.1 The context	. 55	
3.2 The involved actors	. 55	
3.3 The selection of participants	. 56	
3.4 The activities	. 56	
3.5 The Journalists-in-residence programme at the time of COVID-19	. 57	
3.6 The support during the permanence	. 57	
3.7 The return to the country of origin	. 58	
3.8 The programme Journalists in Residence Milano		
3.9 SCHOLARS AT RISK TRENTO	. 61	
3.10 The involved actors	. 61	
3.11 The selection of candidates	. 62	
3.12 The activities	. 63	
3.13 The programme during the COVID-19 pandemic	. 64	
3.14 The support during the permanence	. 64	
3.15 The return to the country of origin	. 65	
4. THE GUIDELINES FOR THE CREATION OF A "CITTÀ IN DIFESA DI" IN TRENTINO	. 67	
REFERENCES	. 71	
ANNEX	. 74	
ANNEX I: Declaration on human rights defenders - Declaration on the right and responsibility of individuals, groups and organs of society to promote and protect universally recognized human rights and fundamental freedoms		
ANNEX II: Promotion of the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and		
Fundamental Freedoms: protecting women human rights defenders.	. 79	
APPENDIXES	. 86	
APPENDIX I: Interview sample for coordinators of temporary relocation programs	. 87	
APPENDIX II - Report International Shelter City Workshop	. 88	
APPENDIX III: Interview with Suzan Goes, Justice & Peace	. 89	
APPENDIX IV: Report Workshop Barcelona	. 95	
APPENDIX V: Report roundtable on the topic "città in difesa di"	. 96	
APPENDIX VI: Report workshop on the topic "città in difesa di" a Rubano (PD)	. 96	
APPENDIX VII: Report roundtable on the "città rifugio" – Comune di Padova	. 97	

APPENDIX VIII: Interview with Leire Lasa, Cear Euskadi97
APPENDIX IX: Biographies of the defenders hosted in Bilbao in the context of the "Programa vasco de proteccion de Defensoras y Defensores de Derechos Humanos"
APPENDIX X: Interview with Nestor Hernandez 108
APPENDIX XI: Interview with Paola Ararat Nazarit
APPENDIX XII: Defenders' sheets 121
APPENDIX XIII: Questions and answers from Javier Arjona's interview, ONGD Soldepaz Pachakuti
APPENDIX XIV: Acta de compromiso de la entidad solicitante en Euskadi
APPENDIX XV: Questions and answers Tessa van Bommel, Justice & Peace
APPENDIX XVI: Biography of the defender hosted in the Netherlands in the context of the Shelter City temporary relocation program
APPENDIX XVII: Interview with David Gomez Gamboa129
APPENDIX XVIII: Interview Stephanie Koch, European Centre or Press and Media Freedom133
APPENDIX XIX: Interview to Anna Artemeva, journalist hosted by the ECMPF programme 137
APPENDIX XX: Interview with Christian Elia, responsible of the Journalists in Residence – Milan programme
APPENDIX XXI – Workshop on good practices for the defence and promotion of human rights women defenders
APPENDIX XXII: Interview to Ester Gallo, coordinator of the SAR Trento's protection programme for scholars

#### ABSTRACT

The main topic of this research is the analysis and the comparison of some of the temporary relocation programmes for human rights defenders under threat already active in Europe, with the aim of outlining a series of useful recommendations for the design of a similar program in Trentino (North-East Italy).

The first chapter offers an overview of the existent tools, both at national and international level, for the protection and support of human rights defenders around the world.

The second chapter develops the data collected through a field survey concerning two of the main ongoing experiences considered in this research: the one managed by Justice&Peace, in the Netherlands, and the one coordinated by Cear Euskadi in Basque Countries (Spain).

The third chapter deals with the long-term academic visit project for threatened academics and scholars promoted by the international network "Scholars at Risk" in collaboration with the University of Trento, and the work of the European Centre for Press and Media Freedom in Leipzig (Germany), which provide European journalists and media workers in danger with its "journalists in residence" program.

The fourth and final chapter is dedicated to the experience of the local Trentino group of the Italian network "In difesa di" (*in defense of*) and describes the path that led several local organizations to join the common project of designing a shelter city for human rights defenders in the city of Trento. The final part of this section collects a series of considerations and recommendations, thought to be part of the toolbox for the start-up and management of the project "Città in difesa di" (*cities in defense of*).

The research is conducted through a gender perspective which pays particular attention to the specific experiences and needs that female and male defenders live in their home contexts and during their experience in a temporary relocation program.

Key words: human rights, human rights defender, women, temporary relocation, città in difesa di

#### **1. NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT**

#### **1.1 Human Rights Defenders**

As defined by the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals. Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental *Freedoms*<sup>1</sup> from the United Nations (UN), a Human Right Defender is anyone who works for the promotion and protection of human rights, professionally or not, including volunteers, workers, journalists, lawyers and anyone who is committed, even occasionally, in any activity linked to human rights<sup>2</sup>. Commonly known as "UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders", this document was approved by the UN General Assembly with Resolution A/RES/53/144<sup>3</sup> in March 1999, following a long process of elaboration and revision, which started in 1984<sup>4</sup> and lasted for more than ten years. The objective of the Declaration is to universally recognize the rights belonging to each human being, especially to those who defend these rights, emphasizing the importance of their activity. In addition, the Declaration recognizes the right to display personal thoughts through participating to peaceful activities, individually or with NGOs, associations and movements, being these expressions of fundamental freedoms. In the Declaration, articles 1, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12 and 13 focus on the human right defender, laying out specific rights and protections, among which the right to meet and assemble peacefully, to protection, to receive information relating to human rights, to develop and discuss new human rights ideas and principles, and to lawful exercise the occupation or profession of human right defender. Articles 2, 9, 12, 14 and 15 are instead defined as the obligations that States must fulfil in order to support, protect and implement human rights. Among these obligations there are: to ensure that all persons are able to enjoy all social, economic, political rights; to access the protection tools in case of human rights violation; to promote the teaching of human rights; to guarantee the support to the development of independent national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights. Regarding the responsibility of everyone, articles 10 and 18 outline responsibilities for everyone to promote human rights and to protect democracy and its institutions, while article 11 addresses who "as a result of his or her profession, can affect the human dignity, human rights and fundamental freedoms of others", encouraging them to observe "those rights and freedoms" and to respect "relevant national and international standards of occupational and professional conduct or ethics<sup>\*5</sup>. This Declaration, even if it's not legally binding, has been widely recognized and it showed some level of efficacy, since States committed to implement these instructions.

https://www.ohchr.org/en/issues/srhrdefenders/pages/defender.aspx

<sup>1</sup> United Nations (1999) UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders

<sup>2</sup> For a more complete description of Human Rights Defenders, please refer to the following link:

<sup>3</sup> United Nations (1999), Resolution A/RES/53/144, 8 March 1999, Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

<sup>4</sup> Nazioni Unite (2004), Human Rights Defenders: Protecting the Right to Defend Human Rights. Fact Sheet No. 29, p. 19

<sup>5</sup> UN Declaration on Human Right Defenders (1999), article 11: "Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to the lawful exercise of his or her occupation or profession. Everyone who, as a result of his or her profession, can affect the human dignity, human rights and fundamental freedoms of others should respect those rights and freedoms and comply with relevant national and international standards of occupational and professional conduct or ethics."

#### 1.2 Women Human Rights Defenders

In the report of the 68<sup>th</sup> session of the UN General Assembly 3<sup>rd</sup> Commission<sup>6</sup>, dated 2013, with the title "*Promotion of the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms*" <sup>7</sup>, can be found a resolution focusing on the identification of recommendations, responsibilities, rights and duties regarding the protection of women human rights defenders<sup>8</sup>. This document offers a specific definition of woman human rights defender: any woman, of any age, committed to the defence of human rights and fundamental freedoms, individually and in association with others, on a local, regional, national and international level<sup>9</sup>. The resolution refers to what is written in the Declaration on Human Right Defenders, regarding both States' duties<sup>10</sup>, and rights and responsibilities of individuals and organizations<sup>11</sup>. However, there is greater attention to the delicate situation of women, who are victims of systematic and structural discriminations all over the world<sup>12</sup>.

#### 1.3 Special Rapporteur on the situation of Human Rights Defenders

The figure of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of Human Rights Defenders was established in 2000 through the Resolution 2000/61 of the UN Human Rights Commission<sup>13</sup> - whose role was later substituted in 2006 by the current Human Rights Council - with the primal objective of promoting and supporting the implementation of the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders. The Rapporteur exerts its role independently from any State or any other actor, respecting the Code of Conduct of UN Special Rapporteurs<sup>14</sup>.

Special Rapporteur's duties and activities are the following:

- Being reachable from the defenders, collecting information and direct testimonies, using the given information to identify problems and threats;
- Participating to events, conferences and meetings at local, regional and international level, with the aim of developing a new network;
- Maintaining constant relations with States and institutions;
- Maintaining relations with other important actors;

<sup>6</sup> The 3rd Commission deals with issues relating to social, humanitarian and human rights issues of all people in the world. It focuses on examining conflicts around human rights, including reports on special procedures by the Human Rights Council, independent experts and working group chairs, as requested by the Human Rights Council. It also discusses issues related to the advancement of women, the protection of children, indigenous issues, the treatment of refugees, the promotion of fundamental freedoms through the elimination of racism and racial discrimination, the right to self-determination, issues important to social development and issues relating to youth, family, aging, people with disabilities, crime prevention, criminal justice and international drug control.

<sup>7</sup> United Nations (2013), Report of the Sixty-eighth session of the Third Committee A/68/456/Add.2, 10 December 2013. 8 United Nations, (2013) Resolution A/RES/68/181, Promotion of the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms: protecting women human rights defenders

<sup>9</sup> Ibid, full definition: "that women of all ages who engage in the promotion and protection of all human rights and fundamental freedoms and all people who engage in the defence of the rights of women and gender equality, individually and in association with others, play an important role, at the local, national, regional and international levels, in the promotion and protection of human rights, in accordance with the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms", p. 2

<sup>10</sup> United Nations, (2013) resolution A/RES/68/181, points 1, 7, 8, 9, 10, 14, 16, 17, 19, 21, 22

<sup>11</sup> Ibid, points 15,18, 23, 24 e 25

<sup>12</sup> Ibid, point 5

<sup>13</sup> United Nations (2000), Resolution E/CN.4/RES/2000/61 Human rights defenders - Commission on Human Rights, 27 April 2020 14 The purpose of the Code of Conduct is to improve the effectiveness of the special procedures system by defining the standards of ethical behaviour and professional conduct that the mandate holders of the Human Rights Council must observe while carrying out their work. (https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/SP/CodeOfConduct.pdf)

- Collecting testimonies of human rights violation, verifying the reliability and, in case of violation, contacting the relevant authorities and government in order to achieve shared and efficient solutions;
- Visiting Member States and meeting the head of State and other government's members.
- Identify strategies for the defence and promotion of human rights
- Provide the annual Special Rapporteur Report to the Human Rights Council and at the General Assembly.<sup>15</sup>

Since the 1<sup>st</sup> of May 2020, the new Special Rapporteur is Mary Lawlor, founder and director of the Front-Line Defenders organization and director of the Irish section of Amnesty International. Her predecessor was Michel Forst, French, in charge from 2014 with the Resolution "Freedom of opinion and expression: mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression"<sup>16</sup>, and reconfirmed for three more years in 2017, until the conclusion of his mandate on the 30<sup>th</sup> April 2020. In the report "Situation of Women Human Rights Defenders", Michel Forst provides an overview on the situation of the women who defend human rights in the period between 2011 and 2019, that is the year of the publication of the document. The report focuses particularly on risks and obstacles that the human rights women defenders have to face as women and on the recognition of their important role in the promotion and protection of human rights. The special supervisor analyses, among the different elements characterizing the life of these women, the impact that patriarchy, straight-normativity, fundamentalisms, militarization, neoliberal policies, gender ideology and globalisation have on them. The report includes recommendations and examples of good practices for the support and defence of the women committed in the defence of human rights in the world.

#### 1.4 EU guidelines

Since 1998, the European Union (EU) has worked developing eleven specific guidelines<sup>17</sup>, which have been adopted as the general framework for human rights defence and promotion in developing countries, allowing to undertake common actions and quick interventions in case of violation. In 2004, the human right defenders' guidelines were published, with an update in 2008, and these belong to the context of the Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP)<sup>18</sup>.

The aim of this document is to suggest and drive international missions, Member States' embassies and consulates towards practices and operational tools for the improvement of EU actions. Main tasks and responsibilities are the following: monitoring and compiling reports for the Working Party on Human Rights (COHOM)<sup>19</sup>, including eventual recommendations for EU action,

<sup>15</sup> United Nations (2000), Resolution E/CN.4/RES/2000/61 Human rights defenders - Commission on Human Rights, points 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 16 United Nations (2014), Resolution A/HRC/25/L.2/Rev.1 "Freedom of opinion and expression: mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression"

<sup>17</sup> EU guidelines: death penalty (1998), human rights dialogues with third countries (2001), torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (2001), children and armed conflict (2003), rights defenders humanitarian law (2004), promotion of international humanitarian law (2005), promotion and protection of the rights of the child (2007), violence against women and the fight against all forms of discrimination against them (2008), promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief (2013), promotion and protection of the rights of lesbians, gays, bisexuals and transsexuals (2013), freedom of expression offline and online (2014)

<sup>18</sup> The EU's common foreign and security policy, aimed at resolving conflicts and promoting understanding at the international level, is based on diplomacy and respect for international standards. Trade, humanitarian aid and international cooperation are also important elements for the EU's international role.

<sup>19</sup> The Working Party on Human Rights deals with human rights aspects in the EU's external relations and supports the decision-making process of the Council in this area. Its main task is to help identify EU strategic priorities on specific thematic and geographical issues. It also coordinates the positions of EU Member States on thematic and geographic issues in multilateral human rights offices such as the United Nations General Assembly (Third Committee) and the United Nations Human Rights Council.

through strategic plans that help to operationalize these guidelines; organizing at least one annual meeting with defenders and diplomatic corps for discussing human rights situation; maintaining relations with defenders and offering help and specific support; when possible, visiting defenders sent to prison or under house arrest, as observer of the ongoing or ended trial<sup>20</sup>. The work of the EU and its delegations abroad is directly coordinated with the action of the UN Human Rights Council and the Special Rapporteur. Specifically, their support is requested for the promotion of the tools created by the UN concerning defenders and local communities, including: the facilitation of relations between the parties; the collection and spread of useful information; the management of any funds allocated by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights<sup>21</sup>. Supportive operational practices for the defenders are also included and outlined in the EU Development Policy<sup>22</sup>, and these do not only concern aid and monitoring of democratic processes and human rights promotion in developing countries, but also the active support to defenders and NGOs working with them, as well as encouraging the establishment of national institutions dedicated to the topic, and finally guarantee assistance, in case of emergency, for visa procedures and temporary exit from the country<sup>23</sup>. The materials collected by the offices abroad allow the COHOM to evaluate the impact and realization of the guidelines supporting human rights defenders, and to take actions where is needed. So essentially, its work includes the promotion and integration of the defenders issue within EU policies and actions, the periodic analysis of guidelines actualization, researching new regional and international cooperation methods, and reporting to the European Council regarding the progress made on guidelines<sup>24</sup>.

#### 1.5 EU mechanisms

Protect Defenders is one of the mechanisms of the EU for the protection of human rights defenders, which was developed to offer a stable support for individuals and local actors fighting for human rights promotion and defence around the world<sup>25</sup>. This platform, created in 2015 as an EU initiative, is managed by a consortium of 12 NGOs<sup>26</sup>, who have always been working on human rights and protection of human rights defenders, and they decided to unite to better increase the chance of getting funding, especially from the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR)<sup>27</sup> - who provides around 95% of funding – and to create synergy and cooperation between the different organizations.

<sup>20</sup> European Union (2004), Ensuring protection – European Union Guidelines on Human Rights Defenders, p. 5-8 21 lbid, p. 9

<sup>22</sup> Development policy is at the heart of the European Union's external policies. Its objectives include the eradication of poverty, the promotion of sustainable growth, the defence of human rights and democracy, the promotion of gender equality and the management of environmental and climate challenges. The European Union acts on a global scale and is the world's largest donor of development aid. Cooperation with EU Member States and alignment with the goals set out in the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development are crucial for efficient aid delivery. (https://ec.europa.eu/international-partnerships/european-development-policy\_en)

<sup>23</sup> European Union (2004), Ensuring protection – European Union Guidelines on Human Rights Defenders, p. 10 24 Ibid, p.11

<sup>25</sup> Protect Defenders https://www.protectdefenders.eu/en/index.html

<sup>26</sup> The members of the consortium are: Front Line Defenders, Reporters without borders, World Organisation Against Torture, Worldwide Movement Human Rights, Urgent Action Fund, Forum-Asia, Peace Brigades International (PBI), Protection international, Ilga, ESCR-Net, Euro-Mediterranean Foundation of Support to HRD (EMHRF), East and Horn of Africa HRD Project. 27 The European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights provides assistance in the development and consolidation of

<sup>27</sup> The European instrument for Democracy and Human Rights provides assistance in the development and consolidation of democracy, the rule of law and respect for all human rights and fundamental freedoms. The general objectives of the EIDHR instrument are: to support, develop and consolidate democracy in third countries and to increase respect for and observance of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

The main activities of Protect Defenders are:

- Support and implementation of temporary relocation programmes through emergency grants;
- Support to human rights defenders' organizations;
- Offer of trainings, courses and any useful education to defenders;
- Monitoring and advocacy;
- Coordination between organizations and local, national and international institutions;
- Management of Hotline, 24/7 emergency line for the support of defenders in danger;
- Management of the European Union Human Rights Defenders RE location Platform (EUTRP);

Another instrument promoted by the EU is the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR), a programme developed for the promotion of democracy and human rights in non-EU countries through, for instance, the support of civil society's projects. The EIDHR was adopted in March 2014<sup>28</sup> by the European Parliament and Council for the period 2014-2020, in the meanwhile substituting the EIDHR 2007-2013 and 2000-2006 with a 1,332.75 million euros budget, with a 21% increase compared to the previous budget<sup>29</sup>. The EIDHR offers independence of action, as it works directly with human rights defenders and civil society organizations without requiring any authorization from the territorially competent national authorities. This instrument can intervene anywhere outside the EU, both locally, regionally and internationally. Through a global call, every year the EIDHR allocated funds that are accessible, with a specific application, for entities with legal and non-legal personality, profit or non-profit, civil society organizations, NGOs, independent political foundations, local based organizations, indigenous populations organizations, disability organizations and non-profit agencies from the private sector, institutions and organizations and their networks at local, national, regional and international levels, national human rights institutions and universities. The specific priorities of European calls in the period 2018-2020 were directed to the support of human rights defenders for LGBTQI people (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and Intersexed) and of organizations promoting their rights. In particular, the call supports organizations operating in the areas where LGBTQI people are most at risk for discrimination, besides implementing action of support against death penalty, supporting activism and civil participation, through the development of digital technologies.

#### 1.6 OSCE guidelines

In 2014, the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) adopted the "Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders"<sup>30</sup> for the support and protection of human rights defenders that are threaten due to their commitment to the defence of human rights. This document does not establish new standards, but it directly refers to the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders and its contents. The main objective is to orientate policies and good

<sup>28</sup> Regulation (EU) No. 235/2014 of the European Parliament and Council, on the 11th March 2014, establishing a financial instrument for the promotion of democracy and human rights in the world (https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/IT/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32014R0235&from=it)

<sup>29</sup> Source: European Instrument for Democracy & Human Rights website (https://ec.europa.eu/international-partnerships/funding) 30 Osce (2014), Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders

practices for the support of human rights defenders within OSCE Member States, these being also considered the main responsible for their protection and therefore being obliged to:

- refrain from any act that violates the rights of human rights defenders because of their activity in favour of them;
- protect human rights defenders, by exercising due diligence, from abuses by third parties as a result of their activity;
- take proactive steps to promote full recognition of the rights of human rights defenders, including that of defending human rights<sup>31</sup>;

In order to support States in fulfilling their obligations, the guidelines contain various recommendations, including the review procedure of laws and practices concerning human rights, greater consultation with civil society, the establishment of inter-institutional coordination bodies, the reporting by the States of episodes of threats, assaults, arbitrary arrests and other serious violations of human rights against human rights defenders to the territorially competent State, using the most appropriate means<sup>32</sup>.

#### 1.7 Council of Europe declaration

In 2008, the Council of Europe (CoE)<sup>33</sup> reiterated its position on the attacks and violence committed against human rights defenders, with a declaration signed by the Committee of Ministers (its decision-making body) titled "Declaration on Council of Europe action to improve the protection of human rights defenders and promote their activities"<sup>34</sup>. The document contains some recommendations to States, which are mentioned as the most responsible for the protection of defenders, and which are required to:

- create a favourable environment for the work of human rights defenders, allowing individuals, groups and associations to freely perform their activities, in such a way that is coherent with international standards, and to promote and fight for the defence of human rights and fundamental freedoms, without any restrictions besides what is authorized by the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)<sup>35</sup>;
- adopt effective measures to protect, foster and respect human rights defenders, and to guarantee the execution of their activities;
- reinforce justice systems and ensure that effective remedies exist for those whose rights and freedoms are violated;
- adopt effective measures to prevent attacks or harassment against defenders, ensuring that investigations are independent and effective, and administrative or penal procedures can be taken against the guilty parties;
- provide or, where appropriated, reinforce the competence and capacities of independent commissions, civil defenders or national institutions for human rights, and to receive,

<sup>31</sup> Ibid, point 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Osce (2014), Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders, points 99, 187, 274

<sup>33</sup> The Council of Europe was founded in 1949 with the aim of promoting democracy, human rights, European cultural identity and research. (https://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/home)

<sup>34</sup> Council of Europe (2008), Declaration on Council of Europe action to improve the protection of human rights defenders and promote their activities"

<sup>35</sup> The European Convention on Human Rights was drafted and adopted in 1950 by the Council of Europe in the form of an international treaty aimed at protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms in Europe. All 47 countries that make up the Council of Europe are party to the convention, 28 of which are members of the European Union. (https://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/Convention\_ITA.pdf)

examine and formulate recommendations for the resolution of the petitions made by human rights defenders about violations of their rights;

- ensure effective access of human rights defenders to the European Court of Human Rights, to the European Committee of Social Rights and other applicable mechanisms for the protection of human rights;
- cooperate with the human rights mechanisms of the Council of Europe, in particular with the European Court of Human Rights (upon CEDU conformity), as well as with the Commissioner of Human Rights, facilitating his/her visits, providing information and discussing about the situation of human rights defenders;
- provide measures for a prompt assistance and protection of human rights defenders in danger in third countries, as the participation and observation of trials and/or the issue of emergency visa;

In the final section of the document, the Commissioner of Human Rights<sup>36</sup> is directly called to reinforce his/her role of protection of human rights defenders, and to organize yearly meetings with diverse groups of defenders from CoE Member States. The results of these roundtables are the summary reports<sup>37</sup> on the situation experienced by the defenders on the previous year.

Ten year from the Declaration, the Committee of Ministers wanted to renew its commitment through the "Statement on the 10th anniversary of the Declaration of the Committee of Ministers on Council of Europe action to improve the protection of human rights defenders and promote their activities"<sup>38</sup>, in which, besides the description of some of the progresses made by States, it is expressed the concern regarding some European countries' tendence to decrease the level of attention and protection of human rights defenders.

#### 1.8 The efforts of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights and the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

The African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPA)<sup>39</sup> is the apparatus of safeguard and semi-judicial body established by the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights<sup>40</sup> - adopted in 1981 in the eighteenth Assembly of heads of States and Governments<sup>41</sup> - this one having three main functions for: fostering human and people's rights, protecting human and people's rights and interpreting the Charter<sup>42</sup>. The African Union, through the ACHPA, has developed different initiatives over the years, and has implemented new instruments for the defence and promotion of human rights defenders and their work, among which:

\_african\_charter\_on\_human\_and\_peoples\_rights\_e.pdf

<sup>36</sup> The Commissioner of Human Rights is an independent and impartial institution of the Council of Europe, whose mandate is to promote respect for human rights in the 47 member states of the Organization. Since 1 April 2018, the commissioner is Dunja Mijatović who succeeds Nils Muižnieks.

<sup>37</sup> To consult the summary reports, refer to the link https://www.coe.int/en/web/commissioner/human-rights-defenders 38 Council of Europe (2018), "Statement on the 10th anniversary of the Declaration of the Committee of Ministers on Council of Europe action to improve the protection of human rights defenders and promote their activities",

https://www.coe.int/en/web/commissioner/-/statement-on-the-10th-anniversary-of-the-declaration-of-the-committee-of-ministers-on-council-of-europe-action-to-improve-the-protection-of-human-righ

<sup>39</sup> The African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, https://www.achpr.org/home

<sup>40</sup> Adopted in Nairobi on 28 June 1981 by the Conference of Heads of State and Government of the Organization of African Unity (later the African Union). Entry into force: 21 October 1986. States Parties as of 1 June 2018: 54. African Charter on Human and People's Rights (1981), https://au.int/sites/default/files/treaties/36390-treaty-0011\_-

<sup>41</sup> The Assembly is the supreme body of the African Union (AU) and includes the Heads of State and Government of all member states. It decides the policies of the AU, establishes its priorities, adopts the annual program and monitors the implementation of policies and decisions taken.

<sup>42</sup> African Charter on Human and People's Rights (1981), article 45

- in 2004, on occasion of the 35<sup>th</sup> extraordinary session of ACHPA held in Gambia, with Resolution n.69, the role of the Special Rapporteur on human rights defenders<sup>43</sup> was established;
- in 2018, the Special Rapporteur, in collaboration with the Human Rights Centre of Pretoria University, published the "Compendium on the legal protection of human rights defenders in Africa"<sup>44</sup>. This paper, of more than 150 pages, collects the most relevant documents regarding the protection of human rights defenders in Africa, which are adopted under the guidance of United Nations, Council of Europe, European Union, OSCE and African Union;
- in 2017, during the second international Symposium on human rights defenders in Africa, the "Cotonou Declaration on strengthening and expanding the protection of all Human Rights Defenders in Africa"<sup>45</sup> was adopted, with the aim of underlying the challenges and trends related to defenders in Africa.
- The ACHPA has adopted various resolutions regarding human rights defenders over the years, among which: Resolution 69 (2004) on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders in Africa<sup>46</sup>, Resolution 119 (2007) on the Situation of Human Rights Defenders in Africa<sup>47</sup>, Resolution 196 (2011) on Human Rights Defenders in Africa<sup>48</sup>, Resolution 273 (2014) Extending the Scope of the Mandate of the Special Rapporteur on Human Rights Defenders in Africa<sup>49</sup> and Resolution 432 (2019) on the Drafting of an African Declaration on the Promotion of the Role of Human Rights Defenders and their Protection in Africa<sup>50</sup>;
- In 2015, the ACHPA published the "The Report of the study on the situation of Women Human Rights Defenders in Africa"<sup>51</sup>

The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR)<sup>52</sup> is one of the two bodies<sup>53</sup> created by the Organization of American States (OAS)<sup>54</sup>, for human rights promotion and protection.

51 The Report of the study on the situation of Women Human Rights Defenders in Africa

53 The second is the Inter-American Court of Human Rights

<sup>43</sup> The current Special Rapporteur is Rémy Ngoy Lumbu, in office since 2017. Previously the position was held by Reine Alapini-Gansou (2005-2017), Lucy Asuagbor (2010-2011), Mohamed Bechir Khalfallah (2009-2010), Jainaba Johm (2003-2005). The Rapporter has the mandate to seek, receive and review information on the situation of human rights defenders in Africa, present reports at each regular session of the African Commission, cooperate and engage in dialogue with Member States, national human rights institutions, relevant intergovernmental bodies, international and regional mechanisms for the protection of human rights defenders and other stakeholders, develop and recommend effective strategies to better protect human rights defenders and follow up on its recommendations, and raise awareness and promote the implementation of the Declaration on Human Rights Defenders in Africa;

<sup>44</sup> Compendium on the legal protection of human rights defenders in Africa,

https://www.achpr.org/public/Document/file/English/english\_chrd.pdf

<sup>45</sup> Cotonou Declaration on strengthening and expanding the protection of all Human Rights Defenders in Africa,

https://www.achpr.org/news/viewdetail?id=31

<sup>46</sup> Resolution on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders In Africa, ACHPR/Res.69(XXXV)2004

https://www.achpr.org/sessions/resolutions?id=74

<sup>47</sup> Resolution on the situation of human rights defenders in Africa - ACHPR /Res.119 (XXXXII)07,

https://www.achpr.org/sessions/resolutions?id=171

<sup>48 196</sup> Resolution on Human Rights Defenders in Africa - ACHPR/Res.196(L)2011, https://www.achpr.org/sessions/resolutions?id=192 49 Resolution on Extending the Scope of the Mandate of the Special Rapporteur on Human Rights Defenders in Africa -

ACHPR/Res.273(LV)2014, https://www.achpr.org/sessions/resolutions?id=320

<sup>50 432</sup> Resolution on the Drafting of an African Declaration on the Promotion of the Role of Human Rights Defenders and their Protection in Africa - ACHPR/Res.432(LXV)2019, https://www.achpr.org/sessions/resolutions?id=463

 $https://www.achpr.org/public/Document/file/English/report_of_the\_study\_on\_the\_situation\_of\_women\_human\_rights\_defenders\_in\_africa.pdf$ 

<sup>52</sup> Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, https://www.oas.org/en/iachr/

<sup>54</sup> The Organization of American States is an international organization with regional character that includes the 35 independent states of the Americas, founded in 1948. The organization is the main political forum for multilateral dialogue and for the solution of political problems. The purpose of the organization is to maintain peace, foster democracy and human rights, and improve the social and economic conditions of the countries of America, website: http://www.oas.org/en/

The Commission, established in 1959, with headquarters in Washington, is defined with the Declaration of the Rights of Man adopted in 1948 in Bogota, Colombia. The Commission is called to apply the dispositions of OSA's statute and the 1969 American Convention on Human Rights<sup>55</sup>. The OAS has put efforts on the promotion and protection of human rights defenders over the years, through different actions:

- In June 1999, the OAS adopted Resolution 1671 (1999) on the situation of human rights defenders in the Americas<sup>56</sup>, which required the Permanent Council, through collaborating with the Inter-American Commission, on monitoring and studying the issue of human rights defenders in the region;
- In 2001 it was established the Unity for human rights defenders, committed to monitoring the situation of defenders in the region;
- In 2011 the IACHR substituted the Unity for human rights defenders with the Office of the rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders<sup>57</sup>.

#### 1.9 The Resolution of the Italian Commission of External and EU Affairs

On 31<sup>st</sup> January 2017, a first step in the development of an Italian model for the temporary reception was achieved. This day, the Commission of External and EU Affairs of the Italian Chamber of Deputies adopted Resolution 7-01051 Tidei "On the protection of human rights defenders".<sup>58</sup>This document, which includes most of the requests elaborated by *In Difesa di* network, requires the Government to support activities for the promotion and protection of human rights defenders and their initiatives, through:

- implementing guidelines of the European Union on the protection of human rights defenders, in line with what has already been done by other Member States;
- developing a coordination for the protection of human rights defenders, which through the involvement of all the competent ministries and on the basis of the necessary financial resources - should assess the best methods of reception and protection, including the possible definition of specific methods of entry and stay for temporary relocation;
- supporting the initiatives, in favour of the protection of human rights defenders, discussed in the competent working group of the Council of the European Union, also in the implementation of the EU Action Plan on human rights and democracy 2015-2019;
- supporting initiatives aimed at promoting coordination with NGOs and religious bodies willing to create a protection network in the countries of origin of the activists;
- supporting any initiative favouring the coordination of Ministry of External Affairs and International Cooperation initiatives with similar ones adopted by other Eu Member States<sup>59</sup>.

<sup>55</sup> The American Convention on Human Rights, also known as the San José Pact, is an international treaty on human rights. It was adopted by the nations of the meeting of the Americas in San José, Costa Rica in 1969 and has been ratified so far by 25 states, with the exception of the United States and Canada, https://www.cidh.oas.org/basicos/english /basic3.american%20convention.htm

<sup>56</sup> Human Rights Defenders in the Americas, supports for the individuals, groups, organizations of civil society working to promote and protect Human Rights in the Americas AG/RES. 1671 (XXIX-O/99), http://www.oas.org/juridico/english/ga-res99/eres1671.htm

<sup>57</sup> The current Rapporteur is Joel Hernández García, in office for the period 2018 - 2021, his predecessor was Francisco Jose Eguiguren Praeli 58 Commissione Affari esteri (2017), Risoluzione 7-01051, "Sulla tutela dei difensori dei diritti umani"

## 1.10 The Italian National Action Plan for the implementation of Resolution 1325 of the United Nations Security Council

On 31<sup>st</sup> October 2000, the UN Security Council unanimously adopted Resolution 1325 on "Women, Peace and Security"<sup>60</sup>, which demands greater attention to the situation experienced by women in contexts of armed conflicts, urging all parties involved in an armed conflict to adopt special measures for the protection of women and young girls from gender violence, in particular from rape and other forms of sexual abuse. In addition, the resolution reiterates the importance of women's role in the prevention and resolution of conflicts and peace negotiations, in the "peace-building" and "peace-keeping", in the humanitarian response and post-conflict reconstruction. It also underlines how is necessary an equal participation and a full engagement of women in all the actions for the maintenance and promotion of peace and security<sup>61</sup>. The document provides for a number of important operational mandates, with implications for Member States and UN bodies, and reports a series of issues related to the war context that need to be addressed through specific programmes and activities, as the HIV/AIDS training or measures to ensure to women a proper access to the electoral system<sup>62</sup>.

From the vote on Resolution 1325 until today, there have been other resolutions that have been discussed and voted on within the Women, Peace and Security Agenda; among which:

- Resolution 1820 (2008), on the recognition of sexual violence as a weapon of war;
- Resolution 1880 (2009), on the duty of "peace-keeping" missions to work for the protection of women and young girls from sexual violence;
- Resolution 1889 (2009), on the participation and leading role of women in all phases of the peace process;
- Resolution 1960 (2010), on strengthening the monitoring of sexual violence;
- Resolution 2106 (2013), on sexual violence in armed conflicts;
- Resolution 2122 (2013), on strengthening the role of women in all phases of conflict prevention and resolution;
- Resolution 2242 (2015), on increasing efforts in implementing the points set out in the Women, Peace and Security agenda;
- Resolution 2467 (2019), on the adoption of concrete measures to end sexual violence in conflicts.

In the Resolution 2493 (2019)<sup>63</sup>, unanimously voted on the 29<sup>th</sup> October 2019, about the reconfirmation of the Security Council's commitment to its Women, Peace and Security agenda, there is a reference, in point 6, to women "protecting and promoting human rights", quoted together with formal and informal community leaders, peace-builders and women involved in politics. In the first draft of the text, the term proposed was that of defender of human rights, which has caused a debate and some of the participants, among which China and Russian Federation, have been strongly opposing this denomination and ready to abstain from voting if the draft has not been modified. According to the Russian delegation, they felt "obliged to point out that the resolution contains a number of provisions that go beyond the Security Council's mandate.

62 Ibid, p.3

<sup>60</sup> UN (2000) Resolution of the Security Council S/RES/1325 (2000), Women, Peace and Security

<sup>61</sup> UN (2000), Landmark resolution on Women, Peace and Security

<sup>63</sup> UN (2019), Resolution of the Security Council S/RES/2493, http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/doc/2493

It is overloaded with issues relating to the protection and promotion of human rights, which the General Assembly and the Human Rights Council already deal with successfully and effectively. We urge the Security Council to adhere strictly to its mandate, and we do not support attempts to justify its interference in matters that are part of the remit of other organs"<sup>64</sup>. Countries as UK and France<sup>65</sup>, on the contrary, declared themselves in favour of the term, as demonstrated by the speech of Karen Pierce. UK permanent representative in the UN, who has defined human rights defenders as "the ones on the front line and they need greater recognition and support"<sup>66</sup>, adding that the language of the resolution should take on more ambitious tones and should describe more clearly the importance of women's role within civil society. Even the UN Secretary General Antonio Guterres has often used the term "human rights defenders" during its introductory speech. Following Resolution 1325 (2000), with the aim of supporting its objective, the Security Council announced in its "Presidential Statement" of 2004<sup>67</sup>, the adoption of National Action Plans (NAPs). The NAPs allow each country to establish priorities and coordinate the different bodies related to security, foreign affairs, development and gender issue, for the better implementation of the resolution. On January 2020, 83 countries adopted this tool<sup>68</sup>, of which 36<sup>69</sup> are from OSCE area, including Italy with its National Action Plan since 2010, followed in 2014 by the NAP on "Women, Peace and Security", and on December 2016 by the third "National Action Plan of Italy in implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000)", which was valid until 2019 and later extended to 2020. The third NAP - which was developed by a national, inter-ministerial and participatory working group<sup>70</sup>, with the involvement of various organizations from civil society, the academic world, NGOs and other institutions - describes seven objectives that must be pursued, on a national and international level:

- 1. Strengthen the role of women in peace processes and in all decision-making processes;
- 2. Keep on promoting the gender perspective in peace operations;
- Keep on ensuring specific training on the various transversal aspects of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000), in particular for personnel participating in peace operations;
- To further enhance the presence of women in the National Armed Forces and Police Forces, strengthening their role in decision-making processes relating to peacekeeping missions;
- 5. Protect the human rights of women and young girls in conflict and post-conflict areas;
- 6. Increase cooperation with civil society, for the implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000);

<sup>64</sup> Quote from the official report of the Security Council (https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/monthly-forecast/2019-12/in-hindsight-negotiations-on-resolution-2493-on-women-peace-and-security.php)

<sup>65</sup> Other countries in favor or that used the term human rights defenders during the discussion of the Resolution are: Jordan, Belgium, Germany, Sweden, Switzerland, Holland, Canada and Austria.

<sup>66</sup> Quote from the press review of the United Nations (https://www.un.org/press/en/2019/sc13998.doc.htm)

<sup>67</sup> UN (2004), Statement by President of Security Council, S/PRST/2004/40, (https://undocs.org/S/PRST/2004/40)

<sup>68</sup> The data refer to January 2020 and are provided by https://www.peacewomen.org/member-states

<sup>69</sup> OSCE (2020), Implementing the Women, Peace and Security Agenda in the OSCE Region, pg. 8

<sup>70</sup> The Inter-ministerial Working Group was created on the initiative of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs-Human Rights Office, and is composed of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Inter-ministerial Committee of Human Rights, Directorate General for Development Cooperation and Office II), the Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Defense, Ministry of Health, General Command of the Carabinieri, Department of Civil Protection, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Labor and Social Policies-Office of the National Equality Councilor.

 Strategic communication and result-oriented advocacy, engaging in strategic communication and strengthening Italian participation in forums, conferences and sector tools, to further support the implementation of the "Women, Peace and Security" Agenda.<sup>71</sup>

Objective n.6 entails the strengthening of the engagement and dialogue with organizations from civil society related with Resolution 1325 (2000), and with women associations, on a national and international level, facilitating the cooperation and promoting local associations, women associations and women human rights defenders. In particular, the second part of this objective states the commitment of Italy to support any activities of that organizations and associations working on "a local dimension, to guarantee opportunities to women, including women human rights defenders, in order to express their point of view and their capacities related to: economy, environmental protection, sector formation, decision-making process, and generally within national bodies and institutions"<sup>72</sup>.

The Working Group has started working on the elaboration of the fourth NAP a few months ago.

#### 1.11 The Italian network "In difesa di.." (In defence of..)

"In difesa di – per i diritti umani e chi li difende" (IDD) is a network of more than 30 Italian organizations and associations<sup>73</sup> working on human rights, environment, international solidarity, peace and disarmament, workers' rights, freedom of press and rule of law. This network was created in 2016 during the international conference "Let's defend them! Stories of human rights defenders around the world and protection strategies", which took place in the Italian Parliament with the participation of defenders from Itraq, Siria, Egipt, Afghanistan, Mauritania and India, of many Italian associations and organizations committed to their protection and support, and of a few members of the Ministry of External Affairs and Cooperation. This group was established with the main objective of promoting campaigns and initiatives aimed at the protection of those who defend human rights, raising awareness within the public opinion and asking to Italian institutions, on a local and national level, to develop mechanisms and activities for the protection of human rights defenders, among which the temporary relocation. Specifically, the network works for:

- Raising awareness and advocacy aimed at strengthening the commitment of Italian diplomatic personnel in third countries, in collaboration with the embassies of other European countries and the OSCE area;
- Collaboration with Italian NGOs for the development of support channels for their protection and support activities for human rights defenders;
- monitoring of the works for the new National Action Plan on Business and Human Rights<sup>74</sup>;

<sup>71</sup> MAECI (2016) Terzo Piano d'Azione Nazionale dell'Italia, in attuazione della Risoluzione del Consiglio di Sicurezza delle Nazioni Unite 1325(2000), parte operativa, cornice attuativa

<sup>72</sup> MAECI (2016) Terzo Piano d'Azione Nazionale dell'Italia, in attuazione della Risoluzione del Consiglio di Sicurezza delle Nazioni Unite 1325(2000), obiettivo 6

<sup>73</sup> The members of *In difesa* network are: AIDOS, Amnesty International Italia, AOI, ARCI, ARCS, Associazione Antigone, Associazione Articolo 21, A Sud, Centro di Ateneo per i Diritti Umani – Università di Padova, Centro Documentazione Conflitti Ambientali (CDCA), CISDA, Coalizione Italiana Libertà e Diritti Civili, Comune-info, CGIL, Comitato Verità e Giustizia per i Nuovi Desaparecidos, COSPE, Fondazione Lelio e Lisli Basso-Issoco, Giuristi Democratici, Greenpeace Italia, Legambiente, Libera-Associazione Nomi e Numeri contro le mafie, Non c'è Pace senza Giustizia, Operazione Colomba – Comunità Papa Giovanni XXIII, Radicali Italiani, Rete per la Pace, Survival International, Terra Nuova, Progetto Endangered Lawyers/Avvocati Minacciati, Unione Camere Penali Italiane, Un ponte per..., Yaku. Peace Brigades International Italia e Centro Studi Difesa Civile seguono i lavori in qualità di osservatori.

<sup>74</sup> The network In defense of has enclosed in a note written on the occasion of the Workshop organized by the CIDU on "The new five-year National Action Plan on Human Rights and Business: its implementation also in the perspective of the" 2030 Goals "held in Rome on 13 March

- Developing and sharing documents and information useful for the protection of human rights defenders with Italian organizations, committees and movements;
- Supporting, as an information platform, for the major and peaceful campaigns in Italy, such as the environmental committees in Salento and the NGOs operating in the Mediterranean<sup>75</sup>;
- Raising awareness and collaboration with local Italian authorities for the creation of "città in difesa" (cities in defence) for the temporary reception of threatened human rights defenders.

On 26<sup>th</sup> October 2019, in Rome at the "*Casa delle Donne Lucha Y siesta*", the first national network meeting was held, where the topic of developing "città in difesa" was greatly discussed, during the public session "*Città in Difesa Di*, relocation and territories in support of human rights defenders", and in one of the three workshop where the network's members could participate, with the ai of planning and implementing temporary reception programmes in Italy.

The work of the IDD network will be deepened in the third chapter of this research, together with the history and the path of the Trentino group of the network.

<sup>2017</sup> its proposals to integrate the new text. Link to the complete note: https://www.indifesadi.org//wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Tutela-deidifensori-e-responsabilit%c3%a0-delle-imprese.pdf 75 For press releases, www.indifesadi.org

#### 2. WHAT ARE THE TEMPORARY RELOCATIONS?

In this research, the term "Temporary Relocation" is used to indicate the temporary hospitality provided to human rights defenders that are threatened due to their activity. The temporary relocation programmes analysed in this document are promoted and organized by organizations and associations, together with a few institutional bodies and with the contribution of EU, with the aim of offering to people, who are victims of violations and injustice, a safe place where they can rest, continue to work and create new international contacts with movements, organizations and institutions. There are different temporary relocation models in EU, each one organized based on necessities and resources that the political-cultural context of the country and the organizations can offer, therefore developing unique programmes. However, temporary relocations share some common elements: the temporary nature of hospitality, the presence of medical-psychological support, the complete free stay for the hosted defender and the construction of a public agenda that includes institutional and political meetings with institutions and governments and in-depth information events with citizens. The development of a new network is one of the most crucial aspect of the project, since it can help to discourage new threats and violence upon the defender's return to the country of origin. In fact, a greater visibility can contribute to reduce the margin of impunity for those who commit human rights violations, and targeted attacks on defenders hosted in temporary relocation programs and their organizations and communities. The increase in visibility of their work and activities is meant as an individual and collective protection tool, useful in the moment of the defender's return to the country of origin, where threats and violence take place. Defenders asking for this temporary kind of protection are able to participate because their communication and defence strategies are in line with the activities and goals of the programme, accepting to participate in public meetings and events. This visibility must not be considered as an unconditioned protection tool, applicable to any context or defenders. In some cases, the public exposition can contribute to create a higher risk for the defender. Even within the temporary relocation programmes, there have been some episodes where, due to external and unexpected events (for instance, the sudden change in the political situation in the country of origin or the presence of new threats while staying abroad) defenders had to avoid to show themselves in public.

#### 2.1 THE DUTCH "SHELTER CITY" – JUSTICE & PEACE NETWORK

The "Shelter City" temporary relocation programme is an initiative of the Dutch organization Justice & Peace (J&P)<sup>76</sup> at the request of the defenders and defender with whom it collaborates<sup>77</sup>. The project started in 2012 in the pilot city of The Hague and, due to its success, it has been later proposed in other cities. In 2020, there are 12 Dutch municipalities joining the initiative, plus 5 cities abroad: Middelburg (2014), Nijmegen (2015), Maastricht (2015), Utrecht (2015), Amsterdam (2015), Tilburg (2016), Groningen (2016), Zwolle (2017), Haarlem (2017), Deventer (2018) e Rotterdam (2019) for the Dutch network, while for the one abroad: Tbilisi (2016), Dar Es

<sup>76</sup> Justice & Peace is a non-profit organization founded in 1968 based in The Hague that is committed to the defense and promotion of human rights and social justice in the Netherlands and around the world. It is currently involved in the management of two programs: the "Shelter city" network and the "Samen Hier" initiative for the integration of refugees in the Netherlands. It also provides publications, events, conferences and training on human rights and defenders issues.

<sup>77</sup> The idea of establishing a temporary relocation program was developed on the occasion of a meeting, held in the Netherlands in December 2010, which was attended by the defenders, together with their reference organizations, which are part of the international network of contacts by J&P. On this occasion, it was highlighted the need to establish a temporary protection mechanism capable of supporting defenders, whose security in their own country is compromised and threatened, by allowing them to leave for a few months the dangerous situation in which they live by, hosting them in one of the Shelter Cities.

Salaam (2017) San Josè (2018), Batumi (2019) e Cotonou (2019)<sup>78</sup>. Since the beginning of its activity until May 2020, the Shelter City network hosted 200 defenders from 46 countries. In the Dutch model, the stay would last three months, and it offers the possibility to the guest to rest and keep on working, or to take a break from his/her daily activities and to focus on other aspects, such as education and well-being. According to the Shelter City project national coordinator Suzan Goes, the entire programme is developed to support the person "in rehabilitating and reenergizing", and to prepare him/her to return to his/her country of origin, in fact, "all activities in agenda are meant to optimize the return of the defender, working both on the individual well-being, through psychological and medical support, and the safety aspect, offering courses and trainings on personal defence and cybersecurity, beside expanding the contacts of the international network" explains Suzan during the interview at the International Shelter workshop. During the stay, depending on the necessity of the defenders and resources of the Shelter City, the following activities are also offered: leisure activities, human rights courses, language courses, and meetings with the local community, including schools and universities. Another goal of this project is raising awareness within the Dutch citizens about human rights and defenders, which can be done through sharing personal stories of these beneficiaries of temporary relocation.

#### 2.2 The Dutch context

The report "Updated international human rights policy: activities and results", dated 2019, presents the priorities of Dutch government in terms of human rights, together with a detailed description of activities and results achieved in the last years and future expectations. In particular, the following themes are indicated:

- Freedom of expression;
- Freedom of religion and belief;
- Equal rights for women and girls;
- Human rights defenders;
- Equal rights for LGBTI community;
- International promotion of laws fighting against impunity<sup>79</sup>.

This document defines human rights defenders as an active and necessary part of an open and free society and recognizes as key priority for Dutch politics to support and defend them. Within the results of the Dutch government policies implemented in recent years, it can be seen that in 2017 the funding allocated to the 569 projects mentioned in the report reached a total expenditure of 49.948.828 euros, of which 8.061.579 euros allocated for the implementation of 98 programs dedicated to the support and protection of human rights defenders around the world<sup>80</sup>. Another important element in the Dutch politics is the establishment, in 1999, of the institutional role of Human Rights Ambassador, who is in charge of monitoring and taking care of government's coherence and activities<sup>81</sup>.

<sup>78</sup> For specific information and latest news from the individual Shelter Cities, see the link to the dedicated website: https://sheltercity.nl/ 79 Ministry of Foreign Affairs, The Netherlands (2019), Updated international human rights policy: activities and results, p. 7 80 Ibid. results p. 39

<sup>81</sup> For more information about the Human Rights Ambassador, https://www.government.nl/ministries/ministry-of-foreign-affairs/organisational-structure/special-appointments

#### 2.3 The actors involved<sup>82</sup>

One of the characteristics that highly distinguishes the Shelter City programme from other temporary relocation models, is the wide networks of partners actively contributing to the entire project management. Due to the active engagement of subjects from both institutions and civil society, the Shelter Cities have been capable of increasing the quality of their services and activities.

The official partners of Dutch Shelter Cities are:

- Justice & Peace: it coordinates the national and international network of Shelter Cities and manages the program in the city of The Hague. It also offers, to all defenders hosted in the Netherlands, trainings with a holistic approach to safety. J&P is a non-profit organization based in The Hague, which deals with the defence and protection of human rights and social justice in the Netherlands and around the world. J&P is also the promoter of the "Samen Hier"<sup>83</sup> program, created for the rapid and effective integration of refugees in the Netherlands through the support of citizens.
- The Dutch cities: the municipal council directly take the decision of becoming Shelter City through a motion proposed by one or more members, accepting to commit non only politically but also economically in the implementation of the programme. The financial support can be: the offer of funds, services, goods such as the accommodation, or the access to a general practitioner. The municipality is also in charge of selecting the local organization for the project coordination. The Dutch cities see the Shelter City as an opportunity to increase the awareness of citizens and their own visibility as actors involved in the defence of human rights<sup>84</sup>.
- The coordinating organizations: each Shelter City is managed by an organization that coordinates the full programme and keep contact with the national network. In the Netherlands, these organizations are: Peace Brigades International Netherlands<sup>85</sup> in Utrecht, Mondiaal Maastricht<sup>86</sup> in Maastricht, Tertium<sup>87</sup> in Amsterdam, Bureau Wijland<sup>88</sup> in Nijmegen, ContourdeTwern<sup>89</sup> in Tilburg, Humanitas<sup>90</sup> in Deventer, De Pletterij<sup>91</sup> in Haarlem, VluchtelingenWerk<sup>92</sup> in Winterswijk and Groningen University, the Roosevelt College and the Windesheim College.

<sup>82</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City Program Coordinator For the full interview see: Appendix III

<sup>83</sup> Per maggiori informazioni sul programma Samen Hier, vedi il link: https://justiceandpeace.nl/en/initiatives/samen-hier/ 84 Justice & Peace (2019), How to set up a Shelter City, pg. 4

<sup>85</sup> Peace Brigades International, an organization founded in 1981 for the support and defence of human rights defenders, https://www.peacebrigades.nl/

<sup>86</sup> Mondiaal Maastricht, center for sustainable development, global citizenship and environmental struggle, https://www.mondiaalmaastricht.nl/

<sup>87</sup> Tertium, research centre on urban development, technological innovation and energy, https://www.tertium.nl/

<sup>88</sup> Bureau Wijland, organization for the connection between people, institutions and organizations, https://www.bureauwijland.nl/

<sup>89</sup> ContourdeTwern, organization for equal opportunities and public participation, https://www.contourdetwern.nl/

<sup>90</sup> *Humanitas*, one of the largest community building organizations in the Netherlands, https://www.humanitas.nl/ 91 *De Pletterij*, cultural center, https://www.pletterij.nl/

<sup>92</sup> VluchtelingenWerk, organization that works with and for refugee people, https://www.vluchtelingenwerk.nl/

- The Dutch Ministry of External Affairs and the Ministry of Justice: both are considered partner since they can facilitate the issuing of visas or permits to stay in the country, besides supporting J&P work in case of emergency. Depending on the level of engagement, they can: contribute financially, offer support in the defenders' countries of origin through embassies and consulates, promote the call for applications and advise potential candidates. The Ministry of External Affairs' involvement in the Shelter City programme is expected by the obligations that the Dutch Government promised to respect in line with the European guidelines on human rights defenders.
- Universities, high schools and research centres: the collaboration with educational institutes is considered an opportunity for both parties, since these bodies can offer the defender access to human rights courses, politics and international relations, which are courses that the person is not able to follow in the country of origin (due to lack of institutions or high costs), and they can also benefit from the presence of the defender by organizing conferences, meetings with students and roundtables.

#### 2.4 The selection of defenders<sup>93</sup>

According to this reception model, the selection of defenders is planned with an open call for the collection of applications. This call is published two times per year and shared through the local and international network of organizations collaborating with J&P, and by the Dutch official bodies abroad. The call is published two months before the new round of reception, and since the publication there are three or four weeks for compiling and submitting the application, which is based on an online form. The person concerned can autonomously send the candidature or asking for the support of an organization. The selection committee is an independent body composed by people selected on the basis of their knowledge and skills in the field of human rights and in the context of origin of the candidates. Generally, these people belong to the partner organizations of the project, the universities and the Ministry of External Affairs. J&P, despite being the coordinator of the entire national program, does not take part in the work of the commission but it only offers administrative support. Due to the huge number of requests that come to each call<sup>94</sup>, J&P has the task of preparing a pre-selection of candidates, checking the necessary requirements. In the next phase, there is the verification of the candidates' credentials, who must supply two references of external organizations, which should confirm the history and information included in the application. The list of suitable candidates is checked and approved by the director of J&P, Sebastiaan van der Zwaan, who later submits it to the selection commission.

The requirements of the Shelter City Netherlands program are:

- 1) Being a human rights defender according to the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders;
- 2) Being threatened or otherwise under pressure due to their work;
- 3) Should be able to be relocated for a maximum of 3 months and must summarize his work plan for the three months of temporary relocation;

<sup>93</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City Program Coordinator, for the full interview see: Appendix III

<sup>94</sup> A total of 451 applications were collected in 2018, 171 in the first call and 280 in the second. See: Appendix III

- 4) Having a sufficient level of English (or French/Spanish) to live independently in the Netherlands and to take part in various activities;
- 5) Being willing to speak publicly about their experience or about human rights in their country to the extent that their security situation allows;
- 6) Their travel and stay abroad must not be a reason for unsafety or danger for the candidate himself or for the family.
- 7) They implement a non-violent approach in their work;
- 8) Being willing and able to come to the Netherlands without accompaniment of family members;
- 9) Not being subjected to any measure or judicial prohibition of leaving their country;
- 10) Being available to come to the Netherlands in the requested period<sup>95</sup>.

The Dutch model, unlike other programmes, does not work with a specific type of defenders, but it welcomes applications from all over the world and from people engaging in all kind of activities. provided they comply with the requirements listed above. However, during the selection there is great attention to involve equally men and women human rights defenders in each programme edition. The Dutch network does not work with people subject to high levels of risk or to emergency situations that require a timely exit from the country of origin, as the temporary relocation is conceived as an opportunity to expand the visibility of the defender through public meetings, which could not be carried out in case of danger or high threat. Although the bureaucracy and timing for the acquisition of all documents, including visas, and the complexity of organizing a temporary relocation are elements that do not favour the stay in Dutch cities of people who need to hurriedly leave their country, since 2017 J&P has opened a "flexible relocation" fund, or flexible reception, in the event of urgent applications received outside the opening periods of the call. This special fund allows to host up to three people a year<sup>96</sup>. In the Shelter City of San Josè in Costa Rica, there have been some cases of emergency temporary relocation for defenders coming from Latin America. The geographical proximity and the ease of acquisition of visas have allowed that some defenders could reach San Jose in less than 48 hours from the time of the request for support<sup>97</sup>.

#### 2.5 Activities organized by the Shelter City network<sup>98</sup>

The planning of the agenda is one of the most important part of the all programme; researching a balance between activities, events and the private space is a task that is shared between the defender and the partners involved. When the selection process ends, J&P shares the person profile with the organizations and associations engaging in the programme, in order to stablish a first contact and allow a greater personalization of the experience. The planning of the activities starts before the arrival of the guest through a call or videocall in which all services and activities offer by the Shelter City are explained. In this way, the defender can reflect about the options, while the organizers, after a second contact with the defender, can start preparing what is needed

<sup>95</sup> Justice & Peace, (2019), How to set up a Shelter City p, 7

<sup>96</sup> Justice & Peace, (2019), How to set up a Shelter City p, 7

<sup>97</sup> Information and testimonies collected during the International Shelter City workshop which was held in The Hague in October 2019. See: Appendix II

<sup>98</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City program coordinator, for the full interview see: appendix III

for the required activities and services. All the appointments included in the agenda are thought and planned in order to reach the four major objectives of the Shelter City Programme:

- 1) Rest and well-being: basic medical service and psychological support, cultural, sporting and artistic activities are offered;
- 2) Strengthening of skills: university courses specialized in human rights, foreign language courses, computer literacy courses;
- 3) Networking: meetings with local, national and international organizations, associations, political parties and institutions;
- 4) Raising awareness within Dutch citizenship: public events, seminars in universities, activities with high schools<sup>99</sup>.

The agenda is developed by the coordinator, the mentor and the defender. The latter can ask two versions of the same agenda: a private one that can be consulted only by people that are strictly involved in personal and delicate activities, for instance the medical-psychological staff, and a public one that is shared between all organizations. During the stay, the entire planning is constantly monitored and modified depending by requests from the defenders or aspects related to safety or accidents.

#### 2.6 Holistic Security Training

During the stay of defenders, J&P offers to all the guests located in the Netherlands a three weeks holistic security training, divided in three weekly modules and aimed at building new protection strategies and strengthening the resilience of the person through the deepening of three main aspects: cyber security, physical and psychological security, ad legal-administrative security. On a methodological level, the course alternates theoretical and practical sessions, personal defence techniques, labs on personal care and stress management, lessons on the correct use of security management tools, and moments for advocacy. The course offered by J&P is also opened to staff from NGOs and other groups dealing with human rights and social justice, who are interested in receiving specific training on the subject. The training weeks represent an interesting opportunity for networking for defenders, who can establish useful personal and work contacts<sup>100</sup>.

#### 2.7 The Shelter City model during the COVID-19

The global scale spreading of Coronavirus, declared pandemic at the beginning of March 2020, has caused, among the different preventive measures, the closing for a month of Schengen area for extra-European citizens<sup>101</sup>. Due to this emergency situation, the Shelter City Netherlands network had to cancel<sup>102</sup> the arrival of 10 out of 11 defenders expected for temporary relocation on the second semester of 2020. The decision was taken based on the consequences of the strong restrictions on international mobility, and the consideration of the programme's objective, which establish that the temporary relocation should be structured as an opportunity for networking, education and advocacy. These activities need the presence of the defender, and that is not easily achievable in this period. Tess van Bommel<sup>103</sup>, Shelter City Programme Officer,

<sup>99</sup> Justice & Peace, (2019), How to set up a Shelter City p. 14

<sup>100</sup> For more information and contacts, see: https://justiceandpeace.nl/en/initiatives/trainings-for-hrds/ 101 Source: Repubblica.it

https://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2020/03/16/news/ue\_coronavirus\_in\_tutta\_europa\_inutile\_chiudere\_le\_frontiere\_-251429968/

<sup>102</sup> J&P has not yet made a final decision regarding the future of the program for 2020, one of the options is to postpone the March-June 2020 shift to autumn.

<sup>103</sup> For questions and answers to Tess van Bommel, see: Appendix XV

explains that at the moment<sup>104</sup>, two Venezuelan defenders, a man and a woman, are hosted at the programme. Genesis Davila, young lawyer, reached Rotterdam a week before the lockdown, while David Gomez Gamboa, university professor of Zulia, came to Utrecht in January, together with the previous group of defenders. In the last few months, some of the activities and appointments scheduled for the two guests have been executed online through videocalls, including two academic seminars where David Gamboa participated as speaker, an online meeting with the ministry, and various webinars organized by local associations. Among the activities and services of the temporary relocation programme that have been maintained during the quarantine there are: the psychological support, guaranteed through online therapy sessions, and the holistic security training, offered to both the people hosted and the ones that could not reached the Netherlands. The return of the two guests is temporarily suspended since there is no way to know when and how will be reopened the connections between Europe and Venezuela.

## 2.8 The meeting in Barcelona and the guidelines on the well-being of defenders and defenders

Related to the theme of rest and well-being, J&P collaborated on the project of the "Center for Applied Human Rights" (CAHR) of the University of York entitled "Temporary International Relocation Initiatives and the Wellbeing of Human Rights Defenders"<sup>105</sup>. This project, for which ICORN<sup>106</sup>, The Martin Roth Initiative<sup>107</sup>, Professor Adam Brown from New York The New School<sup>108</sup>, and human rights expert Sagha Koulaeva<sup>109</sup> collaborated, aims to deepen:

- The norms, beliefs and practices that hinder or support defenders of human rights in strengthening individual and collective mental and emotional well-being;
- How the coordinators of temporary relocation initiatives can help defenders and defender in strengthening their mental and emotional well-being;
- What are the practices that can be useful in strengthening emotional and mental wellbeing and why.

For the realisation of this project, hundreds of people have been interviewed: defenders participating on temporary relocation programmes in Europe, their coordinators, and health professionals, such as therapists, educators, consultants, psychologists, psychiatrics and artists. One of the results was the publishing, on June 2019, of "The Barcelona Guidelines on Wellbeing and Temporary International Relocation of Human Rights Defenders at Risk"<sup>110</sup>, so called because discussed and finalized during an international meeting in Barcelona. The guidelines underline how defenders' well-being need specific attention both on the planning stage of the temporary relocation programme, and throughout the course of it, and how is necessary to predict

<sup>104</sup> This paragraph was written in June 2020

<sup>105</sup> Insights and resources on the work of the CAHR in the field of well-being and health of defenders and human rights defenders at the link, https://www.hrdhub.org/wellbeing?fbclid=IwAR3EkD0wiF-2eFQFLa1QrubZODZ81mDK5b4sLo8nudh0\_3Vlag3LcD

<sup>106</sup> International City of Refuge Network is an independent organization of cities and regions that provide refuge for at-risk writers and artists. It promotes freedom of expression, defends democratic values and promotes international solidarity. Website, https://www.icorn.org 107 The Martin Roth Initiative protects artists who are committed to art freedom, democracy and human rights in their home country by allowing temporary residence in Germany or third countries. Website, https://www.martin-roth-initiative.de/en

<sup>108</sup> Adam Brown, Adam Brown is a clinical psychologist whose work focuses on identifying the psychological and biological factors that contribute to negative mental health outcomes after exposure to traumatic stress and the development of interventions guided by advances in cognitive neuroscience. Website and contacts, https://www.newschool.edu/nssr/faculty/adam-brown/

<sup>109</sup> Sacha Koulaeva is director of the "Eastern Europe and Central Asia Desk" at the "International Federation for Human Rights". Website, https://www.fidh.org/it/

<sup>110</sup> University of York (2019), The Barcelona Guidelines on Wellbeing and Temporary International Relocation of Human Rights Defenders at Risk

specific resources for the implementation of the activities aiming to mental and emotional wellbeing of the people hosted, and the treatment of any pathologies and disorders<sup>111</sup>. In order to facilitate the work of the people involved in the temporary relocation, the guidelines offer a number of suggestions useful for programmes' coordinators and experts of health and well-being. The document also mentions the mental health and well-being of operators working within the temporary relocation programmes, who are subject to high stress and pressure.

#### 2.9 Support during the stay<sup>112</sup>

#### **Reference figures**

The stay of a defender in a Dutch city does not only involve activities related to political agenda and personal well-being, but also moments o socialization and interaction with the community. The programme implementation needs the collaboration and presence of different professionals and volunteers from partner associations. These professional figures are identified within the organization managing the temporary relocation, and are:

- Coordinator: it has the task of handling the applications received and pre-selecting suitable candidates who will then be examined by the examining commission. This person is responsible for supervising all the activities and all the bureaucracy of the guest's travel and stay, including the management of all aspects related to the safety of the person. It is also responsible for monitoring and implementing fundraising actions, both internal, referring to the program partners, and for external sources, such as private citizens. The coordination of the actors involved and the activities they propose is also included in the coordinator's responsibilities.
- The mentor/buddy: this role can be covered by several people as it requires the availability of at least one mentor every day. The responsibilities of this figure include: the management and supervision of all the activities foreseen by the agenda; supporting the defender in establishing what the objectives of the stay are; the identification of possible trainings, courses, activities for the guest; creating opportunities for networking and ensuring that the quest benefits from medical-psychological support services if necessary. According to J&P, most defenders have a hard time asking for help, especially when it comes to health needs, which is why the mentor must pay attention to certain signs or symptoms that could be traced back to stress problems. The person or persons holding this role represent a fundamental point of reference for the hosted defender, the mentor figure requires a high level of knowledge both of the city in which the program takes note, and of the language spoken by the host. In fact, in the first days of stay it is the mentor's task to show the guest where the points of greatest interest are located, such as the organization's headquarters, supermarkets, accommodation, and introduce him to the use of means of transport, and other specific situations to which the person may not be used to<sup>113</sup>.

<sup>111</sup> In accordance with the guidelines, the main health problems encountered during the administration of the interviews include burnout, anxiety, depression and post-traumatic stress disorder

<sup>112</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City program coordinator, for the full interview see: appendix III

<sup>113</sup> Justice & Peace, (2019), How to set up a Shelter City p. 10

#### Practical aspects of the stay<sup>114</sup>

The Dutch model provides that during the defender's stay, appropriate spaces and resources will be provided for the proper execution of the programme and the achievement of the objectives. Practical aspects include:

- Accommodation: the characteristics of the accommodation are shared before the arrival of the person, in order to prepare him for the situation in which he/she will be hosted, in fact, depending on the city, the accommodation could be an entire apartment or a room in a shared house. Fundamental elements are the presence of a good internet connection and a quiet and safe private space, proximity to the centre is not mandatory if local public transport allow easy and quick reaching of points of interest.
- Workstation: a place outside the accommodation is guaranteed in which to continue working, this space is also considered important to allow the defender to socialize with other people who are not directly involved in the activities of the program. Usually the space is located within the headquarters of the organization managing the temporary relocation or of a partner association, for example the university.
- Live hood/pocket money: the person receives every month a sum of money to live independently during the stay in the Netherlands, without worrying about any extra expenses or having to ask the program organizers to take care of their needs.
- Medical insurance: private medical insurance is guaranteed for all defenders hosted by the programme.

#### Funds and budgets:

According to the data collected by J&P, the budget needed for the implementation of a Shelter City in the Netherlands reaches an average of 18.000 euros per month per guest. The implementation of a temporary relocation required many expenses, including travels, activities, logistics, workers and experts' salary, insurance. The Dutch model has three sources of funding:

 Municipalities: cover part of the management costs related to the guest's stay, such as the rent of the accommodation, part of the salaries of the local workers involved in the program and contribute to pocket money and sometimes they offer passes for public transport. The economic commitment of the cities is guaranteed through a subsidy contract signed by the Municipality and by the local organization managing the Shelter City.

<sup>114</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City program coordinator, for the full interview see: appendix III

- Ministry of Foreign Affairs: contributes to the management costs of the project at a national level, usually these costs are related to the work of J&P for the selection of defenders, travel logistics, analysis and training on security, monitoring of the return to the country of origin and visa costs.
- 3. External funds: The two main external funding bodies are the EIDHR and Protect Defenders, which annually open tenders for contributions to temporary relocation projects. External support also comes from private donors and from a fundraising campaign opened on the fundraising platform "pifworld.com"<sup>115</sup> directly from the Shelter City program. In the manual "How to set up a Shelter City"<sup>116</sup>, edited by J&P, some other potential websites and organizations are reported<sup>117</sup> such as East and Horn of Africa Rights Defenders Project<sup>118</sup>, CSO Lifeline<sup>119</sup>, Freedom House<sup>120</sup>, Freedom House LGBT Assistance program Dignity for All<sup>121</sup>, FORUM-ASIA<sup>122</sup>, Front Line Defenders<sup>123</sup>, Urgent Action Fund<sup>124</sup>, and in some cases embassies and consulates.

#### 2.10 Return to the country of origin<sup>125</sup>

The moment of return to the country of origin represents one of the most delicate and complex stage of the all temporary relocation programme, both for the organizational aspects and for the emotional impact on the guest. In fact, according to the manual "How to set up a Shelter City", returning to the place where threats and violence were experienced, after a long period spent in a quiet and safe place, can be very challenging for the defender<sup>126</sup>. In the Dutch model, the organization of the return provides that the guest should be able to return without being escorted, and, in case of necessity, an economic contribution can be used for the reintegration within the community. Depending on the country and the level of involvement of the diplomatic bodies, the Dutch delegation abroad may support and collaborate for the monitoring of post-relocation. Following the stay in the Netherlands, a monitoring system is set up through the use of two channels, a formal one represented by the person appointed by J&P to contact the defender, and an informal one, constituted by people and groups that have accompanied the person during the relocation. The official contact happens six months after the end of the programme and consists of an interview in which is requested an evaluation on the Shelter City programme, the impact it had on the life of the beneficiary and the current situation.

126 Justice & Peace (2019), How to set up a Shelter City, pg.15

<sup>115</sup> For more information on donations, link to the fundrising page, https://www.pifworld.com/nl/nonprofits/rOMir6lOmb4/shelter-city-network

<sup>116</sup> Justice & Peace (2019), How to set up a Shelter City

<sup>117</sup> Ibid, p.9

<sup>118</sup> East and Horn of Africa Rights Defenders Project, http://www.defenddefenders.org/

<sup>119</sup> CSO Lifeline, https://www.csolifeline.org/

<sup>120</sup> Freedom House, https://freedomhouse.org/programs/regional

<sup>121</sup> Freedom House LGBT Assistance Programme Dignity for All, http://www.dignitylgbti.org/

<sup>122</sup> Forum Asia, https://www.forum-asia.org/

<sup>123</sup> Front Line Defenders, https://www.frontlinedefenders.org/en/programme/protection-grants

<sup>124</sup> Urgent Action Fund, http://urgentactionfund.org/apply-for-a-grant/criteriado-i-fit/

<sup>125</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manuals *Justice & Peace* (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City and Justice & Peace* (2019) *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors* have been adapted, integrated with information and data collected during the interview with Suzan Goes, Shelter City program coordinator, for the full interview see: appendix III

#### 2.11 International Shelter Cities

The Shelter City network counts, beside the Dutch cities, five international cities: Tbilisi and Batumi in Georgia, Dar es Salaam in Tanzania, Cotonou in Benin and San Josè in Costa Rica. The rising cases of violence and threats perpetuated against human rights defenders has brought to the development and launch of temporary relocation programmes in the regions where defenders are in danger, in order to promptly respond to emergency situations.

The first international hub was established in 2016 in Tbilisi, thanks to the work of the Center for Participation and Development<sup>127</sup> and Truth Hounds<sup>128</sup>, organization directed by Svitlana Valko<sup>129</sup>, who was a defender hosted in the Shelter City – Middelburg in 2016. The geographical location of this country, positioned between Eastern Europe and Asia, allows to the organizers to efficiently work with threatened defenders coming from Russia, Byelorussia, Kirghizstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Irag and some areas of Ukraine. According to the temporary relocation guidelines of the Dutch model, in Tbilisi is also offered to the defender a safe space where he/she can rest and work for three months, follow trainings and courses, for example on fundraising and on women and minority rights, and receive medical and psycho--social support. As in the Netherlands, the programme includes public events opened to the community, conferences with universities and meetings with other organizations. In addition to the typical temporary relocation of Shelter Cities, in Georgia is also possible an emergency relocation, which is feasible because of geographical proximity and the ease of acquisition of travel documents. In both reception modalities it is possible to host members of the close family or relatives directly depending on defenders<sup>130</sup>. Based on data collected by the organizers, the number of people hosted in Georgia until June 2020 is 100 defenders and around 22 relatives. In 2019, a second Georgian city, Batumi, has joined the network, becoming the sixteenth Shelter City.

The city of Dar es Salaam, in Tanzania, joined the network in 2017 thanks to the work of Africa Human Rights Network (AHRN)<sup>131</sup>. As second international hub of Shelter City, this city mainly hosts people coming from the big lakes region, including Democratic Republic of the Congo, Burundi, Rwanda, Uganda and South Africa. Scenario of decades of fights between armed groups and ethnic and political conflicts, this area has become one of the most advanced in the world in the field of human rights protection. Dar es Salaam, in line with Dutch cities, offers for three months hospitality to defenders, in which they can rest, continue their work in a safe place and join courses and trainings, such as the "Human Rights Project Managing". However, unlike other Shelter Cities, Dar es Salaam is the first city to identify a privileged target of beneficiaries, namely human rights and young people defenders, and to host 15-20 peoples in the same period instead of a single person. The Tanzanian programme is characterized by the numerous activities offered for stress and burnout reduction, in fact swimming and other sports are encouraged, guaranteeing the access to gyms, trips and excursions. In 2019, the coordinator of Dar es Salaam Shelter City, AHRN, has launched a new temporary relocation project in Benin, in the city of Cotonou, aiming at supporting human rights defenders from Western and Francophone Africa. The last available

129 For further information, see the defender sheet appendix XII

<sup>127</sup> Center for Participation and Development promotes civic integration and active citizenship and organizes courses and training in the educational field. Link to the Facebook page, https://www.facebook.com/Centerforparticipationanddevelopment

<sup>128</sup> Truth Hounds is a team of "human rights professionals" born in Georgia in 2014 with the aim of documenting war crimes and human rights violations in war contexts. Link to website, https://truth-hounds.org/en/start-2/

<sup>130</sup> Shelter City in Georgia, link to the website, https://sheltercity.nl/en/tbilisi-and-batumi-georgia/

<sup>131</sup> Africa Human Rights Network was founded in 2016 as a non-profit organization registered with the Chamber of Commerce in The Hague (Holland) with the aim of helping, supporting and promoting human rights defenders and their work in the Great Lakes region, link to the website, https://www.ahrnfoundation.org/

data regarding the numbers of defenders, report 8 defenders coming from Chad, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Senegal and Burundi.<sup>132</sup>

The last international hub, officially established on February 2018, is the one of San Josè, in Costa Rica. This Shelter City is coordinated by the Fundacion Acceso<sup>133</sup> and Hivos Latin America<sup>134</sup>, with the support of the Dutch Embassy in Costa Rica. Within this temporary relocation programme, people from El Salvador, Honduras, Colombia and Nicaragua are hosted for three months<sup>135</sup>. The geographical proximity allows the activation, beside the typical temporary relocation, of an emergency relocation that can provides for the arrival of a threatened defender within 24 hours from the first contact. The Costa Rica Shelter City differs from the Dutch model also regarding the timing of the call for applications, since the open call is open all year round<sup>136</sup>.

<sup>132</sup> Shelter City in Tanzania and Benin, link to the dedicated page, https://sheltercity.nl/en/tanzania-and-benin/

<sup>133</sup> Fundacion Acceso was born in 1993 as an organization for the integral protection and promotion of human rights and those who defend them, link to the website, https://acceso.or.cr/

<sup>134</sup> Hivos-Latin America, an organization founded in 1968, works all over the world on the issues of social justice, diversity, sustainable

development and active citizenship. Link to the website, Latin America section, https://latin-america.hivos.org/

<sup>135</sup> Shelter City in Costa Rica, link to the dedicated page, https://sheltercity.nl/en/shelter-city-in-costa-rica/

<sup>136</sup> Information collected during the International Shelter City workshop, see Appendix II

#### DEFENDER PROFILE #1

Name: Svitlana Valko

*Profession*: Coordinator project Truth Hounds

Country: Ukraine

Temporary relocation programme: Shelter City - Middelburg

Year: 2016

Specialization: monitoring and reporting war crimes and crimes against humanity

Follows (see Appendix XII)

#### DEFENDER PROFILE #2

Name: David Gomez Gamboa

Profession: university professor and director NGO Aula Abierta

Country: Venezuela

Temporary relocation programme: Shelter City – Utrecht

Year: 2020

Specialization: defence of academic rights and freedoms

Follows (see Appendix XII)

Full interview (see Appendix XVII)

#### 2.12 BASQUE TEMPORARY RELOCATION PROGRAMME – CEAR EUSKADI

The Basque temporary relocation programme started in 2011, with the aim of supporting and protecting human rights defenders, mainly coming from Latin America and committed to collective actions of defence, offering them protection in the Basque Country. Established by the "Departamento de Justicia y Administracion Publica" (Department of Justice and Public Administration) of the Basque Government through the "Direccion de Victimas y Derechos Humanos (DVDH)" (Management of Victims and Human Rights), this project is organized and coordinated by the "Comision de Ayuda al Refugiado en Euskari (CEAR)" (Commission of help to the refugee in Basque Country)<sup>137</sup>. In line with the philosophy of the temporary relocation, this model recognizes the temporary relocation as a protection strategy for threatened defenders. Beside the goal of stopping the threats, the programme also aims to improve aspects related to the person's well-being and the support of the work done by the individual and the community he/her belongs to. The Basque programme is not the first one started in Spain, since other organizations developed some temporary protection models some years before <sup>138</sup>. These programmes have been studied and analysed, both on theoretical and practical aspects - for instance, the Asturian one<sup>139</sup> - and then used as inspirational source for the Basque one. In 2009 and 2011, CEAR joined two international missions in Colombia, the first one in 2009 with the Catalan programme<sup>140</sup>, the second one in 2011 with the Asturian one<sup>141</sup>, with the aim of studying the functioning of the programmes for the implementation of a temporary relocation programme suited for the characteristics of Basque country's territory and international cooperation. Every year, the Basque programme welcomes three beneficiaries, who are hosted for six months. From the creation of the project, until June 2020, 24 people were welcomed, of which 15 women, 9 men and 2 minors, belonging to different organizations<sup>142</sup> of Colombia, Honduras, Guatemala, Peru and the Occupied territory of Western Sahara. These organizations are committed to the defence and promotion of the rights of natives, Afro descendants, farmers, urban sector and LGBTQ<sup>143</sup>.

<sup>137</sup> Cear Euskadi, an organization active since 1989 active in the defense and promotion of the rights of refugees, displaced persons, stateless persons and migrants seeking international protection or at risk of exclusion. It defends the right of asylum for people forced into exile, and implements other protection mechanisms for human rights defenders, https://www.cear-euskadi.org/

<sup>138</sup> Some of the active temporary reception programs in Spain are: the "Programa de Protección Temporal de Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos y sus familias" of Amnesty International, the "Programa de Proteccion de Defensores de Derechos Humanos" of the Comissio Catalana d'Ajuda at Refugiat, the "Programa Asturiano de Atención a las Víctimas de la Violencia en Colombia" by Soldepaz Pachakuti, the "Programa Valenciano de Protección Integral y de Acogida de Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos" by CEAR-PV and the "Programa municipal Barcelona protege a periodistas de México "of the Municipality of Barcelona. For further information, see the link, https://issuu.com/internationalactionforpeace/docs/fichas\_digital\_vf

<sup>139</sup> The "Programa Asturiano de Atención a Víctimas de la Violencia en Colombia", see Appendix XIII

<sup>140</sup> Misión Internacional de acompañamiento del Programa de Protección a defensoras y defensores de derechos humanos de Catalunya 141 VII Delegación Asturiana de Verificación de la situación de los derechos humanos en Colombia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Colombia: Asociación de Mujeres por la Paz y los Derechos de las Mujeres Colombianas (ASODEMUC), Asociación para el Desarrollo Social Integral (ECATE), Comisión Intereclesial de Justicia y Paz, Congreso de los Pueblos, Corporación Social Nuevo Día, Consejo Regional Indígena del Cauca (CRIC), Fundación de Derechos Humanos Joel Sierra, Fundación por la defensa de Derechos Humanos y el Derecho Internacional Humanitario del Oriente y Centro de Colombia (Fundación DHOC), Movimiento de Víctimas de Crímenes de Estado (MOVICE), Movimiento Social y Político Marcha Patriótica, Organización Indígena de Antioquia (OIA), Proceso de Comunidades Negras (PCN), Resguardo Indígena de Honduras. Honduras: Comité de Familiares de Detenidos Desaparecidos de Honduras (COFADEH), Instituto Ecuménico Hondureño de Servicios Comunitarios (INEHSCO). Guatemala: Consejo de Pueblos K'iche' (CPK), Organización de Apoyo a una Sexualidad Integral frente al SIDA (OASIS), Red de Sanadoras Ancestrales del feminismo comunitario (Quiché). Perú: Asociación de Mujeres de la Provincia de Huancabamba (AMBHA), Convenio Instituto de Apoyo al Movimiento Autónomo de Mujeres (IAMAMC). Territory of Western Sáhara: Asociación Saharaui de Víctimas de Graves Violaciones de Derechos Humanos cometidas por el Estado Marroquí (ASVDH), Casa de las Mujeres de El Aaiún. 143 For the consultation of the data, see: appendix VIII

#### 2.13 The Spanish context: The Royal Decree 1257/2007

On the 5<sup>th</sup> October 2007, by resolution of the Council of Ministers and by enactment of the King, the Royal Decree 1257/2007161 entered into force<sup>144</sup>, which regulates the direct support to people threatened or persecuted for their activities in defence of human rights, and that are not Spanish residents. This decree replaced the law 23/1998 of the 7<sup>th</sup> July 1998 and the Royal Decree 259/1998 of the 20<sup>th</sup> February 1998, on the regulation of the special norms for the support and funds of international cooperation. The new decree was designed with the aim of providing a quick response to risk, persecution or threat situations of human rights defenders working outside Spain. In particular, the funds allocated are intended to provide protection and support to those who consider their safety or integrity compromised, by establishing supportive measures such as the temporary shelter in Spain. In fact, article 1.2 of the decree states that

"The implementation of humanitarian assistance that is the object of aid will facilitate the exit of defenders and human rights defenders from their country of residence and their temporary accommodation in Spain."<sup>145</sup>

#### 2.14 The Basque context

In 2006, the Basque government approved the first "Plan de Paz y Convivencia" (Plan for peace and cohabitation) for the implementation of more than 60 projects and initiatives for peace building and cohabitation in the Basque Country, directly planned by the "Consejo de Gobierno" (Government Council)<sup>146</sup>. The areas of work identified in the plan are five, and they include: human rights, victims of terrorism, memory recovery, civil and politics rights and torture prevention. In 2007, a second plan is adopted, called "Plan Vasco de Educación para la Paz y los Derechos Humanos", elaborato dalla "Dirección de Derechos Humanos", with the collaboration of the Depatement of justice, work and social assitence, followed in 2010 by the "Reformulación del Plan Vasco de Educación para la Paz y los Derechos Humanos" and in 2013 from the "Plan de Paz y Convivencia 2013- 2016". The last plan approved from the Basque government, in 2017, is named "Plan de Convivencia y Derechos Humanos 2017-2020". This document highlights the will of the Government to invest in a comprehensive and interdepartmental way for the reinforcement of efforts and commitment in the human rights context.

Within the objectives of initiative n.8, funded with an estimated cost of 830 thousand euros over 4 years<sup>147</sup>, are included:

- The promotion of a society committed to human rights and a culture of cohabitation based on the awareness of the common good;
- Strengthening the resources needed to combat inequality in all its forms and promote solidarity;
- Create connections between institutional and social commitment in the Basque Country with international development cooperation initiatives and projects.

<sup>144</sup> Gobierno de Espana (2007), Real Decreto 1257/2007

<sup>145</sup> Article 1.2 "Las actuaciones de atención humanitaria objeto de estas ayudas irán dirigidas a facilitar la salida del país en que residan y su acogimiento temporal en España, de aquellas personas, cualquiera que sea su nacionalidad, que deban enfrentarse a las situaciones descritas en el apartado 1 de este artículo.", Government of Spain (2007), Royal Decree 1257/2007

<sup>146</sup> The Basque government (in Basque, Eusko Jaurlaritza) is the entity that exercises executive power and manages the autonomous administration of the Basque Country. It is made up of the president of the Basque government or lendakari (head of the executive), who is elected by the Basque Parliament every four years, and the councilors he himself nominates after being appointed to the office. 147 Bague Government (2017), Plan de Convivencia y Derechos Humanos 2017-2020, p.78

 Promote the development and adoption of the "IV Plan Director de Cooperación para el Desarrollo 2018-2021".

Within the objectives of initiative n.13, funded with an estimated cost of 690 thousand euro, are included:

- Take part in the international work for the defence of peace, cohabitation, diversity, solidarity and human rights;
- Associate the "Basque Country" brand with the commitment to peace and human rights by sharing the Basque model of peace and cohabitation internationally;
- Participation in international programs related to the temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders.<sup>148</sup>

The topic of human rights defenders is included in various sections of the "IV Plan Director de Cooperación para el Desarrollo 2018-2021", both with the choice of new objectives and approaches, and with the consolidation and reconfirmation of active projects, for instance the programme of temporary protection for human rights defenders. Specifically, there are references within the:

- section 2, international cooperation policy: include specific references to more vulnerable groups such as indigenous peoples, human rights defenders, migrants and refugees;<sup>149</sup>
- section 4, cross-cutting, sectoral, geographical and contextual priorities: specific commitment to strengthening the empowerment of women and the protection of human rights defenders. The constraint of using 20% of the budget for initiatives aimed at women is maintained;<sup>150</sup>
- section 5.4, main lines of action: reaffirm and strengthen the commitment to protect both individual human rights defenders and the groups with which Basque organizations work on the ground, through the Basque Government's DVDH temporary protection program and other projects.<sup>151</sup>

In 2019, the Basque Agency for Development Cooperation allocated a total of 37.6 million euros to finance around 120 cooperation, education and humanitarian projects. More than a third of these resources were used to support one of the objectives considered to be the most strategic, namely that one related to women empowerment, through the numerous programs and initiatives active in the Basque Country and abroad<sup>152</sup>.

<sup>148</sup> Basque Governament (2017), Plan de Convivencia y Derechos Humanos 2017-2020, p.60

<sup>149</sup> Basque Governament (2018), IV Plan Director de Cooperación para el Desarrollo 2018-2021, p,9 150 Ibid, p.13

<sup>151</sup> Ibid, p.17

<sup>152</sup> Fonte www.euskadi.eus, sito web del governo basco

#### 2.15 The actors involved<sup>153</sup>

The Basque model engage various partners from institutions and civil society.

The Basque temporary protection programme partners are:

- Dirección de Víctimas y Derechos Humanos del Gobierno Basque: it is officially the promoter of the temporary protection program. Specifically, it plays a fundamental role in the economic part, for the salaries of some of the professionals involved and in making services and accommodation available, and in the organizational part, in particular in relation to the Basque delegation in the countries of origin of the people hosted. DVDH is part of the "General Secretariat of Derechos Humanos, Convivencia y Cooperación" and is responsible for promoting policies to support human rights and peaceful cohabitation, coordinating the various government agencies on the subject of human rights and managing the reception projects for refugees and migrants. The issue of assistance to victims of terrorism also falls within its competence.<sup>154</sup>
- CEAR Euskadi: organization coordinating the temporary protection program in the Basque Country. Active since 1989, this organization's mission is to defend and promote human rights and the integral development of refugees, displaced persons, expatriates and migrants in need of international protection or, for safety reasons, that are forced to leave their country of origin.<sup>155</sup>
- Agencia Tubo de Cooperación para el Desarrollo: it collaborates in the logistics and cost management for the part of the program relating to travel and stay of the person hosted, contributes to the planning of the political agenda and participates in the Basque delegation in the countries of origin of the people hosted. The "Agencia Tubo de Cooperación para el Desarrollo" is a public body, part of the "General Secretariat of Derechos Humanos, Convivencia y Cooperación" and is aimed at planning and managing development policies. It operates according to the principles and objectives established by the Law on Cooperation.<sup>156</sup>
- Selection Committee: it is composed of the "Dirección de Acción Exterior" of the Basque Government, the "Instituto Hegoa"<sup>157</sup>, the "Instituto de Derechos Humanos Pedro Arrupe"<sup>158</sup>, the "Coordinadora de ONGD de Euskadi"<sup>159</sup> and the "Foro de Asociaciones de Educación en Derechos Humanos y por la Paz"<sup>160</sup>;

- 157 Instituto Hegos, Institute for International Cooperation and Development, http://www.hegoa.ehu.es/
- 158 Instituto de Derechos Humanos Pedro Arrupe, an academic institution created in 1997

<sup>153</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manual "Programa Vasco de Proteccione para Defensoras y Defensores" Cear Euskadi (2018) have been adapted, integrated with the interview with Leire Lasa, coordinator of the temporary protection program. For the answers see: Appendix VIII

<sup>154</sup> Dirección de Víctimas y Derechos Humanos del Gobierno basco, https://www.euskadi.eus/web01-

<sup>155</sup> Cear Euskadi, https://www.cear-euskadi.org/

<sup>156</sup> Agencia Vasca de Cooperación para el Desarrollo, https://www.elankidetza.euskadi.eus/informacion/agencia-vasca-de-cooperacion-aldesarrollo/x63-content7/es/

https://socialesyhumanas.deusto.es/cs/Satellite/socialesyhumanas/es/instituto-de-derechos-humanos/el-instituto-0/presentacion-3 159 Coordinadora de ONGD de Euskadi, a collective of 79 Basque NGOs engaged in development cooperation and education activities. It was

born in 1988 from a group of 11 organizations, https://www.ongdeuskadi.org/es/

<sup>160</sup> Foro de Asociaciones de Educación en Derechos Humanos y por la Paz, a non-profit association founded in 2007 with the aim of promoting human rights and the culture of peace

- Basque organizations proposing candidates: the applications of the defenders and defender are sent by a Basque organization or association that acts as a guarantor. These entities, when completing the application form, must sign an agreement ("acta de compromiso") with the organizers of the program in which they undertake to collaborate in the management of temporary protection with regard to the aspects of: administration of the exit/return of the person hosted from/to the country of origin; always maintain active communication with the foreign organization, the candidate and the organizers; provide data and updates on the dangerous situation of the person and the country of origin; actively contribute to developing the political agenda.<sup>161</sup>
- Red de apoyo: this group is in charge of planning and managing the appointments of the political agenda and of collaborating and supporting the work of CEAR. The network is composed of the organizations "Asociación de Amigos y Amigas de la RASD", "Euskadi, Asociación Emigradxs sin fronteras", "Asociación Paz con Dignidad", "Gehitu", "Joxemi Zumalabe Fundazioa", "Mundubat", "Mugarik Gabe "And Oxfam. The organizations of the selected candidates also participate in the support network.
- Colectivo ANSUR: it collaborates in the management of the program as a consultant for the safety and protection of the people hosted with an integral approach<sup>162</sup>. Active since 2007, this group works in support of organizations and associations committed to the defense of human rights and those who defend them.<sup>163</sup>
- *Ekimen Elkartea*: offers individual psychotherapy sessions to both the hosted people and the program organizers. Ekimen Elkartea is an association for the study of social problems, the promotion of health and the defence of the rights of all people, specializing in the treatment of victims of torture and psychopathic violence.<sup>164</sup>

#### 2.16 The selection of defenders<sup>165</sup>

The selection of participants occurs through a call published in the DVDH and it stays open for a month, during such period all the applications are collected by CEAR and delivered to DVDH, who will later call the "Comitè de Selección" (Selection Committee) to verify and evaluate the defenders' profiles. In this temporary relocation model, instead of defenders directly sending their applications, the Basque organizations take responsibility for it with the collaboration of foreign countries and regions. This system simplifies the procedure of profiles evaluation and reduces the number of applications, since it implies a first selection directly made by the organizations working in the field, which have greater information regarding the political, economic and risk situation of each community and defender.

<sup>161</sup> For the full document of the "Acta de compromiso", see: Appendix XIV

<sup>162</sup> See the section "Activities", p. 40

<sup>163</sup> Colectivo ANSUR, https://colectivoansur.org/

<sup>164</sup> Ekimen Elkartea, association presentation, see link

 $https://www.osakidetza.euskadi.eus/contenidos/asociacion/asb082161999/es\_def/adjuntos/x42tAsociacion.pdf$ 

<sup>165</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manual "Programa Vasco de Proteccione para Defensoras y Defensores" Cear Euskadi (2018) have been adapted, integrated with the interview with Leire Lasa, coordinator of the temporary protection program. For the answers see: Appendix VIII

The requirements of the temporary protection programme are:

- 1. Not to be in an emergency situation that requires immediate exit from the country of origin;
- 2. Be supported by a Basque organization, collective or movement;
- 3. Be linked to organizations or social movements committed to the defence of political, civil, economic, social, cultural, environmental rights;

For the selection of the participants, priority is given to people belonging to special categories of defenders, such as:

- 1. Women belonging to feminist organizations and those who work for the defence of the rights of LGTTBI people<sup>166</sup>;
- 2. People who work for the defence of economic, social, cultural and environmental rights, in particular those who claim land rights, indigenous peoples and Afro descendants;
- 3. People who work for the defence of minority rights.

In carrying out its work, the selection committee makes use, in addition to the required requisites, of all the information reported in the questionnaires and documentation<sup>167</sup> provided by the organizations, especially as regards the assessment of the level of risk associated with the candidate.

## 2.17 Activities<sup>168</sup>

According to the manual "Proteger a quien defiende"<sup>169</sup>, published by CEAR, the protection of human rights defenders must be considered as the whole set of actions that organizations, institutions and defenders develop in order to create and expand safe spaces of life and work. Compared to the traditional approach to protection, which defines it as the direct response to threats and violence within situation of danger<sup>170</sup>, the Basque model develop its programme based on an integral vision, founded on four fundamental pillars: organization, relations, safety and psycho-social support. The image that better describes this idea is a table with four legs, all looking alike and each representing one principle. The concept lays on stability and harmony that must surround the four elements, none of these can be excessive or lacking, they must all proceed with the same speed, in order to guarantee a full support to the wellbeing of the guest and an efficient functioning of the programme<sup>171</sup>. The first leg represents organization, which includes those elements that favour a higher institutional safety, such as the protection management, the principles and forms of organization, the methodology for developing a risk and context analysis, and communication strategies. The second one, about relations, it is described as the networks, alliances and spaces of coordination, both on a national and international level, including the relationship with authorities. The third leg is represented by the practices concerning the improvement of safety and protection capacity, developed through the adoption of personal methods and measures linked to the proper use of information and communication and the elaboration of emergency planes. The last element is composed by all that activities that are offered for the wellbeing of the person and the organization he/she works for. Within this category

169 Cear (2019), Proteger a quien defiende

171 Cear (2019), Proteger a quien defiende, p. 8

<sup>166</sup> Lesbian, gay, transsexual, transgender, bisexual and intersex

<sup>167</sup> To view the questionnaire and the required documentation, consult the annexes of the Cear Euskadi manual (2019), Programa Vasco 168 For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manual "Programa Vasco de Proteccione para Defensoras y Defensores" Cear Euskadi (2018) have been adapted, integrated with the interview with Leire Lasa, coordinator of the temporary protection program. For the answers see: Appendix VIII

<sup>170</sup> The three strategies quoted in the manual and considered as traditional ones are: acceptation, protection and dissuasion

are included the mechanisms of encouragement for expression of feelings, fear management, and stress and burnout prevention.

Specifically, the activities included in the programme are defined under three categories:

1. Psychosocial and medical support:

- Individualized therapeutic accompaniment aimed at the emotional impact caused by socio-political violence. The stay of 6 months does not allow to organize an in-depth therapeutic process, therefore a diagnosis and teaching work is carried out on some anxiety and fear control techniques so as to allow the defender to return to their country of origin with useful indications to continue the path individually or, if possible, with a new therapist;
- Medical treatment for any physical trauma caused by threats and violence or for any physiotherapy, ophthalmological or dental needs;
- Psychosocial group accompanying upon arrival and before returning, and individual accompanying during the stay.

2. Political agenda:

- Institutional agenda common to all defenders organized and managed by CEAR, as coordinating organization, with the involvement of guests. This part of the agenda includes a meeting with the "Comisión de Derechos Humanos" of the Basque Parliament, a meeting with the Basque Government, a press conference and a meeting with the "Comité de Selección";
- Individual political agenda organized and managed by the "Red de Apoyo" before the person's arrival, in close collaboration with him/her. Later it is reviewed and re-evaluated by all the parties involved, with the aim of optimizing the time and energy towards achieving the objectives that the defender planned.
- 3. Education:
  - Courses on human rights issues offered by universities and other institutes;
  - Training courses organized by social organizations and movements;
  - Participation as speakers and guests in seminars and public meetings.<sup>172</sup>

## 2.18 The temporary relocation programme during COVID-19

The programme currently<sup>173</sup> hosts three persons, a woman and a man from Colombia and a man from Honduras, who are directly followed by the Basque organizations "Mugarik Gabe<sup>174</sup>", "Aldarte<sup>175</sup>" and "Emigradas sin Fronteras<sup>176</sup>". Until the declaration of emergency state in Spain, the public and private agenda of defenders was respected, in fact they have been involved in group therapy workshops, public meetings and events, psychological support sessions, and safety and protection trainings.

<sup>172</sup> Cear (2019), Proteger a quien defiende, p. 10

<sup>173</sup> This paragraph was written in June 2020

<sup>174</sup> Mugarik Gabe: feminist, ecologist, leftist, internationalist and solidarity assembly organization committed in international cooperation projects born in 1987, website, https://www.mugarikgabe.org/es/

<sup>175</sup> Aldarte: association engaged in the field of sexual and gender diversity, founded in 1994, website, http://www.aldarte.org/es/

<sup>176</sup> Emigrad@s sin fronteras, an association formed by migrants born in 2008, website, http://emigradossinfronteras.org/wp/quienes-somos/

Following confinement and the inability to leave their homes, explains the project coordinator Leire Lasa<sup>177</sup>, various measures have been taken both for protection and care, and for the maintenance of the activities and services planned by the program:

- Public agenda: all appointments and meetings with political institutions and organizations were guaranteed thanks to the use of digital platforms, the same thing happened for the training courses, which took place in the form of online lessons. Events were also organized, and documents and articles<sup>178</sup> were drafted on the subject of the impact of pandemic and containment measures on the lives of defenders. Guests received several requests for interviews and participation in webinars. To ensure greater connection with the outside world and the proper conduct of all online activities, the technological equipment in the guest apartment has been increased and checked for proper functioning by the program organizers.
- Medical and psychosocial support: the people hosted are experiencing a moment of particular frustration and uncertainty due to restrictions and distance. To deal with this situation, and continue with the therapy path already started, the individual psychosocial accompaniment remained active and available on a weekly basis throughout the quarantine, as the offices of the association<sup>179</sup> referent of this part of the program remained always open. The program managers and organizations of the "Red de Apoyo" ensured constant contact with guests through calls, video calls and texts. In addition, CEAR Euskadi carried out a weekly check-up visit in the apartment of the defenders to check the general situation and provide adequate personal protective equipment (masks, gloves and sanitizer).

The date of return pf guests, initially planned for July, it is still under revision. The organizers are working on different strategies, but currently the administrative offices related to visa procedure, international travels and temporary resident permits are all closed, and all deadlines have been extended to a date to be decided. The yearly monitoring delegation organized for the end of the programme has been postponed to 2021.

#### 2.19 Support during the stay

#### The reference figures

The Basque temporary protection program requires two people to be in charge of managing and looking after the guests on a daily basis. These two figures have weekly meetings to discuss about defenders' agenda and share the tasks and appointments. One of them is the coordinator of the programme, who is in charge to maintain the relations with the institutions and of constantly monitoring the entire programme.

<sup>177</sup> For questions and answers, see: Appendix VIII

<sup>178</sup> Recomendaciones during el estado de alarma por Coronavirus ", link to the article, https://www.cear-euskadi.org/recomendacionesdurante-el-estado-de-alarma-por-coronavirus/ and" Refugia-te: creatividad en tiempos de confinamiento ", link to the article, https://www.cear-euskadi.org/refugia-te/

<sup>179</sup> The referent association is "Ekimen Elkartea"

# Practical aspects of the stay<sup>180</sup>

The Basque model provides to the guests all is needed to spent a pleasant and autonomous stay abroad, guaranteeing ideal spaces and resources, such as:

- Accommodation: DVDH provides a fully furnished apartment in Bilbao with three single rooms for the defenders hosted. The apartment is well connected to the rest of the city and has internet connection.
- The "pocket money": the guest receives a sum of money every month, called "dinero de bolsillo", with which to cover any extra daily expenses during their stay in the Basque Country. Upon returning to the country of origin, the defender or defender receives additional financial help, called "dinero de retorno", to support daily activities and needs.
- Medical insurance: private medical insurance is stipulated for the host and provided with a "tarjeta sanitaria" (health system card) with which to access the "Servicio Vasco de Salud" (Osakidetza).

# Funds and budget

The Basque programme is financed through a three-year agreement with the "Secretaría General de Derechos Humanos, Convivencia y Cooperación del Gobierno Vasco" (General Secretariat of Human rights, Cohabitation and Cooperation of the Basque Government) who, with two own agencies, reply to the numerous expense items required for the realization of a temporary relocation. Currently, the programme can benefit from a yearly 145.000-euro budget, that is meant to be used for the reception of three persons. The budget covers the costs of the entire stay, including the services and salaries of some organizations' staff and of the delegation visiting the country of origin.

The costs of the program are divided between:

1. Dirección de Víctimas y Derechos Humanos del Gobierno Vasco: covers most of the programme's expenses in the fields of communication, legal-administrative matters, including the salaries of two CEAR people, one full-time and one part-time, and that of the experts of the ANSUR collective. It also covers the cost of travel, visas, provides a furnished apartment for the three people hosted, provides medical and psychological insurance, monthly "pocket money" ("dinero de bolsillo") and return money ("dinero de retorno").

2. Agencia Vasca de Cooperación para el Desarrollo: contributes to the costs of travel management and of the necessary documentation, especially regarding the trips during the stay in the Basque Country. It also covers the expenses of the Basque organizations representing defenders, for example part of the salaries of the people who take care of the project and the expenses incurred for the person's departure and return from the country of origin.

<sup>180</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manual "Programa Vasco de Proteccione para Defensoras y Defensores" Cear Euskadi (2018) have been adapted, integrated with the interview with Leire Lasa, coordinator of the temporary protection program. For the answers see: Appendix VIII

#### 2.20 Return to the country of origin<sup>181</sup>

The return phase represents one of the most important and delicate moment of the programme. especially regarding the guests' safety. In order to define the best strategies to apply in the country of origin, a context analysis and a risk analysis are conducted with the support of ANSUR. These are studying the strengths and weaknesses of organizations and solidarity networks of the country of origin, besides the ones involved in the Basque Countries. In addition, these studies are examining the political, social and economic situation of the country, which could have changed during the temporary relocation. Following these analyses, tailormade return plans are developed, which usually include the production of informative materials for civil society, letters and public documents for international institutions and organizations, in order to informing about the potential or confirmed risk situation, both for the life and psychological integrity of the interested person, and for his/her work. A further initiative is the creation of a parliamentary delegation in the country of origin, aiming to monitoring the person's general condition, to reinforce the protection networks and to make explicit the political support of Basque Government and of "Red de Apoyo" to the defender and his/her organization. The delegation is coordinated by DVDH with the participation of "Agencia Vasca de Cooperación para el Desarrollo" (Basque Agency for Cooperation and Development), the "Dirección de Acción Exterior del Gobierno Vasco" (Directive of External Action of Basque Government), the "Comisión de Derechos Humanos del Parlamento Vasco" (Human Rights Commission of Basque Parliament), the Basque organizations or movements referring to the people hosted by the program and CEAR. The agenda of the commission visiting is composed by various meeting with local and international organizations, associations, communities, public institutions and diplomatic missions, in order to transfer useful information for the protection of the defender and to collect data of the context where he/she works. The assessments, concerns and recommendations of the delegation are then collected - together with the list of participants of all the meetings that happened during the trip - in a report<sup>182</sup> intended for the organizations for human rights and public institutions, from the Basque Countries, Spain, and the country of origin. The organization of the delegation change based on the country, both regarding the participants list and the activities of the meetings, depending on costs and risk factors of that territory. An additional monitoring tool is performed by the Basque organization referring to the person hosted, which will keep contact with the defender regarding the general situation of human rights in his/her country, his/her work and community.

#### 2.21 The Spanish temporary relocation network

Since 2019, some of the Spanish temporary relocation programmes have decided to develop a network to share information suggestions and good practices, and to coordinate defenders' agenda in order to develop common actions and political campaigns<sup>183</sup>. This network, besides the programme coordinated by CEAR Euskadi, is composed by:

<sup>181</sup> For the drafting of this section of the text, parts of the manual "Programa Vasco de Proteccione para Defensoras y Defensores" Cear Euskadi (2018) have been adapted, integrated with the interview with Leire Lasa, coordinator of the temporary protection program. For the answers see: Appendix VIII

<sup>182</sup> To consult the reports of the delegations from 2014 to 2019, see the link, https://www.euskadi.eus/defensores-y-defensoras-de-los-derechos-humanos/web01-s1lehbak/es/

<sup>183</sup> An example of cooperation between temporary protection programs is the "Comunicado de los programs de protecciondel Estado Español frente al escalación de la violencia contra defensoras de DDHH", link to the article, https://www.cear-euskadi.org/comunicado -de-los-programs-de-proteccion-del-estado-espanol-frente-al-increase-de-violence-against-defensoras-de-ddhh /

#### 1. The "Programa Asturiano de Atención a Víctimas de la Violencia en Colombia"

Since 2001, the Asturian Programme of Support for Victims of Violence in Colombia (PAV) hosts, for a six months period, unionists and human rights defenders from Colombia. The programme started as response of the Asturian internationalist solidarity to the strong repression, threats and kills perpetuated in Colombia against unions and their representatives<sup>184</sup>. Based on what Javier Ajona, one of the organizers, told "a group of Asturian associations in agreement with some Colombian trade unions, has decided to create a temporary protection project with the aim of temporarily removing people who are victims of threat in an attempt to reduce persecution"<sup>185</sup>. The PAV is officially included within the activities of the Asturian Development Cooperation Agency<sup>186</sup>, and it is administrated by the organization Soldepaz Pchakuti<sup>187</sup>, who coordinates all the phases of temporary relocation. The set of people hosted in the Asturias is called "colectivo Luciano Romero<sup>188</sup>" by the organizers, in memory of a unionist hosted by the programme and killed after his return to Colombia. The guests are involved in activities for the sensibilization and promotion of human rights and "urban democracy for peace<sup>189</sup>" (diplomacia ciudadana por la paz) with the collaboration of Asturian and European institutions. The PAV involves 17 social organizations, including unions, NGOs, solidarity committees and human rights associations. Nine organizations are in Colombia and are the ones constituting the "Comité de Selecció<sup>190</sup>" of candidates, while the other twelve work in the Asturias and constitute the "Comisión de Organizaciones de Apoyo al PAV". For 13 years this programme welcomed 90 persons: 25 women, 34 unionists, 11 farmers and indigenous leaders and 45 human rights defenders. In 2005, the coordinators organized a delegation that every year, in March, would go to Colombia with the goal of monitoring the state of human rights and publishing a report with the information collected <sup>191</sup>. This document is later presented to the European Parliament, the Spanish Parliament and Senates and the Asturian Parliament. The number of people that compose a delegation are around 8/14 people from the organizations that join the initiative that year. The travel agenda is developed with the selection committee of the programme and includes institutional meetings with government and military authorities, and meeting with communities and civil society organizations. In some editions, representants of Catalan, Basque, Madrid and Burgos organizations have joined the delegation. Since 2001 CEAR Euskadi is part of the organizations supporting the Asturian programme and in 2011 joined the delegation to Colombia.

<sup>184</sup> From Soldepaz Pachakuti's website, "20 años PAV-ddhh: Evaluando con enfoque sicosocial",

http://www.pachakuti.org/spip.php?article1235

<sup>185</sup> For the full answer see: appendice XIII

<sup>186</sup> Asturian Development Cooperation Agency website, https://www.cooperacionasturiana.com/

<sup>187</sup> Pachakuti is an association active for over 20 years, coordinator of the Asturian temporary protection program, it works in several countries of Latin America. Website, http://www.pachakuti.org/

<sup>188</sup> To learn more about the story of Luciano Romero, see the link, https://asud.net/colombia-ucciso-sindacalista

<sup>189</sup> By "diplomacia ciudadana por la paz" are mean all the activities with a social impact carried out during the stay in Asturias by the group of people hosted in the program. Specifically, events and meetings aimed at telling their own stories and struggles with the aim of creating stimuli for the construction of democracy and peace.

<sup>190</sup> The organizations of the selection committee are: Fundación Comité de Solidaridad con los Presos Políticos, Comité Permanente por la Defensa de los Derechos Humanos, Central Unitaria de Trabajadores CUT, Asociación Nacional de Ayuda Solidaria, Colectivo de Abogados José Alvear Restrepo, Federación Unitaria Agropecuaria, Coordinador Nacional Agrario, Organización Nacional Indígena de Colombia and Movimiento de Víctimas de Crímenes de Estado

<sup>191</sup> Asturian 2020 delegation report in Colombia, http://pachakuti.org/spip.php?article1258

#### 2. The "Programa Català de Protecció a defensors i defensores dels Drets Humans"

The Catalan programme for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders started in 2009 as an initiative of the "Generalitat de Catalunya<sup>192</sup>" and the municipality of Sant Cugat del Valles. Initially interrupted in 2010, it has been later re-activated in 2017. The organization currently responsible for its management is the "Comissió Catalana d'Ajuda al Refugiat<sup>193</sup>" (CCAR), who - in collaboration with other organizations such as Oxfam Intermon<sup>194</sup>, "Associació Acció Internacional per la Pau<sup>195</sup>" and "Fundació Formació i Treball<sup>196</sup>" - is in charge of coordinating the entire programme. The organizations proposing the candidates are also joining the programme. The goal of this initiative is the integral protection of defenders that experience situation of danger because of their work, with rounds of two people and for six months. During this period, they are hosted in Catalunya, continuing to work in a safe and guite environment and broadening their networks thanks to the events and activities with organizations, institutions and civil society in Spain and Europe. In this case special attention is paid to the medical-psychological accompanying of the defender during his/her stay: in fact, it is guaranteed a supporting service through the presence of professionals specialized in the assistance to victims of human rights violation and general violence. Within this temporary relocation model, the candidates come from a list of provided by the Catalan organizations committed to human rights, and it is approved and verified by associations, groups or organizations of the countries of origin. The selection requirements do not include the knowledge of any language, neither the origin from a specific geographical area, while it is required that the candidate must belong to on of the special categories established by the Special Rapporteur on Human Rights<sup>197</sup>. After the six months and the return of the quest to his/her country, a Catalan delegation would travel to the country of origin for a monitoring visit, where the institutions and bodies participating to the programme will join. The goal of this visit is to evaluate the situation of the defender and his/her organization, besides show the support of Catalan institutions and bodies in the place where the defender usually live. Later, the delegation compiles a report, including conclusions and recommendations. The presence of delegations and the publication of the report are useful tools to open a political dialogue with the country's authorities, concerning the general topic of human rights defenders' protection<sup>198</sup>.

<sup>192</sup> The offices directly involved are the "Direcció General de Relacions Institucionals", the "Subdirecció General de Memòria", the "Pau i Drets Humans", the "Agència Catalana de Cooperació al Desenvolupament", the "Secretaria d'Igualtat" and the "Migracions i Ciutadania " 193 CCAR, organization founded in 2014 and aimed at supporting asylum seekers and migrants and refugees, website http://www.ccar.cat/?lang=es

<sup>194</sup> Oxfam Intermon, was founded in 1956 in Barcelona as a Spanish non-governmental organization for development cooperation affiliated to the Oxfam confederation, website https://www.oxfamintermon.org/es

<sup>195</sup> Associació Acció Internacional per la Pau (Action Peace) is an organization created in 2011 for the defense of human rights and the construction of a culture of peace through the practice of international accompaniment in Colombia and development education, website https://www.actionpeace.org/

<sup>196</sup> Fundació Formació i Treball, is a foundation created in 1992 by Caritas with the aim of training and helping people at risk of social exclusion to integrate into the labour market through the management and delivery of clothing, furniture and other household items to vulnerable families from Caritas itself and from various social services in Barcelona. Website, https://www.formacioitreball.org/

<sup>197</sup> For a list of special categories, see: Selection of defenders and defenders of the Basque Temporary Reception Program, p. 39 198 "Sobre el programa "Generalitat de Catalunya, http://cooperaciocatalana.gencat.cat/es/que-fem/campanyes/PCPDDH/2019/index.html

3. The "Programa Valenciano de Protección Integral y de Acogida de Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos"

The Valencian programme of integral protection and reception of human rights defenders started in 2019 as project of the "Comisión de Ayuda al refugiado del País Valenciano"<sup>199</sup> (CEAR-PV), in collaboration with "Atelier ONGD<sup>200</sup>", "CEDSALA<sup>201</sup>", "Colectivo Sur Cacarica<sup>202</sup>", "Entreiguales-Valencia<sup>203</sup>", "Entrepobles<sup>204</sup>", "Colectiva de Mujeres Refugiadas y Exiliadas<sup>205</sup>", "Mundubat<sup>206</sup>", "Periferies<sup>207</sup>" e "Sodepau<sup>208</sup>". The project also receives an annual financing from the Department for Cooperation, Development and Migration of the Valencia Municipality, with a total amount of 24.000 euro. For a period of six months, the project offers a safe environment for the people belonging to communities, organizations and social movements dedicated to human rights protection, who are victims of threats and violence, physical and psychological. During the selection of candidates, priority is given to whom prove to be at high risk, besides being involved in activities for the rights of indigenous people, Afro-descendants communities, farmers, women and LGBT people. Geographically speaking, priority is given to countries from Latin America. During the stay, defenders receive goods and services needed to rest, continue working, train themselves and create new networks. Among these, a private apartment in Valencia, medical and psycho-social support, trainings and university courses, advocacy activities, and the possibility to participate to public and private meetings with local, national and international organization and institutions. After the return of the guest to his/her country, some monitoring visits are planned, including visits on the field, in collaboration with the organizations to which they belong<sup>209</sup>.

4. The "Programa municipal Barcelona protegeix periodistes de Mèxic"

The municipal programme for the protection of Mexican journalists started in 2017 as a project of Barcelona municipality and the organization "Taula per Mexic<sup>210</sup>", with the collaboration of Generalitat de Catalunya and eight Mexican associations. This initiative, which hosts four people per year for a six months period (extendable in case of need), aims to the defence and support of Mexican journalists that are threatened for their work.

201 CEDSALA, center for documentation and solidarity with Latin America. Website, https://www.nodo50.org/cedsala/

<sup>199</sup> CEAR-PV, is part of the Comisión Española de Ayuda al Refugiado, founded in 1979. The main objective of CEAR-PV is the defense of the right of asylum and the rights of stateless refugees and vulnerable migrants and applicants for international protection. Website, http://cearpv.org/

<sup>200</sup> Atelier ONGD, è un'organizzazione non governativa per la cooperazione internazionale e lo sviluppo creata nel 1989, che realizza programmi in collaborazione con organizzazioni dei paesi dell'America Latina. Sito web, http://ongdatelier.org/

<sup>202</sup> Colectivo Sur Cacarica, a non-governmental organization specializing in cooperation projects with Colombia. Website https://colectivosurcacarica.wordpress.com/

<sup>203</sup> Entreiguales-Valencia, an association founded in 2006 by a group of Colombians who immigrated to Valencia. Website, https://www.asociacionentreiguales.org/

<sup>204</sup> Entrepobles is an independent and feminist international solidarity association, founded in 1988 as a Latin American solidarity committee. It promotes solidarity cooperation, education for emancipation and political defence, social transformation in the face of alternative social organizations and movements around the world, helps in the creation of alliances and networks of mutual support for the full exercise of sovereignty social, human rights and nature. Website, https://www.entrepobos.org/

<sup>205</sup> Colectiva de Mujeres Refugiadas y Exiliadas, a collective of refugees, exiled and migrant women born in 2014. Website, http://colectivaexiliorefugio.org/

<sup>206</sup> Mundubat is a non-governmental organization engaged in activities for the change of the world order, the fight against poverty and the development of a sustainable and supportive economic system. Website, https://www.mundubat.org/

<sup>207</sup> Periferies is a non-governmental development cooperation organization, founded in 2010, secular, pluralistic, progressive and independent dealing with food sovereignty, indigenous peoples and feminism. Website, http://periferies.org/es/

<sup>208</sup> Sodepau is a solidarity association, with a clear vocation for social transformation, engaged in a twenty-year project of building cultural, solidarity and political bridges between the two shores of the Mediterranean. Website, https://blocs.mesvilaweb.cat/sodepau/ 209 Presentation of the Valencian protection program, http://cearpv.org/programa-de-proteccion-integral-y-de-acogida-de-defensores-ydefensoras-de-derechos-humanos/

<sup>210</sup> Taula for Mexic, is a non-governmental organization founded in 2016 that works for the defense of human rights and peace in Mexico, website https://www.taulapermexic.org/

They receive a temporary relocation offer, which includes accommodations, psycho-social and medical support, education and an agenda of public meetings. These meetings intend to share their work to an international audience, and to create awareness within the civil society, European institutions and international organizations about the violence suffered by journalists in Mexico. The people interested in the project have to send their application together with a confirmation from a Mexican organization about their story. The selection committee, composed of Taula per Mexic and Barcelona municipality, choose who would join the programme. In this model, the stage of return to the country of origin is accompanied with a month monitoring action. From June 2018 to June 2020, this programme hosted 8 people (4 men and 4 women) coming from the States of Guerrero, Coahuila, Sinaloa, Chihuahua and Tamaulipas<sup>211</sup>

### DEFENDER PROFILE #3

Name: Paola Ararat Nazarit

Profession Referent of organization ACONC - Palenque DDHH

Country: Colombia

Temporary Relocation programme: Temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders of CEAR Euskadi - Bilbao

Year: 2020

Specialisation: Training of Afro-descendant communities about their rights and human rights in general; collection and monitoring of cases of violation of human rights; organizations of cooperation activities between communities, institutions and international organizations.

Follows (see Appendix XII)

Full interview (see Appendix XI)

<sup>211</sup> Presentation of the Municipal Program of the Municipality of Barcelona for Mexican journalists, https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/relacionsinternacionalsicooperacio/ca/barcelona-protegeix-periodistes-de-mexic-0

### COMPRATIVE TABLE OF THE BASQUE AND DUTCH MODELS

With the analysis of the temporary relocation programmes coordinated by J&P and CEAR Euskadi, similarities and differences have emerged. Both models started as part of the support and international solidarity for the improvements of defender's life conditions all around the world. Firstly, by protecting their life and physical and mental integrity, and secondly, by promoting and defending human rights. Many practical aspects are similar in both programmes, such as the possibility to get professional medical and psychological support, and the public visibility as a tool of individual and collective protection. There are also several differences, especially regarding the different ways of implementing common phases, such as the definition and selection of candidates, an the return of the defenders to their country.

	BASQUE MODEL	DUTCH MODEL
GENERAL INFORMATION	<u>First edition:</u> 2011 <u>Number of cities involved:</u> 1 <u>Number of people hosted:</u> 24 <u>Number of people per year:</u> 3 <u>Language requirements:</u> Spanish	<u>First edition:</u> 2012 <u>Number of cities involved:</u> The Netherlands – 12 Abroad – 5 <u>Number of people hosted:</u> 200 <u>Number of people per year:</u> in the Netherlands 24 on average <u>Language requirements:</u> English; each year few seats are reserved for Spanish and French- speaking people

LENGHT OF STAY	6 months, extendable in case of need.	3 months, extendable in case of need.
ORGANIZERS	<u>Coordinator:</u> CEAR Euskadi The programme is created by the "Departamento de Justicia y Administracion Publica" of the Basque government.	Coordinator:Justice & Peace is creator of the programme, organizer, coordinator on a national level and representative for the city of The Hague.Local coordinators:PeaceBrigadesInternational Netherlands,Mondiaal Maastrichtper Maastricht, Tertium, Bureau Wijland, Contourde Twern, Humanitas, De 
	<ul> <li><u>Institutional partners:</u></li> <li>1. Dirección de Víctimas y Derechos Humanos del Gobierno basco</li> <li>2. Agencia Vasca de Cooperación para el Desarrollo</li> <li>3. Dirección de Acción Exterior" del Governo basco</li> </ul>	<ul> <li><u>Institutional partners:</u></li> <li>1. Ministry of External Affairs</li> <li>2. Ministry of Justice</li> <li>3. The municipalities involved in the programme</li> </ul>
	<u>Civil Society partners:</u> <ol> <li>Colectivo ANSUR</li> <li>Ekimen Elkartea</li> <li>Asociación de Amigos y Amigas de la RASD</li> <li>Euskadi Asociación Emigradxs sin fronteras</li> </ol>	<ul> <li><u>Civil Society partners:</u></li> <li>1. Local associations and organizations</li> <li>2. Educational partners</li> <li>3. Universities, high schools and educational centres</li> </ul>

	5 Acociación Paz con Dignidad	
	5. Asociación Paz con Dignidad	
	6. Gehitu	
PARTNERS	7. Joxemi Zumalabe Fundazioa	
	8. Mundubat	
	9. Mugarik Gabe	
	10. Oxfam	
	11. Coordinadora de ONGD de Euskadi	
	Academic and educational partners:	
	1. Instituto Hegoa	
	2. Instituto de Derechos Humanos Pedro Arrupe	
	<ol> <li>Foro de Asociaciones de Educación en Derechos Humanos y por la Paz</li> </ol>	
	Call published annually.	Open call published two times per year.
CALL	The applications must be submitted from Basque organizations which certify the history of the defender and undertake, though the signing of a compromise document ("acta de compromise"), to actively collaborate in the programme.	People who are interested on it can choose whether to submit their application independently or request the support of an organization. Two references must be attached to the online form, from two organizations confirming the information provided by the candidate.
	The programme accepts applications from all over the world and any kind of categories of defenders. However, priority is given to these special categories:	No specific target, the programme accepts applications from all over the world and any kind of categories of defenders.

TARGET	<ol> <li>Women belonging to feminist organizations and those who work for the defence of the rights of LGTTBI people;</li> <li>People who work for the defence of economic, social, cultural and environmental rights, especially those who claim land rights, indigenous peoples and Afro descendants;</li> <li>People who work for the defence of minority rights.</li> </ol>	
NUMBER AND SELECTION OF DEFENDERS	<ul> <li>The program hosts 3 people per year, who must meet these requirements:</li> <li>1. Not to be in an emergency situation which requires immediate exit from the country of origin;</li> <li>2. Be supported by a Basque organization, collective or movement;</li> <li>3. To be linked to organizations or social movements committed to the defence of political, civil, economic, social, cultural, and environmental rights;</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The program hosts 1 person per city, twice a year. The selection is made according to the following criteria:</li> <li>1. Be a human rights defender according to the United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Defenders;</li> <li>2. Being in a threatening situation or has been working for a long time under pressure;</li> <li>3. Being committed to return to his/her country of origin after 3 months of work and stay in the Netherlands, and must summarize his/her work plan for the three months of temporary relocation;</li> <li>4. Have a sufficient level of English (or French / Spanish) to live independently in the Netherlands and to take part to various activities;</li> <li>5. Be available to publicly expose the situation of human rights in his/her own country;</li> </ul>

		<ol> <li>6. Traveling and staying abroad must not be a reason for unsafety or danger for the applicants or for the families;</li> <li>7. The methods of work and demonstration must be non-violent;</li> <li>8. Be able to arrive in the Netherlands unaccompanied and without any family members;</li> <li>9. Not to risk any judicial persecution to temporarily leave their country;</li> <li>10. Be available to go to the Netherlands in the period foreseen by the announcement.</li> </ol>
FAMILY/ RELATIVES	The defender can ask to include in the programme the relatives that depend from him/her.	Relatives are not accepted, including the ones depending on the defender.
SERVICES PROVIDED	<u>Medical support:</u> yes <u>Psycho-social support:</u> yes <u>Safety training:</u> yes, personal and digital defence	<u>Medical support:</u> yes <u>Psycho-social support:</u> yes <u>Safety training:</u> yes, personal and digital defence
ACTIVITIES	<ul><li>Activities are divided into 3 categories:</li><li>1. Medical and psycho-social support</li><li>2. Political agenda</li><li>3. Education</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Activities are divided into 4 categories:</li> <li>1. Rest and well-being</li> <li>2. Knowledge and education</li> <li>3. Networking</li> <li>4. Raising awareness within the society</li> </ul>

FUNDS AND BUDGET	The annual budget allocated - by the "Dirección de Víctimas y Derechos Humanos" of the Basque Government and by the "Agencia Tubo de Cooperación para el Desarrollo" - for the reception of 3 people is 145.000 euros per year.	The total cost of receiving a person is calculated at 18.000 euros per month. The sources of funding are: the municipalities involved, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and external funds (Protect Defenders and the EIDHR)
LOGISTICS	Accommodation: fully furnished shared apartment in Bilbao, single rooms, common areas <u>Pocket money: yes, monthly</u> <u>Workstation: not provided</u> <u>Medical insurance: private medical insurance and health</u> card for access to the Basque public health system	Accommodation: it varies according to the city, must include at least a single room, quiet environment. if not in the city centre, then it must provide quick connections to public transport. <u>Pocket money</u> : yes, monthly <u>Workstation</u> : yes, in one of the programme partner locations. <u>Medical insurance</u> : private medical insurance
REFERENT FIGURES	CEAR Euskadi provides a team of two people for the daily work of programme management and guest assistance. These two figures meet weekly to divide tasks and appointments. One of the two figures involved is the coordinator of the program: in addition to sharing the tasks and responsibilities with the rest of the team, he/she is responsible for maintaining relations with the institutions and constantly monitoring the entire program.	Coordinator: pre-selection of candidates, supervision of all activities, fundraising, management of bureaucratic and administrative aspects. Buddy: management and supervision of all the activities foreseen in the agenda, support to the defender in establishing what are the objectives of the stay, identification of possible trainings, courses, activities for the host, creation of networking opportunities, planning of medical- psychological support services.

RETURN AND MONITORING	<ul> <li><u>Return:</u> Personalized return plans organized in collaboration with the guest, his/her community, the referring Basque organization, the collective ANSUR and CEAR Euskadi.</li> <li><u>Monitoring:</u> <ol> <li>Preparation of documents, letters and press releases addressed to institutions, international organizations and civil society;</li> <li>Parliamentary delegation in the country of origin of the defender with the aim of monitoring the general condition of the person, strengthening the safety networks and highlighting the political support of the Basque government and the organizations of the "Red de apoyo";</li> <li>Constant communication by the referring Basque organization with the guest.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	Return:it must take place independently without accompaniment from the Dutch organizations.Monitoring:After 6 months from the end of the stay, the hosted person is contacted by J&P for an interview to evaluate the effectiveness of the program and the 
COLLABORATION S WITH OTHER PRORAMMES/NET WORKS	<ul> <li>The Basque model is part of a network of temporary relocation programmes that includes:</li> <li>1. The "Programa Asturiano de Atención a Víctimas de la Violencia en Colombia"</li> <li>2. The "Programa Català de Protecció a defensors i d</li> <li>3. Defensores dels Drets Humans"</li> <li>4. The "Programa Valenciano de Protección Integral y de Acogida de Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos"</li> <li>5. The "Programa municipal Barcelona protegeix periodistes de Mèxic"</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The Dutch Shelter City are part of an international network that includes:</li> <li>1. Georgia Shelter City</li> <li>2. Tanzania Shelter City</li> <li>3. Benin Shelter City</li> <li>4. Costa Rica Shelter City</li> </ul>

		Number of men and women that applied:	Number of men and women that applied:
		- Data not provided	- Period: 2014 – 2018
		Number of man and women that participated to the	- Men: 846
		programme:	- Women: 278
		- Period: 2011 – 2020	- Transgender/other: 33
		- Men: 9	
		- Women: 15	
		Number of people that identify themselves as LGTBQI and that participated to the programme:	Number of man and women that participated to the
		- Data not provided	programme:
	/		- Period: 2012 – 2019
OTHER GENDER	DATA/		- Men: 59
STATISTIC			- Women: 43
			- Transgender/other: 2
			Number of people that identify themselves as LGTBQI and that participated to the programme:
			- Period: 2014 – 2019
			- Gay: 1
			- Lesbian: 2
			- Transgender/others: 2

## 3. THE PROGRAMME "JOURNALISTS IN RESIDENCE" – EUROPEAN CENTRE FOR PRESS AND MEDIA FREEDOM

The programme "Journalists-in-Residence" (JIR) began in 2015 as an initiative of the European Centre for Press and Media Freedom<sup>212</sup> (ECPMF) based in Leipzig, Germany. The goal of the programme consists in offering temporary asylum to the journalists from both the member states and the candidate states of the Council of Europe that live in a situation of violence and intimidation as a direct consequence of their job. The asylum length varies between three and six months, depending on the preference of the protected journalist, and it includes a safe place for resting, keep working without pressures and censorship and constructing solidarity networks. The JIR programme is part of the Media Freedom Rapid Response<sup>213</sup> (MFRR), which is a mechanism for the press and media rights' violation tracking, protection, and monitoring within the framework of the Council of Europe. The MFRR was created by a group of organisations committed in the defence of the job of journalists and all the communication professionals, and it begins its activity in 2020 thanks to the activity several organisations and institutions: ECPMF, "Article 19<sup>214</sup>", "European Federation of Journalists <sup>215</sup>", "Free Press Unlimited <sup>216</sup>", "Institute for Applied Informatics<sup>217</sup>" of the Leipzig University, "International Press Institute<sup>218</sup>" and Osservatorio Balcani Caucaso<sup>219</sup>, besides from the financial support of the European Commission. Since the beginning of its activity, the JIR has hosted nine women, eight men and one transgender individual.

Besides the JIR programme, the ECPMF offers other services<sup>220</sup> directed to the media and communication professionals:

- Internships, language and formation courses, legal and psychologic support to the exiled or expatriated journalists in Germany;

- Economic support for the journalists in Germany for the purchase of technical material for personal protection, such as bulletproof vests, private bodyguards and video surveillance systems;

- Formation and support for the project coordinators that work with journalists in exile or under threat in Germany;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> The ECPMF is a non-profit organisation funded in 2015. It follows the European Charter on Freedom of the Press and the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union for the press and media rights defence and the support of the journalists and communication and media professionals. Website, https://www.ecpmf.eu/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> The activity of MRFF includes the direct support to journalists and operators through emergency funds, temporary residences, trainings and legal support, the monitoring and data collection about the press and media rights' violations in Europe, advocacy and diffusion of reports, documents and publications. Website, www.mrff.eu
<sup>214</sup> Article 19 is an international organisation funded in 1987 in the UK with the goal of defending, supporting and promoting the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Article 19 is an international organisation funded in 1987 in the UK with the goal of defending, supporting and promoting the press, expression and media rights. Website, https://www.article19.org/
<sup>215</sup> The European Federation of Journalists was born in 1994 and it is based in Brussels. It is the biggest European organisation of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> The European Federation of Journalists was born in 1994 and it is based in Brussels. It is the biggest European organisation of journalists. Website, https://europeanjournalists.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Free Press Unlimited is an NGO funded in 2011 based in Amsterdam that works for the defence and the promotion of journalists and their job in more than 40 countries across the world. Website, https://www.freepressunlimited.org/en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Institute for Applied Informatics is a non-profit association born in 2006 and linked to the Leipzig University which goal is promoting the informatic science and research. Website, https://infai.org/en/
<sup>218</sup> International Press Institute is a NGO funded in 1950 that operates for the defence and the promotion of the press freedom in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> International Press Institute is a NGO funded in 1950 that operates for the defence and the promotion of the press freedom in the world. Website, https://ipi.media/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> The Osservatorio Balcani Caucaso is a think tank born in 2000 with its focus on South-Est Europe, Turkey, and Caucasus. It explores the social, political and cultural transformations of six members of the European Union, seven countries that participate to the Enlargement process of the European Union, and of most of the post-soviet Europe involved in the European Neighbourhood Policy. Website, https://www.balcanicaucaso.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> For information and in-depth analysis on the offered services, check the link at the webpage https://www.ecpmf.eu/ecpmfsupports-media-professionals-under-threat-and-in-exile-in-germany/

- Report of denunciations and testimonies of female communication and media workers victims of threats, harassments, and violence due to their job named "Women's Reporting Point<sup>221</sup>".

# 3.1 The context

The ECPMF was established as a pan European journalistic organisation, which fundamental purposes are the monitoring of the application of the "European Charter for the press freedom" (2009)<sup>222</sup>, and the construction of actions and activities for opposing the attacks against journalists and press and expression freedoms. The idea of the creation of the European Charter for the press freedom arose in 2007 during a meeting between the European Commissioner Viviane Reding and nine European newspaper editors<sup>223</sup>. These meetings are organised on an annual basis; they began in 2005 on the will of the European Commission's media and communication task force<sup>224</sup>, with the intention of monitoring and evaluating the impact of the Commission initiatives on the press freedom<sup>225</sup>. Therefore, 48 editors and important journalists from 19 countries gathered in Hamburg on the 25<sup>th</sup> May 2009 to sign and adopt the European Charter for press freedom. The latter is a non-binding document composed of 10 articles that defines the press freedom's principles, declaring the necessary independence of the press from governmental interferences, especially from what concerns the phone interceptions and office searches. Besides, the charter reiterates the importance of free access to all the national and international sources of information by journalists and citizens. The Charter was delivered to the European Commission in Brussels on the 9<sup>th</sup> June 209 and the European Council in Luxemburg on the 26<sup>th</sup> October 2009 to transform it as a reference for all the evaluations and monitoring on the activities proposed by these two institutions.

## 3.2 The involved actors

The JiR programme works along with different local and national organisations for offering an always better quality of services and opportunities for the people hosted in the project. While the ECPMF represents the official and only coordinator of the whole project, it is accompanied by:

- A team of psychologists and psychiatrists from Leipzig responsible for the management the psychological support to the guests;
- An estate agency appointed to identify the best housing solution for each shift of the programme;
- The local media, which are invited to collaborate with the guests;
- Experts in different sectors, such as digital security, reportage techniques, etc;
- A law firms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> For more information on Women's Reporting Point check the website https://www.ecpmf.eu/support-programmes/womens-reporting-point/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> European Charter on Freedom for the Press; see appendix XIX

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> The participating editors were: Ms Béatrice Delvaux (Le Soir), Mr Hans-Ulrich Jorges (Stern), Mr Michael Fleischhacker (Die Presse), Ms Venelina Gocheva (24 Chasa), Mr Razvan Ionescu (Evenimentul Zilei), Mr Janez Markeš (Weekly Mag), Mr Bart Sturtewagen (De Standaard), Mr Dan Cristian Turturica (Romania Libera) and Mr Xavier Vidal-Folch (El Pais). Source : https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP 07 713

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> For additional information: https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/policies/media-freedom-and-pluralism

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Commissioner Reding welcomes New European Charter on Freedom of the Press,

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP\_09\_891

The JiR programme collaborates with other temporary hospitality projects active in Germany both for the exchange of knowledge and good practices, and to report cases of people in danger. At the beginning of 2020, the JiR programme's manager Stephanie Kock <sup>226</sup> invited the representatives of some of these projects for creating a specific workgroup on the development of working strategies with the journalists traumatized due to their activity.

# 3.3 The selection of participants

The selection of participants occurs through an open announcement posted on the ECPMF website once or twice per year, depending on the funds made available by the donors. The applications can be sent both from the individuals concerned (in this case it is required the compilation of an online formulary and a questionnaire to be consigned along with a CV and identity card copies) and from organisations that belong to the ECPMF's network. In the latter case, the organisations will have to provide a detailed description of the concerned person, along with his/her identity document as well as some journalistic writings that proof the professionality of the candidate. The applications are analysed by the manager of the JiR programme together with one or more colleagues, to come up with a shortlist of suitable candidates that will be sent to the ECPMF Executive Committee which will choose the participants of the project. Normally, the number of host fellowships available per project shift is three.

The requirements for taking part in the JiR programme:

- 1) Being resident in either a member state or a candidate state of the European Council<sup>227</sup>;
- 2) Having a valid passport;
- 3) Owning references and documentation regarding the activity either as a journalist or communication operator;
- 4) Owning documentation that attests the situation of danger and threat and the lack of support and the local institutions;
- 5) Having at least an A2 language level in either English or German.

## 3.4 The activities

During the permanence in Leipzig, the programme proposes services and activities useful for both the enforcement of the knowledge and competence of the hosted person and his/her psycho-physic health. The opportunities offered by the JiR programme are:

- 1) Resting and wellness: it is offered psychological support and trauma therapy. These are facultative activities, available on request of the hosted person;
- 2) The enforcement of competences: German language course preparatory both to the other activities and the integration of the person into the social and cultural German context; facultative English language course; training on specific activities linked to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> For the complete interview to Stephanie Koch, see: Appendix XVIII

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> The member states of the European Council are 47: Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Cyprus, Croatia, Denmark, Estonia, North Macedonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Moldavia, Monaco, Montenegro, Norway, Netherlands, Poland, Portugal, United Kingdom, Czech Republic, Romania, Russian Federation, San Marino, Serbia, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, Ukraine and Hungary. Source : https://www.coe.int/it/web/about-us/our-member-states

journalism and media communication, such as digital security, social media management and mobile reporting;

3) The creation of new networks and collaborations: the hosted person may ask to collaborate with the ECPMF team to the implementation of one or more projects

# 3.5 The Journalists-in-residence programme at the time of COVID-19

The COVID-19 pandemic caused many changes and issues to the JiR programme and its organisers. Some of the host fellowships available for the second semester of 2020 have been cancelled, whereas others have been prolonged since two persons arrived in Germany in February and March are still in Leipzig without the possibility of going back to their countries<sup>228</sup>. The main activities, especially those regarding the formation field, have been conducted online, allowing a partial continuation of the programme. During the weeks of lockdown, the person in charge has remained in constant contact with the two guests, to verify that their psychological and physical conditions were under control.

## 3.6 The support during the permanence

## **Reference figures**

The JiR programme establishes that the entire management of the project (both the administrational and organisational aspects) shall be borne exclusively by the Project Manager, including the organisation of the travels. This position is also in charge of managing the daily and social aspects of the temporary permanence and interacting with the programme's partners and donors.

## **Practical aspects**

The JiR offers to the people involved in the programme a safe and careful location in which to rest and continue with their job of investigation and publication. During their stay, adequate spaces and resources are therefore made available to achieve these objectives. Regarding the practical aspects one can identify:

- The accommodation: a completely furnished, careful, safe and tranquil flat well connected with the points of interest of the city;
- The workplace: the programme guarantees an optional workplace within the ECPMF offices, including the opportunity of collaborating (pro bono) with the communication team of the centre;
- The livelihood/pocket money: the hosted person receives a 1000 euro per month salary to cover all the extra costs not considered by the programme;
- Private Medical insurance.

# Funds and budget

According to Stephanie Kock<sup>229</sup>, the JiR programme has an average monthly cost of 2200 euro each hosted person of which the pocket money and the rent of the flat represent the most expensive purchases, followed by the activity and administrational costs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> This information is updated as of 24 July 2020. See: Appendix XVIII

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> For the complete interview to Stephanie Koch, see appendix XVIII

The programme benefits from the financing of four different donors, that contribute to supporting the project with a variable quote agreed each year. Nonetheless, the financing has not decreased significantly during the last years, allowing so far perfect and complete conduction of all the offered activities and services.

The main financiers of the JiR programme are the following:

- 1) The National Endowment for Democracy fund (NED)<sup>230</sup>;
- 2) The European Commission;
- 3) The city of Leipzig;
- 4) The Free State of Saxony

Other institutions collaborate to the economic sustain of ECPMF and its projects: Media Foundation of Sparkasse Leipzig<sup>231</sup>; Open Society Foundations<sup>232</sup>; Free Press Unlimited<sup>233</sup>; Lions Leipzig Football Club.

## 3.7 The return to the country of origin

The phase of the returning and the following maintaining contacts and relationships with the guests are discussed during the whole period of hospitality. Indeed, importance is given to the continuation of the collaboration and communication between the ex-participants and the ECPMF staff during the years after the end of the programme. After the conclusion of the period of hospitality, each guest remains in contact with the ECPMF staff via e-mail. In this way, links regarding training and events organised by other associations, as well as individual stories of other beneficiaries of the programme can be shared. Optionally, the guest may join the alumni network<sup>234</sup>, which allows the participation to workshops and training organised by ECPMF. As an additional service and depending on the number of funds and the remaining budget, it may be offered the continuation of the psychological support by phone or video calls to permit a further help during the difficult management of the return to the home country.

## 3.8 The programme Journalists in Residence Milano

During the second semester of 2020, on the initiative of ECPMF, QCode Mag<sup>235</sup> supported by the Osservatorio Balcani Caucaso has organised and publicly presented the programme "Journalists in Residence Milan". This initiative, like the one in Leipzig, is part of the MFRR's press and expression rights protection and monitoring mechanism.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> The National Endowment for Democracy (NED) is a private non-profit foundation dedicated to the growth and empowerment of the democratic institutions along the world. NED distributes more than 1.600 subsidies each year for sustaining the projects of nongovernmental groups that work abroad for the achievement of democracy in more than 90 countries. Website, https://www.ned.org/ <sup>231</sup> The main goal of the Media Foundation of Sparkasse Leipzig is promoting the instruction and formation of the youth in the field of media. This includes the appointment of scholarships, for instance in the framework of the Leipzig price for Media, the financing of specific projects and the organisation of political education events for commemorates the events of 1989 in Leipzig. Website, https://www.leipziger-medienstiftung.de/en/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Open Society Foundations are a group of foundations funded by George Soros. They are the world biggest private financier of independent groups that work for justice, democratic governance and human rights. They supply thousands of subsidies each year through a network of foundations and national and international offices, financing a wide range of projects, many of which are modified by the challenge of the COVID-19 pandemic. Website, https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Free Press United is a non-governmental organisation funded in 2011 based in Amsterdam. It works in more than 40 countries in the world for the defence and promotion of journalists and their job. Website, https://www.freepressunlimited.org/en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> For more information on the JiR alumni's network, check the link at the webpage https://www.ecpmf.eu/archive/help-for-journalists/journalists-in-residence/alumni.html
<sup>235</sup> Q Code Mag is a news organisation born in 2013 that believes in the deepening, in the slow reading, in the narrative journalism,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Q Code Mag is a news organisation born in 2013 that believes in the deepening, in the slow reading, in the narrative journalism, in the quality of multimedia, in the charm of the "geo-poetic". Q Code Mag was born for analysing and telling stories and people about international themes. Website, https://www.qcodemag.it/

The main goal of the programme is offering a temporary residence of three or four months long to two journalists and media operators that are in a situation of danger, threat or intimidation in which to rest, recover and continue with their job in a safe ambient. The programme was initially thought as an international temporary protection programme. However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic impact on the freedom of travelling between states and the impossibility of foreseeing the future situation in Italy, the first edition of JiR Milan in October 2020 has opened only to the people with any nationality who work and have been living in Italy for at least 3 months. The candidate selection is managed by QCode Mag in collaboration with the other partners of the project, and special attention is given to projects of investigative journalism.

In the same way as the Leipzig project, JiR Milan aims to the construction of a support programme designed on the needs and professional story of the hosted person. Among the activities, services and costs of the project, one can identify:

- The temporary transfer (three or four months) in Milan;
- The total cover of the accommodation costs;
- The financial support;
- Digital security consultancy;
- Legal protection instruments consultancy;
- Psychological support;
- Professional consultancy in different fields (access to information and data, protection of the sources, data management, long-form, cross-media, web-doc, video, audio-doc, books, data visualisation);
- Italian course;
- Development of a possible plan of public visibility: publication of the opera of the beneficiary, conferences, webinar, online formation, meeting with students in schools, collaboration with media and the Milan's Press Circle<sup>236</sup>.

The JiR Milan programme is financed by ECPMF and considers an identical budget from the one esteemed for the hospitality in Leipzig equal to 2200 euros per month per hosted person, which includes the accommodation cost and the pocket money. The programme does not consider any extra working place external from the accommodation where the person will live during his/her permanence. As the representative Christian Elia<sup>237</sup> explains, the programme counts on numerous local and national actors involved in the protection management of the selected people, dividing duties and responsibilities according to the capacities and possibilities of each one:

- QCode Mag deals with the general management of the programme, from the logistic to the selection of the candidates' shortlist, from the activity of networking to the political agenda;
- ECPMF is the promoter and financer of the JiR Milan programme. It supports and cooperates in project management.
- NAGA Association<sup>238</sup> is responsible for the psychological and medical support;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Journalists-in-residence Milan, https://www.qcodemag.it/mondo/europa/journalists-in-residence-milan/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> For the interview to Christian Elia, see appendix XX

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Naga is a laic, non-party, private and independent which was born in Milan in 1987. More than 4000 volunteers of the organisation guarantee free sanitary, legal and social support to regular and irregular immigrants, Roma and Sinti people, asylum

- Human Rights Festival collaborates with the construction of activities and advocacy actions;
- Investigative Reporting Project Italy<sup>239</sup> makes available technology and competences concerning the cybersecurity and it deals with forming the hosted people on this theme;
- Italian Coalition on Freedom and Rights<sup>240</sup> collaborates in the construction of national and international networking opportunities;
- Data Ninja<sup>241</sup> makes available its services and competences in data collection and visualisation offering formation courses.

Following the programme termination is not expected (at least for the first edition) the return of the subjects of the programme to their home-countries since they need to be resident in Italy. The JiR Milan's guests can remain in strict contact with the organisers at both the professional and personal level thanks to the development of a specific journalistic project shared between Qcode Mag and the beneficiaries.

SCHEDA DIFENSORA #4 Name: Anna Artemeva Profession: photo reporter for Novaya Gazeta Country of origin: Russia Temporary hospitality programme: Journalists in Residence – Leipzig Year: 2020 Specialisation: Press freedom and human rights For the complete sheet, see appendix XII For the complete interview, see appendix XIX

seekers, refugees and torture victims. Further, Naga carries on formation, denounce, documentation and lobbying activities on the institutions. All the services offered by the association are free and conducted by not-retributed volunteers. Website, http://naga.it/<sup>239</sup> The Investigative Reporting Project Italy (IRPI) is an association of social promotion that promotes and develops all the forms of investigative journalism collaborating with Italian and international networks of journalists, activists and citizens. Website, https://irpi.eu/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Born in 2014, The Italian Coalition on Freedom and Rights (CILD) is a network of organisations from civil society that works for defending and promoting the rights and freedom of all the subjects, unifying activities of advocacy, public campaigns and legal actions. Website, https://cild.eu/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> Data Ninja is a data-driven company born from a workgroup based in Italy and active in Europe since 2012. It constructs and supports projects for the data divulgation and dissemination, with strategic partnerships in Italy and Europe. Website, https://www.dataninja.it/it/

#### **3.9 SCHOLARS AT RISK TRENTO**

The network Scholars at Risk<sup>242</sup> (SAR), born within the University of Chicago in 1999, with current headquarter at the New York University, is an international network of universities founded by academics and human rights defenders interested in promoting the academic freedom and protecting the academics either in danger of life or whose activity of job and teaching is seriously compromised. The main activities of the network are:

- The protection of scholars at risk through the temporary relocation abroad to allow the hosted person to rest and keep working in a tranquil and safe environment;

- Advocacy by monitoring and organizing and supporting campaigns to raise awareness and defense against the attacks and inappropriate pressures faced by the academic community, and the promotion of events and spaces of discussion about academic freedom;

- The promotion and organization of spaces and discussions on topics of academic freedoms at the global and regional level.

In 2018 also the University of Trento officially joined the network giving birth, together with the University of Padua, to the Italian section of SAR in February 2019. In August 2019 the first SAR-Unitrento call for applications is opened thanks to a co-funding from the Autonomous Province of Trento through the Education University and Culture Department. In January 2020 the first edition of the protection program for academics in Italy begins with the arrival in Trento of a Cameroonian philosopher and a Yemeni biologist-agronomist. The duration of the research grants provided to them is 12 months, with the possibility of an extension of further 12 months in the chance that new funds are allocated even from different financiers. Besides, the hosted person's tutor must guarantee the regular performance of the activities planned for the first year of work.

#### 3.10 The involved actors

- Scholars at Risk Italy: the University of Trento coordinates its activity with the Italian national pole of Scholar at Risk Italy<sup>243</sup> which currently consists of 28 universities and research centres<sup>244</sup> that operate in the country; further, the national pole is structured upon a National Coordination (Trento and Padua) and an executive (Trento, Padua, Trieste, Scuola Normale Superiore, Cagliari). The coordination, the executive and the network are important for involving the scholars at risk in the scientific activities of other universities (seminars, lectures, conferences, research groups) as well as for creating the opportunities for the researchers involved in relocation programmes in different Italian cities to meet among themselves.

- Scholars at Risk International (New York office): The University of Trento relates to the SAR International's Protection Office in NY. The latter supplies the universities with various functions: it provides a list of anonymous profile for a first evaluation and selection to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Scholars at Risk, website https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/

<sup>243</sup> Scholars at Risk Italia, website https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/sections/sar-italy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> The members of the Italian Pole of SAR are: Università di Udine, European University Institute, UniNettuno, Università di Bologna, Magna Charta Observatory, Scuola Superiore di Catania, Società Italiana della Storiche, Scuola Normale Superiore, Università di Brescia, Università di Cagliari, Università di Macerata, Università degli studi di Milano, Università di Padova, Università di Pavia, Sapienza Università di Roma, Università di Siena, Università di Trento, Università di Trieste, Università di Torino, Università di Verona, Università di Genova, Università di Pisa, Scuola Internazionale Superiore di Studi Avanzati e Università Ca' Foscari di Venezia.

universities which want to host scholars; assistance during the selection process; monitoring and support during the fellowship period; support during the relocation process in another university when the protection programme in the receiving university is terminated.

- University of Trento: the SAR protection programme at the University of Trento – as all the other activities of SAR (advocacy, formation) – are organised within the Equity & Diversity Office<sup>245</sup>, specifically, they are part of the dean's mandate to the International and academic Solidarity, dispatched to the associated professor at DSRS Ester Gallo since 2019.

The mandate includes both the activities of SAR, those related to the implementation of the UNHRC's Inclusive University Manifesto<sup>246</sup>, and the activities connected to the Rete Delle Università Italiane per la Pace<sup>247</sup> (Network of Italian Universities for peace). Currently, The Equity & Diversity Office (E&D) is constituting a "Tavolo di Lavoro per I Progetti Rifugiati e SAR – Studiosi a Rischio"<sup>248</sup> (Working group for the Refugees Projects and SAR – Scholars at Risk) that include the following offices: Dean Office, Equity & Diversity Office, Internationalisation Office, Human Resources and Organisation Office – Reception Office, Real Estate Management for the logistical aspects of receiving scholars, External Relations Communication Department, Didactic Direction and Student Services.

- Autonomous Province of Trento – Instruction University and Culture department: it collaborates to the SAR's protection programme as a donor.

#### 3.11 The selection of candidates

According to the SAR Trento hosting program, the selection of research grant recipients is carried out through a multidisciplinary open call, which involved all the 13 academic structures, and it is published on the University of Trento website. The time window for the submission of applications is approximately one month and the requirements for eligibility are:

- 1. Being a foreign citizen in one of the following positions:
  - a. Being recognized as a refugee in Italy or another member state of the European Union;
  - b. Recognition of the right of subsidiary protection in Italy or another member state of the European Union
  - c. Active application for either asylum or subsidiary protection in Italy or another member state of the European Union, and being recognized as a "Scholar at Risk" by SAR (SAR-status)
  - d. Being in Italy or another member state of the European Union and being recognized as a "scholar at risk" by SAR<sup>249</sup>;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Ufficio Equità e Diversità UniTN, https://www.unitn.it/ateneo/52060/equitadiversita

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> UNHCR Manifesto of the inclusive university, https://www.unhcr.it/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/Manifesto-dellUniversitainclusiva\_UNHCR.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> RuniPace, https://www.runipace.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> For further information: UniTrento per i rifugiati e gli studiosi a rischio. Intervista a Barbara Poggio, prorettrice alle Politiche di equità e diversità https://webmagazine.unitn.it/internazionale/82725/unitrento-per-i-rifugiati-e-gli-studiosi-a-rischio

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> For the recognition of a persons as a "scholar at risk", the University of Trento relies on SAR International and does not evaluate nor produce certifications in this sense. The same applies to the other universities. However, in the evaluation of the applications, the recognition of international protection at the Italian and Euopean level is considered. Further information, (SAR, 2019) "How to host. A handbook for higher Education Partners", pag. 15.

- e. Holding the residence in countries not members of the European Union and being recognized as a "scholar at risk" by SAR<sup>250</sup>.
- 2. Holding the academic title of PhD in the scientific sector similar to the research activity at the centre of the collaboration, obtained at an Italian or foreign university or an equivalent title obtained abroad;
- 3. For who is a citizen of a state not-member of the European Union, or with which the EU stipulated agreements of free movement, to have required or to hold of a regular residence permit for working that will cover the entire duration of the research grant (this requisite is not required for the participation to the selection); the lack of possession of the residence permit at the signing of the contract determines the forfeiture of the right to sign it;
- 4. Holding a scientific-professional curriculum suitable for conducting research activities described in article 1<sup>251</sup>;
- 5. Knowing the English language at a professional level, both written and talked.

The applications are sent directly by the people interested in the programme, attaching to the online application their project proposal, that needs to be included in one of the 14 scientific-disciplinary areas listed in the call's article 1<sup>252</sup>. Besides the research project, the candidate needs to send:

- 1. A scientific-professional curriculum in the European format (Europass);
- 2. The list of publications, certificates and any other title considered useful for verifying the candidates' qualification regarding the selection;
- 3. Only for the candidates that obtained the PhD abroad: certificate of the final examination of doctorate;
- 4. Photostatic copy of the identity document or any other identification document.

Successively to the closure of the period for sending the applications the commission nominated by the Dean of the University of Trento will begin the evaluation of the applications, which is conducted by analysis and confrontation of the presented curriculum and title, as well as the research projects and one potential oral interview via Skype regarding the topic of the project research. After the conclusion of the process of selecting the ranking is published on the University of Trento website; for security reasons, the names and the countries of origin are not entirely reported.

## 3.12 The activities

The main activities offered by the protection programme of SAR are connected to the academic work of the hosted people, such as seminars, workshops, public meetings with the citizenry,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> The candidates that are included in one of the categories indicated above as a. b. and c. must include in the application the documentation that recognise the request of the status of refugee or of the right of subsidiary protection. The candidates that are included in one of the categories indicated above as c. d. and e. must indicate in the CV to hold the status of "scholar at risk" recognised by SAR. Once that the call is closed, the judging commission will ask the documentation regarding the candidate's profile (SAR packet) to SAR for verifying the situation of risk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> UniTn, call for the selection of 2 grants of collaboration and research,

https://web.unitn.it/files/download/59165/bando\_da\_pubb.\_fto.pdf, pag. 12

lectures at the University of Trento. The network SAR Italia has an important role in the individuation and creation of formation opportunities, both at the national and international level.

# 3.13 The programme during the COVID-19 pandemic

The COVID-19 pandemic heavily affected the protection programme of SAR since it has complicated the implementation of the project at both the administrative and human and working levels. The prolonged delays in the releasement of the residence permits for the hosted people and on the obtaining of the visa for the familiar reunifications worsened the already difficult situation due to the closure of the European and International borders.

The quarantine of the scholars, begun since the very first days after their arrival did not allow the development of any working relationship nor friendship in the new city, creating a difficult situation for both the hosted people and the organizers of the project. A problem that has now been partially resolved, is the one related to the access to the university infrastructures as libraries and laboratories, essential for the work of the hosted people.

# 3.14 The support during the permanence

## Role models

The programme by SAR establishes that responsibilities and tasks regarding the management of the project are divided among different figures, which are:

- University SAR Coordinator: he/she follows the programme implementation from a contractual point of view, as well as the renewal of funds at central (university) and local level (PAT, Municipality, Private Foundations); he/she represents the contact person for the scholars in case of problems or emergencies by contacting the interested offices especially during the first months after the scholar's arrival; he/she coordinates with the SAR representatives of the single departments regarding the scholars' performance; he/she informs SAR Italy and SAR International about the project's evolution and for receiving feedback. In case of absence of one the collaborators, he/she might help in needs and daily tasks such as accompanying the hosted people to the police station or the bank.

- SAR Representative of the Academic structure: The University of Trento is divided into 13 academic structures among departments, specialistic schools and research centers. Each structure has nominated a SAR representative, who deals with following: the selection process by being part of an interdepartmental selection commission; the administrative procedures for contracts, the issue of digital signatures and university badges introducing the scholars to the colleagues of the department.

- Academic tutor: he/she usually comes from the same structure as the representative, and his/her field of academic interest is like one of the protected scholars. He/she monitors the scholar's activities, he/she follows the procedures for the renewal of the second year asking for a report of research, he/she supports the scholar in the laboratory or research work.

- 150 hours student<sup>253</sup>: he/she supports the integration of the hosted people within the university, he/she helps in the management of the daily need external from the academic work and accompanies the scholars in the city.

### **Practical aspects**

The SAR Trento programme provides that adequate spaces and resources are made available to the host during the stay for the correct development of the program and the achievement of its objectives. The followings are included in the practical aspects:

- The accommodation: The University of Trento offers for the entire duration of the research grant accommodation for free within the university residences.

- The working space: it is offered a working space in an office shared with other colleagues within the hosting university structure. For the scholars involved in researches related to the STEM disciplines<sup>254</sup>, it is offered a further workspace in the laboratories.

- The salary: the grant research provides the monthly supply of 1.830 euros net after the confirmation of the regular conduction of the planned work by the tutor;

- Medical insurance: The University of Trento covers the costs of the insurance for what concerns the accident and liability risk;

#### Funds and budget

According to the data furnished by Professor Ester Gallo, the budget needed for offering a research grant with the SAR programme varies among 35,000 and 45,000 euros per year. The main financiers of the 2019/2020 edition of the SAR programme in Trentino are:

- The Rettorato (Rectorate Office): it covers 50% of the costs and provides the university structures;

- Provincia Autonoma di Trento (Autonomous Province of Trento): it covers the 50% of the costs through the Instruction, University and Culture department.

## 3.15 The return to the country of origin

A protection programme managed by SAR International has an average duration of 5 years. According to the programme, at the end of the programme, it is activated a contact network with other universities in the same country or countries nearby is activated for the scholar's relocation in an area near to the national context of where they are. In Italy, the average duration of the research grant is between 12 and 26 months, indirectly placing the national centre of SAR Italia in a position of relevance in the relocation procedure of the hosted persons, as the need to expel the threatened person and his family usually does not resolve itself in a period less than 26 months.

To the present date<sup>255</sup>, the office of SAR Trento has not yet managed any return, since the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> The University of Trento selects among the students who are available to take part into part-time collaborations within the university structures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> STEM Disciplines: Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> December 2020

scholars who are participating in the first edition of the program have not yet completed their period of stay in Trento.

#### DEFENDER SHEET #5

Name: hidden name

Profession: Philosopher

Temporary relocation programme: temporary relocation programme for scholars- SAR Trento

Year: 2020

Specialisation: intercultural philosophy, body and disease philosophy, African philosophy

For the complete sheet, see appendix XII

#### WOMAN DEFENDER SHEET #6

Name: hidden name

Profession: Nutritional scientist

Country of origin: Yemen

*Temporary relocation programme*: temporary relocation programme for scholars– SAR Trento

Year: 2020

Specialisation: healing properties of the prickly pears, and nutritional science in general

For the complete sheet, see appendix XII

# 4. THE GUIDELINES FOR THE CREATION OF A "CITTÀ IN DIFESA DI" IN TRENTINO

In light of the research so far implemented with the precious collaboration of the people active in the execution of the temporary location models described in this text, and to the support of the organizations, associations and individuals active in Trentino and Italy for the creation of the project "Città in difesa di", here follow the guidelines for the creation in Trentino of a "Città in difesa di" for threatened women human rights defenders.

- 1. The suggested **duration** for an effective temporary relocation is **about 3 months**, with the possibility of extension in case of emergency and/or unexpected events, as adopted by the Dutch model of the Shelter City.
- 2. The **number of hosted people** during the same period **should be 2**, both to make the stay of the human rights defender less lonely and to simplify the achievement of the project's goal that consists in facilitating the contacts and the construction of relevant activities and opportunities agenda, as suggested by the temporary relocation programme Cear Euskadi active in the Basque country.
- 3. The choice of participants to the programme should consider the characteristics of the organizations and associations involved in the implementation temporary relocation programme in Trentino, for identifying the candidates whose origins, language and social-political background are somehow interconnected with the hosting organizations. The goal of this choice is to receive people coming from contexts already connected with the receiving organizations. This allows the programme to be more effective since the temporary relocation is set within a sensitive and aware context about the dynamics of the human rights defender's area of origin. In the construction and implementation of the agenda, the women human rights defenders will be able to encounter interlocutors that guarantee continuity to the attention towards the specific case, as suggested by the experience of the Cear Euskadi programme.
- 4. The presence of a **psycho-social**, **emotional**, and **relational support** services offered by a specialized staff, along with the medical team, must be considered an essential element of the programme, as verified in all the models included in the research.
- 5. The possibility of **recreational** and **relaxing optional activities** and opportunities is highly recommended for the well-being of the hosted people; good examples in this sense are the programmes Cear Euskadi and Shelter City.
- 6. The **agenda** of activities must consider **all the goals of the programme**, such as the rest and regeneration of the hosted person, the continuation of the job and the acquisition of new competencies and notions and the construction of an international network of contacts. The agenda must be personalized and created in close cooperation with the hosted person.

- 7. The **involvement of organizations**, **associations**, **education institute**, **and the citizenship**, given the widespread hospitality of the women human rights defenders, is of essential importance for the success of the project, as reported by both Cear Euskadi and Shelter City programme. In this sense, it is suggested to implement activities of preparation and/or sensitization of citizenship.
- 8. The involvement of the **local administrative and political institutions**, in the specific the city/village municipality interested to declare itself "Città in difesa di", is considered as a fundamental partnership and good practice emerged from all the examined projects, for the political recognition of the project, as well as for its financial support.
- 9. The **security protocol** must be personalized and judged on a case by case basis with the support of professionals from the civil, human rights and non-violence settings, as required by all the projects cited in this text. The experiences and good practices used by the Italian organizations and associations committed in peace-building activities can be a good starting point for the creation of a security protocol ad hoc for the project "Città in difesa di".
- 10. It is suggested the presence of a **role model** inspired to the "buddy" established by the Shelter City programme, who is in charge of taking care of the hosted people during the entire permanence, particularly for what regards the interaction and construction of relationships in the hosting city and the support in the understanding of the potential cultural differences.
- 11. Providing to the women human rights defenders a **monthly salary**, related to the cost of living, is recommendable since it permits to the hosted people to not entirely depend from the programme organizers, as highlighted by all the programmes considered in this research.
- 12. The **accommodation** must satisfy the necessities regarding the privacy, resting and working and therefore it must suitable if it is shared with other people, of a single bedroom, excellent internet connection and good connections towards the places considered most important during the stay.
- 13. By the end of the period of temporary relocation, it needs to be activated a process of support to the return of the hosted person in the country of origin and the monitoring of the situation, at least during the first six months. Further, it is recommended a constant and durable communication throughout this period.

The organizations and associations involved in the front line for the implementation of "Città in difesa di" programme in Trentino are:

- Yaku: among the very first promoters of the project "Città in difesa di", Yaku was born in 2007 as an independent association that fights for the defense of the water and against the privatization of the common goods. Yaku conducts activities of international cooperation in Latin America with indigenous people, peasants and social organizations in the Andean area, especially in Bolivia and Colombia. In Italy, it contributes to the diffusion of a culture of the common goods and for social and environmental rights through educational projects.

- Forum Trentino per la Pace e per i Diritti Umani: this institution was born in 1991 thanks to the commitment of the Provincial Council of Trento, which decided to provide itself of an instrument for keep active the attention on topics related to peace, which need to be observed in a critical ad constant way to reflect on interventions and regulations. Some essential concepts that lead the activities of the Forum since years are human rights, solidarity, active citizenship, and responsibility. The Forum was strongly desired by the political world for putting in contact the different realities that daily work for improving their local context and the territories with which they have regular relationships and connections in Trentino.

- Centro per la Cooperazione Internazionale: it is a non-profit and independent association committed in the analysis, information, formation, and promotion of the knowledge about topics of international cooperation, European affair, peace and human rights. It promotes the coordination of initiatives and actors involved in the world of the international cooperation; it enhances the specificities of the local experiences and it facilitates their international diffusion, with particular attention to the regions of most interest in Trentino (Balkans, Mediterranean, Sub-Saharan Africa).

- Osservatorio Balcani Caucaso: Osservatorio Balcani Caucaso is a think tank that deals with South-East Europe, Turkey, and Caucasus, and it explores the social-political and cultural transformations of six European Union members, as well as of seven countries that participate into the Enlargement Process of the European Union and a good part of the post-Soviet Europe involved in the European Neighborhood Policy. Born in 2000 for satisfying the need of information and debate expressed by the civil society committed for the integration of the Balkans within the EU, OBC Trans Europe promotes the construction of a Europe from below developing transnational relationships and attracting the interest of the public opinion on key areas for numerous European challenges.

- PBI Italy: Peace Brigades International is a non-governmental non-party and nondenominational organization born in Canada in 1981 on the initiative of Gandhian-inspired non-violent activists. PBI Italy Onlus, one of the 15 national groups active in three continents, supports the projects on the field in Colombia, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, Kenya, Indonesia, and Nepal.

Among the activities of this organization, there are the encouragement of the civil society to activate itself for the respect of human rights, the formation of volunteers, fundraisings, the construction of a support network and the diffusion of information.

- Scholars at Risk: it is an international network of universities founded in 1999 at the Chicago University for promoting the academic freedom and protecting researchers under a situation of life in danger or impossibility to continue their job. The University of Trento joined the network in 2019, creating the Italian section of SAR along with the University of Padua. The first Italian programme for the protection of academics began in January 2020 with the reception of a Cameroonian philosopher and a Yemenite biologist-agronomist in Trento.

- Amnesty International Trento: the group of Trento is formed by people that decide to support Amnesty International and to dedicate part of their spare time to the human rights' defense. The Trentino group, as the other groups all around the world, essentially conducts two kinds of activities: activities of mobilization and sensitization at the local level, and activities of campaigning through signature collections on pleas.

During the writing of the guidelines, it has contributed the work of the Centro Studi Dlfesa Clvile of Rome, that although it is not a member of the Trentino hub of the Rete in Difesa di, it has participated to the elaboration of the entire research.

#### REFERENCES

- Cear Euskadi, (2018) *Programa Vasco de Protección Temporal para defensores y defensoras de Derechos*, https://www.euskadi.eus/contenidos/informacion/documentos\_paz\_convivencia/es\_def/adju ntos/Programa-defensores.pdf

- Cear Euskadi, (2018) Proteger a quien defiende. https://defensoras.cear-euskadi.org/

- Commissione Affari esteri (2017), Risoluzione 7-01051, "Sulla tutela dei difensori dei diritti umani", https://aic.camera.it/aic/scheda.html?numero=7-01051&ramo=C&leg=17

- Council of Europe (2008), *Declaration on Council of Europe action to improve the protection of human rights defenders and promote their activities"* https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result details.aspx?ObjectID=09000016805d3e52

- Consiglio della Provincia Autonoma di Trento, (2018), *Testo integrale della mozione 190/2018 "Protezione dei difensori dei diritti umani"*, https://www.consiglio.provincia.tn.it/doc/IDAP\_881061.pdf?zid=d346d60c-767d-4418-88fe-dfde80d859a4

- Gobierno de Espana (2007), Real Decreto 1257/2007, de 21 de septiembre, por el que se aprueban las normas reguladoras de la concesión directa de ayudas a personas que se vean amenazadas o perseguidas por su actividad en defensa de los derechos humanos, en sus países de residencia habitual fuera de España, https://www.boe.es/buscar/doc.php?id=BOE-A-2007-17342

- Gobierno Vasco (2018), *IV Plan Director de Cooperación para el Desarrollo 2018-2021*, https://www.elankidetza.euskadi.eus/contenidos/noticia/aprobacion\_plan/es\_def/adjuntos/IV %20Plan%20Director\_versi%C3%B3n%20final%20CR-CG.pdf

- Gobierno Vasco (2017), *Plan de Convivencia y Derechos Humanos 2017-2020*, https://www.irekia.euskadi.eus/uploads/attachments/9389/Plan\_de\_Convivencia\_y\_DDHH\_. pdf

- Justice & Peace, (2019), *How to set up a Shelter City*, https://sheltercity.nl/en/shelter-city-manual/

- Justice & Peace, (2019), *Toolbox for Shelter City Mentors*, https://sheltercity.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/20190702-Toolbox-for-Shelter-City-Mentors.pdf

- Justice & Peace, (2016), *Shelter City in Georgia*, https://sheltercity.nl/en/tbilisi-and-batumi-georgia/

- Justice & Peace, (2017), *Shelter City in Tanzania and Benin*, https://sheltercity.nl/en/tanzania-and-benin/

- Justice & Peace, (2019), *Shelter City in Costa Rica*, https://sheltercity.nl/en/costa-rica-becomes-third-international-shelter-city-for-human-rights-defenders/

- MAECI (2016), Terzo Piano d'Azione Nazionale dell'Italia in attuazione della Risoluzione del Consiglio di Sicurezza delle Nazioni Unite 1325 (2000), http://cidu.esteri.it/resource/2016/12/49124\_f\_Piano132520162019.pdf - Ministry of Foreign Affairs the Netherlands, (2019), *Updated international human rights policy: activities and results,* https://www.government.nl/documents/reports/2019/10/22/human-rights-report-2018

- United Nations (2019), *Resolution of the Security Council S/RES/2493*, http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/doc/2493

- United Nations (2014), Resolution of the Security Council A/HRC/25/L.2/Rev.1 *Freedom of opinion and expression: mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression*, https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/LTD/G14/123/41/PDF/G1412341.pdf?OpenElement

- United Nations (2013), Report of the 68<sup>th</sup> session of the Third Commission A/68/456/Add.2, 10 December 2013, *Promotion of the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,* https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/265291

- United Nations (2004), OHCHR. Human Rights Defenders: Protecting the Right to Defend Human Rights. Fact Sheet No. 29, https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/FactSheet29en.pdf

- United Nations (2000), Resolution of the Human Rights Commission E/CN.4/RES/2000/61 Human rights defenders - Commission on Human Rights, https://ap.ohchr.org/documents/alldocs.aspx?doc\_id=4764

- United Nations (2000), General Assembly Resolution S/RES/1325 (2000), Women, Peace and Security, Unite (2000), Risoluzione Assemblea Generale S/RES/1325 (2000), *Women, Peace and Security,* https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N00/720/18/PDF/N0072018.pdf?OpenElement

- United Nations (2000), *Landmark resolution on Women, Peace and Security*, https://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/wps/#resolution

- United Nations (1999), General Assembly Resolution A/RES/53/144, 8 March 1999, Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, https://undocs.org/en/A/RES/53/144

- United Nations (1999), *Declaration on Human Rights Defenders,* https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Defenders/Declaration/Dichiarazione\_delle\_NU\_s ui\_Difensori\_DU.pdf

- United Nations (1998), Report of the 53eth session of the Third Commission A/53/625/Add.2, 30 November 1998, Human rights questions: human rights questions, including alternative approaches for improving the effective enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms, https://undocs.org/en/A/53/625/Add.2

- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (2020), Implementing the Women, Peace and Security Agenda in the OSCE Region, https://www.osce.org/secretariat/444577?download=true

- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, (2014), *Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders*, https://www.osce.org/it/node/384705?download=true

- Eugenia Siapera, (2015) Forum per la pace e i diritti umani Trentino, (2015) *Building a safety net for European Journalists*, https://www.balcanicaucaso.org/eng/Media-Freedom-Net/Building-a-Safety-Net-for-European-Journalists2

- Protect Defenders, (2020), About us, https://www.protectdefenders.eu/en/index.html

- Scholars at Risk (2019), *How to Host. A handbook for higher education partners.* https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/resources/how-to-host-handbook/

- European Union (2004), *Ensuring protection – European Union Guidelines on Human Rights Defenders*, https://eeas.europa.eu/sites/eeas/files/eu\_guidelines\_hrd\_en.pdf

- University of York (2019), *The Barcelona Guidelines on Wellbeing and Temporary International Relocation of Human Rights Defenders at Risk*, https://static1.squarespace.com/static/58a1a2bb9f745664e6b41612/t/5de6a0d7ae38e01033 12349b/1575395544981/The+Barcelona+Guidelines+-+EN+%28Final%29.pdf

- Vallies, V. e Barrera, D. (2019), *La proteccion internacional de las personas en riesgo. Programas de acogida temporal en el exterior*. https://www.actionpeace.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/Fichas\_digital\_VF.pdf

#### ANNEX

ANNEX I: Declaration on human rights defenders - Declaration on the right and responsibility of individuals, groups and organs of society to promote and protect universally recognized human rights and fundamental freedoms.

Adopted by the United Nations General Assembly with Resolution 53/144, 8 March 1999.

The General Assembly,

*Reaffirming* the importance of the observance of the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations for the promotion and protection of all human rights and fundamental freedoms for all persons in all countries of the world,

*Reaffirming* also the importance of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenants on Human Rights as basic elements of international efforts to promote universal respect for and observance of human rights and fundamental freedoms and the importance of other human rights instruments adopted within the United Nations system, as well as those at the regional level,

*Stressing* that all members of the international community shall fulfil, jointly and separately, their solemn obligation to promote and encourage respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms for all without distinction of any kind, including distinctions based on race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, and reaffirming the particular importance of achieving international cooperation to fulfil this obligation according to the Charter,

Acknowledging the important role of international cooperation for, and the valuable work of individuals, groups and associations in contributing to, the effective elimination of all violations of human rights and fundamental freedoms of peoples and individuals, including in relation to mass, flagrant or systematic violations such as those resulting from apartheid, all forms of racial discrimination, colonialism, foreign domination or occupation, aggression or threats to national sovereignty, national unity or territorial integrity and from the refusal to recognize the right of peoples to self-determination and the right of every people to exercise full sovereignty over its wealth and natural resources,

*Recognizing* the relationship between international peace and security and the enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms, and mindful that the absence of international peace and security does not excuse non-compliance,

*Reiterating* that all human rights and fundamental freedoms are universal, indivisible, interdependent and interrelated and should be promoted and implemented in a fair and equitable manner, without prejudice to the implementation of each of those rights and freedoms,

*Stressing* that the prime responsibility and duty to promote and protect human rights and fundamental freedoms lie with the State,

*Recognizing* the right and the responsibility of individuals, groups and associations to promote respect for and foster knowledge of human rights and fundamental freedoms at the national and international levels,

Declares:

#### Article 1

Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to promote and to strive for the protection and realization of human rights and fundamental freedoms at the national and international levels.

#### Article 2

1. Each State has a prime responsibility and duty to protect, promote and implement all human rights and fundamental freedoms, inter alia, by adopting such steps as may be necessary to create all conditions necessary in the social, economic, political and other fields, as well as the legal guarantees required to ensure that all persons under its jurisdiction, individually and in association with others, are able to enjoy all those rights and freedoms in practice. 2. Each State shall adopt such legislative, administrative and other steps as may be necessary to ensure that the rights and freedoms referred to in the present Declaration are effectively guaranteed.

#### Article 3

Domestic law consistent with the Charter of the United Nations and other international obligations of the State in the field of human rights and fundamental freedoms is the juridical framework within which human rights and fundamental freedoms should be implemented and enjoyed and within which all activities referred to in the present Declaration for the promotion, protection and effective realization of those rights and freedoms should be conducted.

#### Article 4

Nothing in the present Declaration shall be construed as impairing or contradicting the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations or as restricting or derogating from the provisions of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenants on Human Rights and other 2.3 international instruments and commitments applicable in this field.

#### Article 5

For the purpose of promoting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms, everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, at the national and international levels: (a) To meet or assemble peacefully; (b) To form, join and participate in non-governmental organizations, associations or groups; (c) To communicate with non-governmental or intergovernmental organizations.

#### Article 6

Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others: (a) To know, seek, obtain, receive and hold information about all human rights and fundamental freedoms, including having access to information as to how those rights and freedoms are given effect in domestic legislative, judicial or administrative systems; (b) As provided for in human rights and other applicable international instruments, freely to publish, impart or disseminate to others views, information and knowledge on all human rights and fundamental freedoms; (c) To study, discuss, form and hold opinions on the observance, both in law and in practice, of all human rights and fundamental

freedoms and, through these and other appropriate means, to draw public attention to those matters.

#### Article 7

Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to develop and discuss new human rights ideas and principles and to advocate their acceptance.

#### Article 8

1. Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to have effective access, on a non-discriminatory basis, to participation in the government of his or her country and in the conduct of public affairs.

2. This includes, inter alia, the right, individually and in association with others, to submit to governmental bodies and agencies and organizations concerned with public affairs criticism and proposals for improving their functioning and to draw attention to any aspect of their work that may hinder or impede the promotion, protection and realization of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

#### Article 9

1. In the exercise of human rights and fundamental freedoms, including the promotion and protection of human rights as referred to in the present Declaration, everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to benefit from an effective remedy and to be protected in the event of the violation of those rights.

2. To this end, everyone whose rights or freedoms are allegedly violated has the right, either in person or through legally authorized representation, to complain to and have that complaint promptly reviewed in a public hearing before an independent, impartial and competent judicial or other authority established by law and to obtain from such an authority a decision, in accordance with law, providing redress, including any compensation due, where there has been a violation of that person's rights or freedoms, as well as enforcement of the eventual decision and award, all without undue delay.

3. To the same end, everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, inter alia: (a) To complain about the policies and actions of individual officials and governmental bodies with regard to violations of human rights and fundamental freedoms, by petition or other appropriate means, to competent domestic judicial, administrative or legislative authorities or any other competent authority provided for by the legal system of the State, which should render their decision on the complaint without undue delay; (b) To attend public hearings, proceedings and trials so as to form an opinion on their compliance with national law and applicable international obligations and commitments; (c) To offer and provide professionally qualified legal assistance or other relevant advice and assistance in defending human rights and fundamental freedoms.

4. To the same end, and in accordance with applicable international instruments and procedures, everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to unhindered access to and communication with international bodies with general or special competence to receive and consider communications on matters of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

5. The State shall conduct a prompt and impartial investigation or ensure that an inquiry takes place whenever there is reasonable ground to believe that a violation of human rights and fundamental freedoms has occurred in any territory under its jurisdiction.

#### Article 10

No one shall participate, by act or by failure to act where required, in violating human rights and fundamental freedoms and no one shall be subjected to punishment or adverse action of any kind for refusing to do so.

#### Article 11

Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to the lawful exercise of his or her occupation or profession. Everyone who, as a result of his or her profession, can affect the human dignity, human rights and fundamental freedoms of others should respect those rights and freedoms and comply with relevant national and international standards of occupational and professional conduct or ethics.

#### Article 12

1. Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to participate in peaceful activities against violations of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

2. The State shall take all necessary measures to ensure the protection by the competent authorities of everyone, individually and in association with others, against any violence, threats, retaliation, de facto or de jure adverse discrimination, pressure or any other arbitrary action as a consequence of his or her legitimate exercise of the rights referred to in the present Declaration.

3. In this connection, everyone is entitled, individually and in association with others, to be protected effectively under national law in reacting against or opposing, through peaceful means, activities and acts, including those by omission, attributable to States that result in violations of human rights and fundamental freedoms, as well as acts of violence perpetrated by groups or individuals that affect the enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms.

#### Article 13

Everyone has the right, individually and in association with others, to solicit, receive and utilize resources for the express purpose of promoting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms through peaceful means, in accordance with article 3 of the present Declaration.

#### Article 14

1. The State has the responsibility to take legislative, judicial, administrative or other appropriate measures to promote the understanding by all persons under its jurisdiction of their civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights.

2. Such measures shall include, inter alia: (a) The publication and widespread availability of national laws and regulations and of applicable basic international human rights instruments; (b) Full and equal access to international documents in the field of human rights, including the periodic reports by the State to the bodies established by the international human rights treaties to which it is a party, as well as the summary records of discussions and the official reports of these bodies.

3. The State shall ensure and support, where appropriate, the creation and development of further independent national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms in all territory under its jurisdiction, whether they be ombudsmen, human rights commissions or any other form of national institution.

#### Article 15

The State has the responsibility to promote and facilitate the teaching of human rights and fundamental freedoms at all levels of education and to ensure that all those responsible for training lawyers, law enforcement officers, the personnel of the armed forces and public officials include appropriate elements of human rights teaching in their training programme.

#### Article 16

Individuals, non-governmental organizations and relevant institutions have an important role to play in contributing to making the public more aware of questions relating to all human rights and fundamental freedoms through activities such as education, training and research in these areas to strengthen further, inter alia, understanding, tolerance, peace and friendly relations among nations and among all racial and religious groups, bearing in mind the various backgrounds of the societies and communities in which they carry out their activities.

#### Article 17

In the exercise of the rights and freedoms referred to in the present Declaration, everyone, acting individually and in association with others, shall be subject only to such limitations as are in accordance with applicable international obligations and are determined by law solely for the purpose of securing due recognition and respect for the rights and freedoms of others and of meeting the just requirements of morality, public order and the general welfare in a democratic society.

#### Article 18

1. Everyone has duties towards and within the community, in which alone the free and full development of his or her personality is possible.

2. Individuals, groups, institutions and non-governmental organizations have an important role to play and a responsibility in safeguarding democracy, promoting human rights and fundamental freedoms and contributing to the promotion and advancement of democratic societies, institutions and processes.

3. Individuals, groups, institutions and non-governmental organizations also have an important role and a responsibility in contributing, as appropriate, to the promotion of the right of everyone to a social and international order in which the rights and freedoms set forth in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other human rights instruments can be fully realized.

#### Article 19

Nothing in the present Declaration shall be interpreted as implying for any individual, group or organ of society or any State the right to engage in any activity or to perform any act aimed at the destruction of the rights and freedoms referred to in the present Declaration.

#### Article 20

Nothing in the present Declaration shall be interpreted as permitting States to support and promote activities of individuals, groups of individuals, institutions or non-governmental organizations contrary to the provisions of the Charter of the United Nations.

ANNEX II: Promotion of the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms: protecting women human rights defenders.

Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 18 December 2013

[on the report of the Third Committee (A/68/456/Add.2)]

The General Assembly,

Guided by the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights<sup>256</sup>, the International Covenants on Human Rights<sup>257</sup> and other relevant instruments, including the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women<sup>258</sup>,

*Recalling* its resolution 53/144 of 9 December 1998, by which it adopted by consensus the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms annexed to that resolution, and reiterating the fundamental importance of the Declaration and its promotion and implementation,

*Recalling* also all previous resolutions on this subject, including its resolution 66/164 of 19 December 2011 and Human Rights Council resolutions 16/5 of 24 March 2011<sup>259</sup> and 22/6 of 21 March 2013<sup>260</sup>,

*Recalling* further the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action<sup>261</sup>, the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women<sup>262</sup>, the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development<sup>263</sup> and the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action<sup>264</sup> and their review outcomes, as well as the agreed conclusions and resolutions of the Commission on the Status of Women,

<sup>256</sup> Resolution 217 A (III).

<sup>257</sup> Resolution 2200 A (XXI), annex.

<sup>258</sup> United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1249, No. 20378.

<sup>259</sup> See Official Records of the General Assembly, Sixty-sixth Session, Supplement No. 53 (A/66/53), chap. II, sect. A.

<sup>260</sup> Ibid., Sixty-eighth Session, Supplement No. 53 (A/68/53), chap. IV, sect. A.

<sup>261</sup> A/CONF.157/24 (Part I), chap. III.

<sup>262</sup> See resolution 48/104.

<sup>263</sup> Report of the International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, 5–13 September 1994 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.95.XIII.18), chap. I, resolution 1, annex.

<sup>264</sup> Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, 4–15 September 1995 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.13), chap. I, resolution 1, annexes I and II.

Acknowledging the attention given by the Human Rights Council to the importance of women human rights defenders and of ensuring their protection and enabling their work in recent resolutions, and noting the panel discussion on women human rights defenders convened on 26 June 2012,

*Acknowledging* also that women of all ages who engage in the promotion and protection of all human rights and fundamental freedoms and all people who engage in the defence of the rights of women and gender equality, individually and in association with others, play an important role, at the local, national, regional and international levels, in the promotion and protection of human rights, in accordance with the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms<sup>265</sup>,

*Noting with deep concern* that in many countries persons and organizations engaged in promoting and defending human rights and fundamental freedoms, including women human rights defenders, frequently face threats and harassment and suffer insecurity as a result of those activities, including through the curtailment of freedom of association or expression or the right to peaceful assembly or the abuse of civil or criminal proceedings,

*Gravely concerned* that women human rights defenders are at risk of and suffer from violations and abuses, including systematic violations and abuses of their fundamental rights to life, liberty and security of person, to psychological and physical integrity, to privacy and respect for private and family life and to freedom of opinion and expression, association and peaceful assembly, and in addition can experience gender-based violence, rape and other forms of sexual violence, harassment and verbal abuse and attacks on reputation, online and offline, by State actors, including law enforcement personnel and security forces, and non-State actors, such as those related to family and community, in both public and private spheres,

Deeply concerned that historical and structural inequalities in power relations and discrimination against women, as well as various forms of extremism, have direct implications for the status and treatment of women and that the rights of some women human rights defenders are violated or abused and their work stigmatized owing to discriminatory practices and those social norms or patterns that serve to condone violence against women or perpetuate practices involving such violence,

*Gravely concerned* that impunity for violations and abuses against women human rights defenders persists owing to factors including a lack of reporting, documentation, investigation and access to justice, social barriers and constraints with regard to addressing gender-based violence, including sexual violence and the stigmatization that may result from such violations and abuses, and a lack of recognition of the legitimate role of women human rights defenders, all of which entrench or institutionalize gender discrimination,

*Concerned* that all forms of discrimination, including racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, can lead to the targeting or vulnerability to violence of women human rights defenders, who are prone to multiple, aggravated or intersecting forms of discrimination,

<sup>265</sup> Resolution 53/144, annex.

Aware that information-technology-related violations, abuses, discrimination and violence against women, including women human rights defenders, such as online harassment, cyberstalking, violation of privacy, censorship and the hacking of e-mail accounts, mobile phones and other electronic devices, with a view to discrediting them and/or inciting other violations and abuses against them, are a growing concern and can be a manifestation of systemic gender-based discrimination, requiring effective responses compliant with human rights,

*Mindful* that domestic law and administrative provisions and their application should enable the work of women human rights defenders, including by avoiding any criminalization or stigmatization of the important activities and legitimate role of women human rights defenders and the communities of which they are a part or on whose behalf they work, as well as by avoiding impediments, obstructions, restrictions or selective enforcement thereof contrary to relevant provisions of international human rights law,

*Recalling* that the primary responsibility for promoting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms rests with the State, and reaffirming that national legislation consistent with the Charter and other international obligations of the State in the field of human rights and fundamental freedoms is the juridical framework within which human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, conduct their activities,

Gravely concerned that, in some instances, national security and counterterrorism legislation and other measures have been misused to target human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, or have hindered their work and endangered their safety in a manner contrary to international law,

*Recognizing* the urgent need to address, and to take concrete steps to prevent and stop, the use of legislation to hinder or limit unduly the ability of human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, to exercise their work, including by reviewing and, where necessary, amending relevant legislation and its implementation in order to ensure compliance with States' obligations and commitments under international human rights law,

Underlining the need for all appropriate measures to be taken to modify the social and cultural patterns of conduct of men and women with a view to achieving the elimination of prejudices and customary and other practices based on the idea of the inferiority or superiority of either of the sexes or on stereotyped roles for men and women, in accordance with States' obligations and commitments under international human rights law, thereby addressing harmful attitudes, customs, practices and gender stereotypes that underlie and perpetuate violence against women, including women human rights defenders,

*Reaffirming* that the empowerment, autonomy and advancement of women and the improvement of their political, social, legal and economic status are essential to respect for all human rights, the growth and prosperity of society and the achievement of representative, transparent and accountable government, democratic institutions and sustainable development in all areas of life,

*Recognizing* the valuable work of human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, in promoting civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights and the right to development,

*Welcoming* the opportunity afforded by the post-2015 development agenda for the global community to advance the human rights and fundamental freedoms of all persons, including gender equality and non-discrimination, as well as real and effective participation, including equal political participation, in decision-making processes, Welcoming also the steps taken by some States towards the adoption of national policies or legislation for the protection of individuals, groups and organs of society engaged in promoting and defending human rights, including as follow up to the universal periodic review mechanism of the Human Rights Council,

1. *Calls* upon all States to promote, translate and give full effect to the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,10 including by taking appropriate, robust and practical steps to protect women human rights defenders;

2. *Takes note* with appreciation of the work of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders, noting the particular attention given to women human rights defenders<sup>266</sup>;

3. *Stresses* that respect and support for the activities of human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, is essential to the overall enjoyment of human rights, and condemns all human rights violations and abuses committed against persons engaged in promoting and defending human rights and fundamental freedoms;

4. *Recognizes* that all human rights are universal, indivisible and interdependent and that the international community must treat human rights globally in a fair and equal manner, on the same footing and with the same emphasis, and stresses that, while the significance of national and regional particularities and various historical, cultural and religious backgrounds must be borne in mind, it is the duty of States, regardless of their political, economic and cultural systems, to promote and protect all human rights and fundamental freedoms;

5. *Expresses* particular concern about systemic and structural discrimination and violence faced by women human rights defenders of all ages, and calls upon States to take all measures necessary to ensure their protection and to integrate a gender perspective into their efforts to create a safe and enabling environment for the defence of human rights;

6. *Reiterates* strongly the right of anyone, individually and in association with others, to defend the human rights of women in all their aspects, and stresses the important role of women human rights defenders in promoting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms, to which everyone is entitled without distinction of any kind, including in addressing all forms of human rights violations, combating impunity, fighting poverty and discrimination and promoting access to justice, democracy, the full participation of women in society, tolerance, human dignity and the right to development, while recalling that the exercise of these rights carries duties and responsibilities set out in the Declaration;

7. *Urges* States to acknowledge publicly the important and legitimate role of women human rights defenders in the promotion and protection of human rights, democracy, the rule of law and development as an essential component of ensuring their protection, including by publicly condemning violence and discrimination against women human rights defenders;

<sup>266</sup> See A/68/262, A/67/292 and A/HRC/16/44 and Corr.1.

8. *Calls* upon States to ensure that human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, can perform their important role in the context of peaceful protests, in accordance with national legislation consistent with the Charter of the United Nations and international human rights law, and in this regard to ensure that no one is subject to excessive or indiscriminate use of force, arbitrary arrest or detention, torture or other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, enforced disappearance, abuse of criminal and civil proceedings or threats of such acts;

9. *Also* calls upon States to exercise due diligence in preventing violations and abuses against human rights defenders, including through practical steps to prevent threats, harassment and violence against women human rights defenders, who face particular risks, and in combating impunity by ensuring that those responsible for violations and abuses, including gender-based violence and threats against women human rights defenders, committed by State and non-State actors, including online, are promptly brought to justice through impartial investigations;

10. *Further calls* upon States to ensure that the promotion and protection of human rights are not criminalized or met with limitations in contravention of their obligations and commitments under international human rights law and that women human rights defenders are not prevented from enjoying universal human rights owing to their work, including by ensuring that all legal provisions, administrative measures and policies affecting women human rights defenders, including those aimed at preserving public morals, are clearly defined, determinable, nonretroactive and compatible with relevant provisions of international human rights law;

11. *Underlines* the fundamental principle of the independence of the judiciary and that procedural safeguards must be in place in accordance with States' obligations and commitments under international human rights law in order to protect women human rights defenders from unwarranted criminal actions and sanctions as a consequence of their work in line with the Declaration;

12. Also underlines that women human rights defenders have the right to the lawful exercise of their occupation or profession and that everyone who, as a result of his or her profession, can affect the human dignity, human rights and fundamental freedoms of others should respect those rights and freedoms and comply with relevant national and international standards of occupational and professional conduct or ethics;

13. *Stresses* that, in the exercise of the rights and freedoms referred to in the Declaration, women human rights defenders, acting individually and in association with others, shall be subject only to such limitations as are in accordance with applicable international obligations and are determined by law solely for the purpose of securing due recognition and respect for the rights and freedoms of others and of meeting the just requirements of morality, public order and the general welfare in a democratic society;

14. *Urges* States to strengthen and implement legal, policy and other measures to promote gender equality, empower women and promote their autonomy and to promote and protect their equal participation, full involvement and leadership in society, including in the defence of human rights;

15. Invites leaders in all sectors of society and in their respective communities, including political, military, social and religious leaders and leaders in business and the media, to express public support for the important role of women human rights defenders and the legitimacy of their work;

16. *Calls* upon States to implement, effectively and expeditiously, Security Council resolutions 1325 (2000) of 31 October 2000, 1820 (2008) of 19 June 2008, 1888 (2009) of 30 September 2009, 1889 (2009) of 5 October 2009, 1960 (2010) of 16 December 2010, 2106 (2013) of 24 June 2013 and 2122 (2013) of 18 October 2013 on women and peace and security, including through the provision of gender sensitivity training for police officers and law enforcement personnel, inter alia, on the barriers that women human rights defenders face in gaining access to justice in armed conflict and post-conflict situations, ensuring the inclusion of sexual violence in the definition of acts prohibited by ceasefires and in provisions for ceasefire monitoring and the exclusion of sexual violence crimes from amnesty provisions in the context of conflict resolution processes, as a step towards the effective protection of women, including women human rights defenders;

17. *Strongly calls* upon States to refrain from, and ensure adequate protection from, any act of intimidation or reprisal against women human rights defenders who cooperate, have cooperated or seek to cooperate with international institutions, including their family members and associates;

18. *Reaffirms* the right of everyone, individually and in association with others, to unhindered access to and communication with international bodies, in particular the United Nations, its special procedures, the universal periodic review mechanism and the treaty bodies, as well as regional human rights mechanisms;

19. *Urges* States to develop and put in place comprehensive, sustainable and gender-sensitive public policies and programmes that support and protect women human rights defenders, including by providing adequate resources for immediate and long-term protection and making sure that these can be mobilized in a flexible and timely manner to guarantee effective physical and psychological protection, while also extending protection measures to their relatives, including children, and otherwise to take into account the role of many women human rights defenders as the main or sole caregivers in their families;

20. *Emphasizes* the need for the participation of women human rights defenders in the development of effective policies and programmes related to their protection, recognizing their independence and expertise with regard to their own needs, and the need to create and strengthen mechanisms for consultation and dialogue with women human rights defenders, such as focal points for human rights defenders within the public administration, for example, through national mechanisms for the advancement of women and girls, where they exist, or other mechanisms, depending on the national and local context;

21. *Urges* States to adopt and implement policies and programmes that provide women human rights defenders with access to effective remedies, including by ensuring: (a) The effective participation of women human rights defenders in all initiatives, including transitional justice processes, to secure accountability for violations and abuses, and also ensuring that the guarantee of non-recurrence incorporates overcoming the root causes of gender-based violations and abuses in everyday life and institutions; (b) Adequate access to comprehensive support services for those women human rights defenders who experience violence, including shelters, psychosocial services, counselling, medical care and legal and social services;

(c) That women human rights defenders who are victims of sexual and other forms of violence are attended to by adequately trained and equipped personnel with gender sensitivity and expertise and are consulted during each step of the process; (d) That women human rights defenders are able to avoid situations of violence, including by preventing the occurrence or recurrence of such violence in the exercise of their important and legitimate role in accordance with the present resolution;

22. *Also urges* States to promote and support projects to improve and further develop the documentation and monitoring of cases of violations against women human rights defenders, and encourages the provision of adequate support and resources for those working to protect women human rights defenders, such as government agencies, national human rights institutions and civil society, including national and international non-governmental organizations;

23. *Encourages* national human rights institutions to support the documentation of violations against women human rights defenders and to integrate a gender dimension into the planning and implementation of all programmes and other interventions related to human rights defenders, including through consultations with the relevant stakeholders;

24. *Encourages* regional protection mechanisms, where they exist, to promote projects to improve and further develop the documentation of cases of violations against women human rights defenders and to ensure that programmes for the security and protection of human rights defenders integrate a gender perspective and address the specific risks and security needs of women human rights defenders;

25. *Encourages* United Nations bodies, agencies and other entities, within their respective mandates and in cooperation with the Special Rapporteur and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, to address the situation of human rights defenders, including women human rights defenders, in their work and to contribute to the effective implementation of the Declaration;

26. *Requests* all concerned United Nations agencies and organizations, within their mandates, to provide all possible assistance and support to the Special Rapporteur for the effective fulfilment of her mandate, including in the context of country visits and through suggestions on ways and means of ensuring the protection of women human rights defenders;

27. *Requests* the Special Rapporteur to continue to report annually on her activities to the General Assembly and the Human Rights Council, in accordance with her mandate;

28. Decides to continue its consideration of this matter.

#### APPENDIXES

APPENDIX I: Interview sample for coordinators of temporary relocation programs

APPENDIX II: Report International Shelter City Workshop

APPENDIX III: Questions and answers from Suzan Goes' interview, Justice & Peace

APPENDIX IV: Report Workshop Barcelona

APPENDIX V: Report roundtable on the topic "città in difesa di"

APPENDIX VI: Report workshop on the topic "città in difesa di" a Rubano (PD)

APPENDIX VII: Report roundtable on the "città rifugio" - Comune di Padova

APPENDIX VIII: Interview Leire Lasa, Cear Euskadi

**APPENDIX IX**: Biographies of the defenders hosted in Bilbao in the context of the "Programa vasco de proteccion de Defensoras y Defensores de Derechos Humanos"

**APPENDIX X:** Interview Nestor Hernandez

APPENDIX XI: Interview Paola Ararat Nazarit

APPENDIX XII: Defenders' sheets

**APPENDIX XIII**: Questions and answers from Javier Arjona's interview, ONGD Soldepaz Pachakuti

APPENDIX XIV: Acta de compromiso de la entidad solicitante en Euskadi

APPENDIX XV: Questions and answers Tessa van Bommel, Justice & Peace

**APPENDIX XVI**: Biography of the defender hosted in the Netherlands in the context of the Shelter City temporary relocation program

APPENDIX XVII: Interview David Gomez Gamboa

APPENDIX XVIII: Interview Stephanie Koch, European Centre or Press and Media Freedom

**APPENDIX XIX:** Interview to Anna Artemeva, journalist hosted by the ECMPF programme

**APPENDIX XX:** Interview with Christian Elia, responsible of the Journalists in Residence – Milan programme

**APPENDIX XXI:** Workshop on good practices for the defence and promotion of human rights women defenders

**APPENDIX XXII:** Interview to Ester Gallo, coordinator of the SAR Trento's protection programme for scholars

#### APPENDIX I: Interview sample for coordinators of temporary relocation programs

Interview type: semi structured

Main theme:

Interviewee:

Place:

Role of the interviewee:

#### Interview themes:

- 1. Generic context in which the program was born and developed;
- 2. Specific features of the model;
- 3. Gender issue within the programme.

#### Objectives:

In-depth study of the temporary relocation model through the direct experience of the coordinator, who is able to provide updated data and information missing in the documents and manuals published by the organizations and associations involved in the project.

#### Evaluation:

#### Questions:

- 1. The relocation programme is constituted by different groups that collaborate in different aspects of reception. How do you coordinate the work at best? What is the structure that you have established? Who decides what?
- 2. How does the programme start and when? What were the most important steps that characterized this program and made it what it is today?
- 3. The selection of the defenders is an important and delicate part of the entire programme, what are the criteria that are considered for the selection? Who decides?
- 4. Let's talk about funds, hosting a defender needs considerable financial support. Can you quantify what the total expenditure is? What are the budget items that most require money? What are your main sources of funds?
- 5. The final phase of the programme, i.e. the return of the defender to his country of origin, is probably the most complicated part of the relocation. How do you manage this last phase? How do you keep communication with the defender? What is the role of embassies?
- 6. The temporary relocation programme is a project that aims to help the defender at 360 degrees, therefore not only looking at the political aspect but also at the social and health dimensions. What are the activities offered? What training courses and services are available?

- 7. Regarding the structuring of the defender's agenda. Who takes care of it? Which bodies does the defender interact with during the relocation period (media channels? citizenship? meetings with local administrations? schools? associations / NGOs?). Is the structuring of the agenda managed by a specific figure or is it the result of teamwork? Is it broadly structured and then detailed once the defender has arrived (based on his characteristics) or is it fully detailed in advance?
- 8. How is the residential agenda communicated to the defender (broadly or in detail)?
- 9. Gender issue: what is your approach to the issue? is it a predominant theme or one among the many aspects of your work?
- 10. Do you have data or gender statistics on defenders who need or have applied for protection? (how many are men? how many women? or are they part of gender minorities?)
- 11. Do you have data or gender statistics on people about the defenders you welcome and protect? (how many are men? and how many women? how many LGBTQI?)
- 12. Have you found specific needs or attitudes among men / women / gender minorities about the defenders you welcome and protect?
- 13. Has your organization adopted a gender policy, or does it adopt a gender approach?
- 14. Do you have data or gender statistics available on the internal structure of your organization? (how many women / men / LGBTQIs work there and at what levels?)
- 15. Do you have data or gender statistics available on your operators engaged in these activities?
- 16. Do you have a gender dimension in budgets (gender budgeting)?

#### **APPENDIX II - Report International Shelter City Workshop**

From 7 to 9 October 2019, the second International Shelter City Workshop was held in The Hague, which was attended by all the Dutch cities involved in the programme, the international Shelter Cities, "Rete in difesa di", and the representatives of Nepal Human rights center. These three days of workshops, presentations and discussions took place at Het Nutshuis, an independent centre for the promotion of art and culture and concerned all the important aspects of the Dutch relocation model, from building up a Shelter City, to communication, return to the country and psychological support. Even if all the Shelter Cities are similar to each other's, each one has some characteristics and processes that are different, especially the international Shelter Cities, due to a very different geographical, political and cultural context compared to the one in the Netherlands. This diversity of methods and solutions allowed a fruitful discussion among the participants of the meeting, in particular concerning that aspects that still need to be developed and improved. The necessity of a common language and communication and the urgency to create mechanisms of

coordination more effective among all the cities, both on a national and international level, are two of the most debated points. The International Shelter City Workshop ended up with many ideas and closer human and working relationships.

Difficulties encountered: Since the "In difesa di" network is not officially part of the Shelter City network, and the organizers knew about the participation of the researcher, there have been some limitations, especially on the side of Suzan Goes, regarding the sharing of some information not included in the manuals and public documents. During the stay in the Netherlands was not possible to meet the defenders for an interview, since they were busy with a training on personal and digital safety. The only moments were common activities (such as lunch or coffee breaks).

#### **APPENDIX III: Interview with Suzan Goes, Justice & Peace**

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: First part on October 8th, 2019, second part on November 13th, 2019

Main theme: Shelter City, The Dutch temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders

Interviewee: Suzan Goes

Organization: Justice & Peace

Place: The Netherlands, The Hague

Role of the interviewee: Coordinator of the Shelter City programme

Interview themes:

- 1. Generic context in which the program was born and developed;
- 2. Specific features of the Dutch model;
- 3. The case of the Shelter City in The Hague
- 4. Gender issue within the programme.

#### Objectives:

In-depth study of the temporary relocation model through the direct experience of the coordinator, who is able to provide updated data and information missing in the documents and manuals published by the organizations and associations involved in the project.

#### Evaluation:

The main goal of the interview was achieved. In addition, Suzan agreed on answering further questions and keeping contact through updates and eventual collaboration proposals.

### Question and answers from Suzan Goes' interview, Shelter City Programme Coordinator, Justice & Peace

#### Generic context of the Shelter City programme

1. The shelter city program started in 2012 with the pilot city of The Hague, now the entire project counts with 16 host cities participating in the Netherlands network. Which are the main steps that have led to the nowadays situation?

We started with the pilot city of The Hague because the municipality came forward to become the first Dutch Shelter City and support from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs shortly followed. That summer (2012) we started with our first call for human rights defenders. We formed the selection committee, invited the first human rights defender, organized events with the university and other organizations. The second city to become a Shelter City was Middelburg, followed by Utrecht, Nijmegen, Amsterdam, Maastricht and Groningen. Now the network counts of 16 Shelter Cities, 12 in the Netherlands and 4 abroad.

2. Different groups are forming the Shelter City program: J&P as national coordinator and the organization responsible of The Hague, the host municipalities, the Foreign Ministry, local associations and some universities. How do you manage to coordinate all the members? Which is the organizational structure you have decided to use? Do the local organizations have freedom of choice? If yes, in which fields?

J&P is the national coordinator of the network, we receive requests from municipalities and organizations which want to create a new Shelter City and, if they are eligible for the programme, we help them set up the Shelter City. The host organizations are in charge of almost all the aspects of the project in their cities, they have freedom of choice over the activities, the partners and they are in charge of local-related administrative aspects.

3. The HRD's selection is important but also sensitive part of the program, for that reason there is an Independent Selection Committee that is in charge of examine and choose who will be temporary hosts by the Shelter city program. Who composes the Committee? Which are the selection criteria?

The Committee is composed by external people and it changes every year. Members usually belong to our partner organizations, to the universities and/or to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and they are chosen on an expertise base, both on Human Rights Affairs and specific geographical knowledge. The selection criteria we use are:

- 1. They implement a non-violent approach in their work;
- 2. They are threatened or otherwise under pressure due to their work;
- 3. They should be able to be relocated for a maximum of 3 months. Limited spots are available for people who are unable to stay for the full 3 months;
- 4. They are willing and able to return to their country of origin after 3 months;
- 5. They are willing to speak publicly about their experience or about human rights in their country to the extent that their security situation allows;
- 6. They have a conversational level of English. Limited spots are available for French or Spanish speaking HRDs;
- 7. They are willing and able to come to the Netherlands without accompaniment of family members;
- 8. They have a valid passport or be willing to carry out the procedures for its issuance. Justice and Peace covers the costs of issuing a passport and/or visa;

- 9. They are not subjected to any measure or judicial prohibition of leaving their country;
- 10. They are available to come to the Netherlands in the requested period.
- 4. The temporary relocation program aims to offer help and support to the HRD's under threat in an all-round way, it means taking care of the political aspect as much as the social, medical and psychological ones. Which are the "standard" activities/services do you offer? Which are the training courses?

Each Shelter City has its own list of activities and training, beyond the security training (which is provided by J&P at a national level) the most common activities/services are English/French courses, computer literacy course, art-related activities and less often instruments courses.

5. The "after relocation" part of the program. The return of the HRD to his/her country of origin, it's probably the most complex phase of the entire project. How do you manage this step? How do you keep in contact with the HRD? Which is exactly the role of your Embassy?

The "after relocation" part needs the human rights defender to be able to come back to his/her country by him/herself without anyone accompanying him/her. We can provide with a small amount of financial support to help the person to reintegrate in the community and after 6 months we contact him/her (depending by the situation by phone/Skype/email) for a follow-up interview on how the temporary relocation helped him/her. In some cases, where the universities have been involved more, it happened that a group of students keep in touch with the HRD in a more informal way.

6. Taking into account the table number 3 of (How to set up a Shelter City?, manual), in any category there are two different options (ex. Target group: specific or open call). Do you change the option in accordance with the HRD's selected or do you have a unique program? If the last one is your choice, why did you choose those options?

We always follow the same main organizational structure:

the duration of the program is always 3 months because our purpose is support the HRD in rest, respite and the burnout prevention in prevision of the return of him/her to his/her country. We chose the "open call" strategy to select the candidates because it allows the programme to respond to emergencies and to be more flexible, even though it means more work for us and a very high number of candidates. We chose not to host HRD with family and relatives mostly due to administrative-related issues (e.g. visa).

7. Still quoting the How to set up a Shelter City? annual, there are two main roles marked as important for the total management of the HRD staying in the Netherlands: the coordinator and the case manager/supervisor/buddy. Can you explain us deeply which are the work and the responsibility of both? In general, how many people works in the entire program? The coordinator mainly takes care of short-list the applications, supervising HRDs travel and stay, dealing with all aspects related to the security. Besides, the coordinator will also fulfil fundraising and other administrative and coordination tasks with the local, national and sometimes international partners, helps in building up the agenda (both political and daily). The mentor/ "buddy" can be one or more persons and he/she supports the HRDs in their daily pursuits and in establishing objectives for their stay. This person helps the HRD during the very first beginning of the relocation, showing the HRD how to move across the city, where are all the interested points (accommodation, work-place, supermarkets...) This person should know the city where the HRD is relocated well and speak a language in which the HRD can easily communicate. The case manager can help identify networking and training opportunities, as well as ensure the HRD receives adequate medical, legal or psychological support.

8. Let's talk about the economic part of the program, considering that hosting an HRD needs a considerable amount of money, how much does the entire program costs? Which are the most expensive invoices of the budget? Which are your main sources of funds?

We have estimated that one month of relocation for one HRD costs around 18 thousand euros. We have three main sources: the municipalities, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, emergency grants provided by Protect Defenders and the EIDHR. We also opened a fundraising campaign on "Pifworld".

## 9. The Shelter City program could be considering a network of hosting municipality in the Netherlands, what are the common elements and what are the differences? Is there a national level and a regional/local one?

All the Shelter City shared the same organizational structure (duration, target group, purpose, selection procedure...) but they can differentiate in training/courses/activities offered. Depending on how many and what kind of associations/organizations/university are involved in the project the list of options can be limited or wide.

## 10. Does the Shelter city program collaborate with other programs? If yes, what are the results and what the difficulties?

The network itself doesn't collaborate with any specific program/organization.

#### The Hague's Shelter city program

11. Who is in charge of preparing the HRD agenda during his/her staying? The agenda is going to be prepared before the arrival of the HRD or after?

The hosting organization is in charge of the preparation of the agenda, the coordinator together with the mentor(s) are the most involved in the process and they take care of all the aspects, including collaborations with the local partners. The agenda organization starts before the HRD arrival with a call/skype call of presentation of all the activities/services available.

#### 12. How is the agenda communicating to the HRD? In a general way or day per day?

The agenda is constantly building and monitored together with the HRD. A first agenda is communicated at the beginning of the stay but it can be subjected to changes, both required by the HRD or the organization/situation.

## 13. Which are your partners in The Hague? (local associations, media, schools, NGOs universities...)

In the Hague we collaborate mainly with Stichting Noodopvang Haaglanden, which facilitate the housing for the HRD and with Fonds1818, which organize the educational program. We also have started to work with a couple of High Schools and of course, we collaborate with the university.

#### A gender point of view

14. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics on how many women/men apply for protection/temporary relocation? And about how many of them are member of a gender minorities?

Year/Period	Female	Male	Trans/other
2014-01	4	19	0
2014-02	9	27	0
2015-01	5	28	0
2015-02	30	109	8
2016-01	26	68	0
2016-02	39	110	4
2017-01	18	64	2
2017-02	38	96	2
2018-01	39	123	9
2018-02	70	202	8
TOTAL	278	846	33

We don't know how many of these men/women belonged to a gender minority (LGB) Please note: most of the years the participants gender was discriminated, but it wasn't specified if they were transgender or belonged to another LGBTIQ minority. There is only information about trans/other applicants since 2017.

Year/Period	Female	Male	Trans/other
2012	1	1	0
2013	1	1	0
2014-01	0	2	0
2014-02	0	2	0
2015-01	1	4	0
2015-02	2	6	1
2016-01	2	6	0
2016-02	4	2	0
2017-01	5	6	0
2017-02	5	6	0
2018-01	7	4	0
2018-02	6	3	0
2019-01	5	10	1
2019-02	4	5	1
TOTAL	43	59	2

### 15. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics about the HRD's that you have hosted? How many of them were men/women? And how many LQBTQI?

Year/Period	Gay	Lesbian	Trans/other
2014	1	0	0
2015	2	0	1
2016	1	1	0
2017	3	2	0
2018	1	2	0
2019	2	1	2

#### 16. About J&P, does your organisation adopt a gender policy or a gender-based approach?

In our selection of participants, we aim to have a gender balance (50% men and 50% women), and we aim to take gender into account in all our programming (ensure suitable support, sufficient female support to female HRDs, sufficient male support to male HRDs, sufficient LGBTI support to LGBTI defenders). In 2020 we will start with a family relocation pilot in The Hague to encourage more women to participate in the Shelter City Initiative.

#### 17. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics about your internal organisation? How many women/men/LGBTQI work and with what job/responsibility?

At JP we have 18 paid staff, 4 of them are men (one of them LGBTI) and 14 are women. Please note that they don't all work on SC.

### 18. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics of your employees that are working on these activities?

SCI: 3 women (coordinator & 2 trainers) and one man (LGBTI) (officer)

#### 19. Do you have a gender budgeting?

We don't have a specific gender budgeting, apart from the family relocation pilot that we will start in 2020.

#### **APPENDIX IV: Report Workshop Barcelona**

On the 21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2019, the European Union Temporary Relocation Platform (EUTRP) was held in Barcelona, a two days event with conferences, workshops and witnesses organized by Protector Defenders, with the engagement both of the current members and the ones that are interested to be part of it in the future. The meeting was hosted and sponsored by the Catalan Agency for the Cooperation and Development and by the Catalan Commission for Refugees, with more than 40 organizations coming mainly from Europe, but also from United States, Latin America and Africa. On Monday 21<sup>st</sup> October, after the presentation about the structure of the event, the workshops have started. Some of the topic discussed were: platform governance, strategies and good practices, and internal and external communication. The approximately 50 participants were able to confront and report their original points of view during the presentation of the results. The afternoon was then dedicated to the discussion of four topics during four different world café, in which each participant had 15 minutes to reflect with his/her group on the reinforcement of the following dimension in relocation programmes: gender, sustainability, return phase of defenders, emergency cases, and the development of a new approach aimed at greater regional work in the countries of origin of human rights defenders under threat. The variety of experiences, guidelines, ideas and guestions allowed to end up the first day with many inspirational thoughts and a great harmony among the participants, who during the dinner have kept on discussing about how to look at the future and how to create new tools as way of managing funds and knowledge. On Tuesday 22<sup>nd</sup> October, for the first time, part of the EUTRP was open to public. Besides giving space to the precious witness of three human rights defenders hosted by temporary relocation programmes in Spain, there were various presentations of the longest experiences of temporary relocation.

Moreover, the Barcelona Guidelines<sup>267</sup> (on the wellbeing of human rights defenders hosted by relocation programmes) and a study from York University<sup>268</sup> on the same topic, were presented.

#### APPENDIX V: Report roundtable on the topic "città in difesa di"

On Saturday 1<sup>st</sup> of June, many representatives of the network "In Difesa di" from Trento, Padova and Verona joined the meeting. The following organizations and associations were present:

Trentino: Yaku, PBI, Villa Sant'Ignazio, Fondazione Alex Langer, Forum Trentino per la Pace e i Diritti Umani;

Veneto: Commissione Diritti Umani dell'Ordine Avvocati (Verona), a professor of Verona University; Movimento Federalista Europeo (Padua).

Some citizens have also joined the meeting.

The roundtable focused on sharing experiences and suggestions, and on updating about the various entities involved in the meeting, in preparation for the first "In Difesa di" network meeting that had to be hold in Rome on October 2019.

The professor Isolde Quadranti (Verona University) and the lawyer Barbara Bonafini explained how, in Verona, the goal is to create a programme for environmental lawyers and defenders. At the moment they are working with the Centre for Human Rights of Padua, the Work University and Scholars at Risk.

From Padua, Gaetano De Venuto confirmed that the Padua group of "In Difesa di" network keep on working for the institution of a relocation programme for lawyers and academics, together with the Centre for Human Rights, the Associazione Giuristi Democratici, and the municipal council.

#### APPENDIX VI: Report workshop on the topic "città in difesa di" a Rubano (PD)

The seminar hold in Rubano, in Padua province, was planned as a private moment for sharing and discussing between various municipalities from Veneto (Padova, Cadoneghe, Ponte San Nicolò, Rubano, Noventa Padovana, Asiago e Montegrotto Terme) that voted for a resolution on the "città in difesa di" network, with the goal of outlining common practices and points for the management of the programme. The Trentino group of the "In Dlfesa di" network was invited to participate with the task of sharing the steps that brought to the vote, being the first initiator of a similar resolution and one of the most active group in Italy regarding temporary relocation programmes. The debate on the characteristics of the Padua relocation programme did not show great disagreement between the parts, who only expressed different ideas over the topic of selection of the defenders, which can happen through an open call or directly contacting the foreigner partner associations. The final decision was not taken in that moment. This workshop

<sup>267</sup> Justice and Peace (2019), The Barcelona Guidelines on Wellbeing and Temporary International Relocation of Human Rights Defenders at Risk

https://www.justiceandpeace.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/TheBarcelonaGuidelines-ENFinal.pdf

<sup>268</sup> University of York (2017), Wellbeing, Risk, and Human Rights Practice

https://www.york.ac.uk/media/cahr/documents/Wellbeing, % 20 Risk, % 20 and % 20 Human% 20 Rights% 20 Practice, % 20 Human% 20 Rights% 20 Point ts% 20 Defender% 20 Point % 20

tuned out very useful for the data collection of this research, since it allowed the collection of ideas and suggestions, besides allowing to inform all the subjects involved in Veneto about the existence of the research.

#### APPENDIX VII: Report roundtable on the "città rifugio" – Comune di Padova

Many Italian bodies, involved in the development of temporary relocation programmes around Italy, have joined the roundtable on shelter cities. The Trentino and Padua groups of "In Difesa di" network was present, together with Francesco Martone, the national spokesperson. This event served as the first meeting with Amnesty International Italia representatives, who were promoters of the programme in Turin, and have shared their experience explaining all the steps which led, in April 2019, to the unanimous vote on the resolution concerning a pilot plan for temporary reception and support for men and, in particular, threatened women human rights defenders. This roundtable was useful for this research, since Amnesty International discussed about the challenges regarding the involvement of the citizens and associations in building up the temporary relocation programme. In fact, in this case the approval process was initiated by an international organization with Italian offices in Rome, too far from Turin and its inhabitants. This situation is creating some issues in the realization of what has been voted in Turin municipal council. The participants' final thoughts underline the necessity to invest energy and time involving local subjects, from citizens to university, since the beginning of the process.

#### APPENDIX VIII: Interview with Leire Lasa, Cear Euskadi

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: First part on April 16<sup>th</sup>, 2020, second part on June 12<sup>th</sup>, 2020

Main theme: The Basque temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders

Interviewee: Leire Lasa

Organization: CEAR Euskadi

Place: Spain, Bilbao

Role of the interviewee: Programme Coordinator

Interview themes:

- 1. Generic context in which the program was born and developed;
- 2. Specific features of the Basque model;
- 3. Gender issue within the programme.

#### Objectives:

In-depth study of the Basque temporary relocation model through the direct experience of the coordinator, who is able to provide updated data and information missing in the documents and manuals published by the organizations and associations involved in the project.

#### Evaluation:

The interview was conducted in two parts, one online, through the Jitsi platform, and a second one by email. The first part was mainly focused on the current context in which the programme is running. These months of pandemic, global quarantine and closed borders are radically changing the programme and the organizers are rearranging both the public and political agenda, with the use of online platform and social networks, and the administrative part of the programme. The second part collect the answers regarding the programme. Particular issues were not found, besides the impossibility to visit the organization Cear Euskadi, due to the limitations to transports and movement, preventing from participating in first person and field visits.

#### Questions and answers with Leire Lasa, Cear Euskadi

#### General context and characteristics of the programme

1. According to the Cear Euskadi website, the Basque temporary relocation programme is made up of three main actors: The Department of Victims and Human Rights of the Basque Government, Cear Euskadi and the Basque Agency for Development and Cooperation, together with local associations and groups. What is the relationship between all of you? How do you relate?

The Basque programme is an example of linkage between public and academic institutions and human rights organizations. It is supported by the General Secretariat for Human Rights, Coexistence and Cooperation of the Basque Government (formed by the Directorate of Victims and Human Rights, who leads the Program, and the Basque Agency for Development Cooperation) and the management and technical coordination of CEAR Euskadi, as human rights organization expert in protection. Within its selection committee there are: Directorate of Foreign Action of the Basque Government, the Hegoa Institute (University of the Basque Country), the Pedro Arrupe Human Rights Institute (University of Deusto), the Euskadi NGDO Coordinator and the Forum of Associations for Human Rights Education and Peace. The Human Rights and Equality Commission of the Basque Parliament supports the Programme through facilitation and presentation of the defenders within the commission, and with the follow up visits to their countries. It has also the support of the Colectivo ANSUR on what concerns the safety and protection issues, and with Ekimen Elkartea, a psychotherapeutic cabinet with experience in care for victims of torture and socio-political violence. Finally, its is fundamental the coordination and involvement of the Basque organizations for cooperation and human rights. These are part of what we called "Red de Apoyo". These organizations connect the defenders to the Programme, so they belon to organizations, collectives and communities with whom the Basque organizations collaborate. Their role on launching the programme as a tool for protection, on following the defenders during their stay in the Basque countries and their return to their countries, is extremely important. The relationship between the various organizations and institutions involved in the programme is based on trust (which developed during almost 10 years of work) and on a fluent communication. The Programme was developed collectively, so each member feel part of it (each on with its specific function), sharing a common goal and focus on protection. Cear Euskadi is in charge of coordinating and communicating between all the actors involved.

## 2. Who is part of the group working daily with the defenders, and what responsibilities they have?

The group coordinating the programme in CEAR Euskadi consists of two people. Both are working daily with the defenders, with a horizontal coordination, sharing the tasks and following weekly meetings.

One of them is the coordinator of the Programme. She is also in charge of the communication with the public institutions and the overall functioning of the system.

# 3. In Spain there are other temporary relocation programmes, for instance the Catalan one directed by CCAR Cataluña. Is there a relationship between the different programmes? And if it exists, in which ways they communicate and coordinate? Is there an extra regional meeting between with all programmes?

Yes, in Spain there have always been a fluent communication between the Programmes. Since last year, when many programmes started in different places, we started a "Red" (network) with the aim of sharing information, doubts and good practices, coordinating the defenders' agenda and launch political actions. We communicate through emails and phone. We make use of various opportunities to meet in person (workshops, debates).

The following subjects are part of this network:

- Programa Asturiano de Atención a Víctimas de la Violencia en Colombia
- Giza eskubideen defendatzaileak aldi batez Euskal Autonomia Erkidegoan babesteko Programa / Programa Vasco de Protección Temporal para Defensores y Defensoras de los Derechos Humanos (General Secretariat for Human Rights, Coexistence and Cooperation of the Basque Government y CEAR-Euskadi).
- Programa Català de Protecció a defensors i defensores dels Drets Humans / Programa Catalán de Protección a Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos (Generalitat de Catalunya and the Catalan Refugee Support Commission).
- Programa municipal Barcelona protegeix periodistes de Mèxic/Barcelona protege a periodistas de México (Municipality of Barcelona y Taula per Méxic).
- Programa Valenciano de Protección Integral y de Acogida de Defensores y Defensoras de Derechos Humanos (Department of Cooperation for Development and Migration of the municipality of Valencia y CEAR-País Valencià).

## 4. The selection of the defenders is an important and delicate part of the programme. How does this phase work? How it is scheduled? Is there an open call or specific channels where to apply?

The call for presenting the applications to the Programme is published annually, with deadline in a month. The time of reception of defenders is from January to July, so the call is made public in September, for the following year edition. The Directorate for Victims and Human Rights of the Basque Government carries out the official call, while the Basque Agency for Development and Cooperation, the members of the Selection Committee and CEAR Euskadi share it among our contacts and on our website and social networks. The requirement for sending the application is to be part of an organization, collective or community that defends human rights.

The application is then reviewed by a Basque organization, since its role is fundamental for the development of the political agenda and the follow up when the defender returns to his/her country. We look at the Programme as a tool for political solidarity, complementary to the work of Basque organizations and collectives for cooperation and solidarity.

## 5. How the selection process ends? Who evaluates and selects the defenders? What are the criteria?

The applications are sent to CEAR Euskadi. We review them and make a report for the Selection Committee (without personal data) with our technical evaluation based on certain criteria: risk, protection, gender, diversity, rural community (farmers, Afro-descendants, indigenous). The Selection Committee gets together and decides who will be host.

# 6. The temporary relocation programme is a project that intends to help and support the defenders, not only by strengthening the political and relational aspect, but also offering, among all, medical and psychological support. What is the basic offer of activities? What are the trainings and services?

The feminist and psycho-social focus is fundamental within our work on protection. We start from "care" as a focus of our political action. Living a permanent situation of risk and threat has an impact on defenders' bodies (emotionally and physically). We provide an integral offer of health services:

- Physical health: general medical and specialist check-ups (physiotherapy, eye doctor or others that may be required).
- Emotional health:
  - Collective: group workshops in which we work on trust, group cohesion, training in safety and protection.
  - Individual: psychotherapeutic sessions by Ekimen Elkartea. These sessions are offered to defenders, as well as to the coordinating team of the Program of CEAR-Euskadi.

## 7. Does the temporary relocation programme collaborate with other programmes and projects in the city? What are the issues and results?

The Basque programme collaborates with different organizations and participates in local, national and European networks:

- European Networks: European Union Temporary Relocation Platform (EUTPR), belonging to Protect Defenders.
- State networks:
  - RED Defensoras (State network of human rights organizations and social movements in the fields of international cooperation, protection and solidarity).
  - Network of Protection Programmes of the Spanish State (Asturias, Catalunya, Madrid, Valencia and Basque countries).
- Local networks:
  - Kolektiba Colombia (Basque network of solidarity with Colombia)

The collaboration with organizations of protection, cooperation and solidarity are fundamental in the work to protect defenders. Over the years, these spaces for reflection and debate and for the development of advocacy and awareness-raising actions have led to a strengthening of the Basque Programme and a great contribution thanks to shared learning and knowledge.

## 8. A special part of your programme is the psychological assistance to defenders. Is this service concealed also for supporting defender on familiarizing with the Spanish environment?

As I said in the previous answer, we offer to defender the possibility to have individual psychotherapeutic sessions with Ekimen Elkartea. The work of these sessions depends on the situation of each defender. The relocation period lasts 6 months, so it is impossible to start a long term therapeutic process, but a diagnosis can be done (which is then given to the defender with some suggestions on how to follow the therapeutic process in his/her country) and some useful techniques are taught, for the managing of fears, sleep... Familiarizing with the hosting place is always a fundamental topic. The defenders are often dealing with guilt for temporarily leaving their family (especially women), community or collectives. It happens that they believe not to deserve such a "privileged" situation, while their community keeps suffering violence and threats. Letting them to express personal and political feelings regarding the programme is already a process by itself.

9. Regarding the residential agenda of the defender. Who organizes it? Is it an individual or it is developed by the various actors involved in the programme? What are the groups/associations/institutions that relates with the defender? (media, schools, municipalities, ONG's, etc.) When is the agenda delivered to the defender? It is a detailed programme or a general one?

- The agendas are collectively developed with the defender, the organization of origin, the reference organization in the Basque countries, and CEAR Euskadi.
- A common agenda is offered to the three hosted people, managed by CEAR Euskadi: intervention in the Basque Parliament, meeting with the Basque Government, meeting with the Selection Committee and each of its members, meeting with media.
- In addition, the reference organizations in the Basque countries (what we call "Red de Apoyo") develop a specific agenda for each defender. This agenda is developed on prior to the arrival of the defender and, once he/she arrives, we organize a workshop to define the goals (goals of the stay in the Basque countries, what network can be reinforced and what alliance can be started). The objective is no critically fill the agenda, defining very well the objectives so it can have a real impact.

## 10. Let's talk about the last phase of the programme, the return of the defenders to their country. How is this part organized? What are the actors involved? How do you keep contact with the defenders?

The return is the most delicate phase of the programme. In order to offer a safe situation for the defenders on their returning, we make individual plans for each one of them. For them, it is fundamental to involve their local organization, which have the knowledge of the field: context analysis, actors, scenarios.

Participating to the preparation of the return plans are: the defender with his/her local organization, the reference organization in the Basque countries, the ANSUR collective (as experts on safety and protection) and CEAR Euskadi. The Basque government is informed of the plans and then issues a certificate that proves the participation of the defender to the Programme and the vigilance that will be maintained over her situation and that of her organization, group or community. If it is needed, the Basque government can contact the countries' authorities, in order to reinforce the safety measures for his/her return. In some occasions, it is also requested to send letters or to share institutional statements to the Human Rights and Equality Commission of the Basque Parliament. The monitoring of the defenders after the return is carried out based on two main actions:

Follow up visit on the field. Yearly, a Basque delegation visit the country of the defenders that have been hosted. The objective is to monitor the situation of them, their organization and community, to make explicit the support of Basque institutions and organizations, and to bridge organizations' questions and issues to the institutions of the country. This visit allows to reinforce the protection of defenders.

The visit is lead by the Directorate for Victims and Human Rights of the Basque Government, with the participation of the Basque Agency for Development and Cooperation, representatives of the Human Rights and Equality Commission of the Basque Parliament (from the five parties represented in the parliament), Basque human rights organizations, and CEAR Euskadi.

 Follow-up through Basque organizations, who, after the field visit, keep permanent contact with the organizations of origin about their work in cooperation and in defence of human rights.

#### 11. In your opinion, what are the strengths and weaknesses of the programme?

The Basque Protection Program is a living system under permanent review, the result of multiple institutional, organizational and community voices in the Basque Country and in other countries and regions of the world. Thanks to this collective development, it is today an example of good practices and has been a reference for the implementation of other protection programs in Spain and Europe; it is recognized by different institutional and organizational bodies in the Basque Country, Spain and Europe; and, as a result of field visits, and work on political activism and protection, it relates with public institutions from some of the defenders' countries of origin, as well as with international organizations and the diplomatic corps.

As a result of the relationship with people and organizations that defend human rights and with organizations that work in protection, and as a result of the investigations carried out by CEAR Euskadi in this matter, we have identified several lessons that we have been incorporating into the work in protection, and that constitute important **strengths** of the Basque Program:

Comprehensive vision of protection. For protection to be truly effective, it is essential to approach it from a comprehensive perspective that incorporates the four elements mentioned: organization, relations, safety measures and psychosocial. That is, to develop different areas and protection measures while strengthening both the networks and alliances of the organizations such as the self-protection capacities of defenders and their groups.

- Incorporation of care as a political action. Defenders' bodies are badly damaged due to direct violence and the suffering of political repression, stress, insecurity, and fear generated by living in a situation of permanent harassment and threats. Working about care and attention to the body is essential. The personal sphere is still political, fundamental to well-being and protection. "*I take care of myself because if I feel good, I strengthen my fight, my process.*" We also add the development of safe spaces in which care relationships and political and affective solidarity prevail, and in which limits are established regarding sexist, racist, classist and LGTBI violence.
- Reception of defenders with minors in charge. To favour access to protection programs by women defenders (one of the groups prioritized in the Basque Program), it is necessary to guarantee the reception of defenders with relatives. Previous experiences in this regard show us that there are still significant challenges in terms of meeting the diversity of needs that families have, mobilizing specific resources and creating their own agendas for the defenders based on their needs. In addition, it is necessary to balance between the defender's own agenda and the agenda of the family member or relatives in their charge, so that they can achieve their political, training and care objectives.
- Collective vision of the defence of human rights and protection: Defenders' protection needs include their families, groups and communities. Although the threats and violence are varied and their reasons are diverse, their objective is to contrast the defence of human rights and break the social structure by creating fear and mistrust. Thus, even if it is an individual attack, it is usually intended to harm the organization. In this sense, the Program establishes a dialogue between the individual and the collective. Defenders who are organized, who are part of organizations or social movements, are welcomed individually, with the aim of strengthening and protecting the collectives as a whole, not just the host.
- Networking: The relationship between different agents (institutions, civil society) with their own competencies, and different or complementary fields of action, contributes to increasing and strengthening the protection networks of defenders and their organizations. In this regard, the Basque Program is part of the Network of Protection Programs of Spain, of the global Platform for the temporary relocation of human rights defenders, belonging to Protect Defenders (EU), of the RED Defensoras (state network of organizations and collectives of cooperation, international solidarity and protection) and of the Kolektiba Colombia (Basque network of solidarity with Colombia).

Protection work also faces several **challenges** that we should continue to examinate:

- Addressing the structural causes of attacks against defenders, their organizations and communities. Many of the existing protection measures are focused on alleviating or addressing the impacts and consequences of the attacks suffered by defenders. Protection work must always go hand in hand with denouncing the structural causes of violence.
- Feminist focus. Although progress has been made in the implementation of the feminist perspective in protection work, important challenges remain ahead, such as:
  - Expand the traditional concept of risk, including the dimensions of spirituality, emotional health and sexist violence.

- Strengthen alliances with feminist processes and protection networks of women defenders in the territories.
- Address the security of defenders taking into account the roles they occupy, not only in their community and in their organization, but also in their family, which entails the extension of the concept of safety to their family nucleus.
- Provide care work and other family needs during the reception periods, whether the relatives remain in the territories or are welcomed by the protection programs together with the defenders.
- Strengthening organization at source. Protection and relocation programs must always be accompanied by strategies to strengthen organizations, social movements and communities in the countries of origin, since these groups and local networks represent the first protection mechanism.
- Global criminalization strategies. In the global context, criminalization strategies are today one of the main types of violence that defenders and groups face.
- Narratives that publicly legitimize the work in defence of human rights. To contrast global strategies of criminalization and defamation, it is essential to generate counternarratives that, from the international community, publicly legitimize the work of defenders and organizations, which is fundamental for the common good and for the development of a more just and sustainable world.
- Economic and material resources so that defenders can guarantee the support of the life of their families and dependents, and face the increasingly frequent cases of criminalization and prosecution, for which it is necessary to have resources that allow access to legal and psychosocial support.

## 12. Talking about resources, the relocation of a defender needs a considerable economic contribution. What is the total expenditure for each defender hosted at the programme? What are the most expensive elements? What are your greater sources of funds?

Since its beginning in 2011, the Basque programme increased its work, and that brought to larger funds. Currently, the Basque Programme has an approximate annual budget of  $\in$  145,000 for 3 defenders (and relatives, if applicable). The greatest expenditures, besides the staff, consist of: (1) field visits, (2) payments to the Red de Apoyo, and (3) supporting the defenders during their stay. All the funds come from the Basque Government: Victims and Human Rights Directorate, which has led the Basque Program since its start, and from the Basque Agency for Development and Cooperation.

#### Gender issues

## 13. Do you have gender kind of data of the defenders that applied to the programme? How many are men and women? How many are part of a gender minority?

We do have this information, but it is not systematized.

## 14. Do you have gender kind of data of the defender that you hosted? How many are LGBTQI?

Since its beginning in 2011, we have hosted 24 people (15 women and 9 men), plus 2 minors (1 woman and 1 man).

- Indigenous: 3 women and 4 men
- Afro-descendants: 3 women and 1 man
- Peasant women: 3 women
- Urban sectors: 2 men and 5 women
- Sexual diversity: 2 men
- Political activists: 1 woman

Disaggregated according to nationality:

- Colombia: 9 women (one of them accompanied by her minor daughter) and 7 men
- Guatemala: 1 woman (accompanied by her minor child) and 1 man
- Peru: 1 woman
- Honduras: 3 women and 1 man
- Occupied territories of the Sahara: 1 woman

#### 15. Did you notice specific needs from women or gender minorities?

We attach 'Proteger a quien defiende. Diagnóstico sobre necesidades de protección de personas defensoras de derechos humanos<sup>269</sup>".

This document is the result of an action directed to strength social organizations regarding protection of human rights defenders at risk, an initiative that take part of a wider process of protection for defenders that we are running since many years here at CEAR Euskadi, and that started from our collaboration with the Basque protection programme, together with other human rights organizations and protection mechanisms of Spain.

#### 16. Has CEAR Euskadi adopted a gender policy or strategy?

Yes, we have a "Plan de Acción de Género' (Gender action plan).

### 17. Do you have gender kind of data on your organization? How many women/men/LGBTQI work in CEAR and at what level?

CEAR-Euskadi	TOTAL	WOMEN	MEN
HIRED STAFF:	54	35	19
- Director	1	1	
- Directional team	4	2	2
- Intermediate stuff	5	3	2
VOLUNTEERING	49	34	15
BOARD OF DIRECTORS	6	2	4

We do have gender data, but no data concerning sexual orientation.

<sup>269</sup> Cear Euskadi, (2018) Proteger a quien defiende

#### 18. Do you have gender kind of data over your employees working on these tasks?

The technical team of CEAR Euskadi working on the Basque programme is composed of 2 people (2 women) entirely working on this. Moreover, 5 more people (3 men and 2 women) belonging to other areas of CEAR Euskadi (direction, administrative management, communication, legal department and social participation) dedicate part of their work on activities of the Basque programme.

#### 19. Do you have a gender budget?

#### No, we don't.

### 20. During the COVID-19 pandemic, how did you manage, and how are you managing the programme?

Currently the Programme hosts three defenders. Two of them from Colombia (1 woman and 1 man) and a person from Honduras (1 man). This year, the Basque organizations that integrate the Red de Apoyo are: Mugarik Gabe, Aldarte y Emigradas sin Fronteras (Basque human rights organizations, allied with the organizations of human rights defenders).

Until the declaration of the "State of alarm" for the COVID-19 health crisis, the initial group workshops were held, having the objective of: developing group cohesion; defining the public profile and the political and educational agenda, the meeting with the media and the health and psychological support; and the trainings on protection and safety. All these actions are the basis for the formulation of the public activities, and are developed by the Red de Apoyo, the ANSUR collective, Ekimen Elkartea and CEAR Euskadi.

During the lockdown the following aspects were defined together with the Red de Apoyo.

PUBLIC AGENDA (political, educational and media)

- <u>Readjustment of the political agenda</u>: spaces for meeting and meetings (institutions, human rights organizations) by digital tools, elaboration of topics and reports regarding the impacts of the measures implemented by COVID-19 in the defence of human rights.
- <u>Search and facilitation of online training</u>: In order to facilitate the online political and training agenda, the computer equipment available to defenders in their accommodation has been improved and updated.
- <u>Media tour</u>: on Friday, April 3<sup>rd</sup>, a Press Release was issued. Different interviews have been arranged in conventional and alternative media.

#### **INTEGRAL HEALTH** (psychotherapeutically and physical support)

As many other people, the defenders are feeling uncertainty, frustration and fear, adding to the emotional and physical impact that they were already experiencing, as a consequence of the violence suffered for their work on human rights defence. They are experiencing the lockdown while being far from their family, collective and community. They come from countries where violence against human rights defenders and rural and ethnic community is increasing; and where the quarantine is economically challenging a population which is already very poor. To deal with this situation, the following activities are developed:

- <u>Psychotherapeutic support</u>: Individual psychotherapeutic sessions (weekly) with Ekimen Elkartea is maintained (the cabinet has remained open during confinement, strictly complying with security measures).
- <u>Physical health</u>: they are covered by private medical insurance and Health Cards that give them access to the Basque Health Service (Osakidetza).
- <u>Follow-up</u>: those in charge of the Programme and the organizations of the Red de Apoyo are communicating daily with the defenders by telephone (calls, video calls and WhatsApp).

Each week, the responsible person for the Programme visits the defenders' accommodation and delivers the items for personal protection (masks, gloves and hydrogel), and each month they receive the pocket money.

#### **DOCUMENTS SITUATION** (resident permits processing):

With the Immigration offices closed and procedures paralyzed, applications for a one-year residence permit, to which the visa gives access, are also paralyzed. After the start of the deescalation, they were reactivated and they already have the resolutions.

#### **RETURN**:

There are no guarantees that the return can occur in July. Facing the general uncertainty and the unstable situation, we are working on defining possible scenarios, always taking into account the safety and wellbeing of defenders.

#### The field visits are suspended and moved to the next year.

## APPENDIX IX: Biographies of the defenders hosted in Bilbao in the context of the "Programa vasco de proteccion de Defensoras y Defensores de Derechos Humanos"

#### NESTOR HERNANDEZ

Human Rights Defender of the young LGBTQI people in Honduras

Activist, Human Rights Defender and law student in Honduras with over 6 years of personal and professional experience of Leadership, Social Projects, Internet Activism, Access to Justice, AIDs/STI, Public Safety and Participative Democracy. Currently, Nestor has the role of Executive Director of "Asociación Honduras Diversa", which is in charge of creating safe spaces for young LGBTQI people, favouring the youth empowerment, mental health and sexual and reproductive rights. Similarly, Honduras Diversa works on human rights defence, and giving support and attention to cases of human rights violation, and to sexual orientation and gender identity discrimination, in this way helping LGBTQI people to access the justice system. Honduras Diversa has also attracted the interest of more than 600 university students of Human rights over the topic of related to LGBT. Thanks to Honduras Diversa, the PRIDE MUSIC FESTIVAL was launched, where LGBTQI artists from Honduras participate to promote the interconnection and visibility of the collective. In addition, Nestor is the coordinator of CJC (Comisión juvenil contra la Corrupción), which was developed on December 2019 for supporting the MACCIH and the UFECIF.

He is also one of the representatives of the Multiparty Commission Against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras, which brings together Civil Society Organizations, Political Parties, Private Enterprise and Social Movements. He is currently a beneficiary of the Basque Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders of the Basque Government.

#### PAOLA ANDREA ARARAT NAZARIT

#### Human Rights and Ethnic-Territorial Rights Defender

We (ACONC) are an ethnic territorial organization of second level that gathers 43 community councils of black community in northern Cauca and ethnic organizations, located within 10 municipalities of the region. The association is based on the law 70 of 1993, decree 1745 of 1995 and the own law that is part of the ancestral practices of the black communities in their territories. PALENQUE DDHH – ACONC: leads initiatives of the black community, in order to strength the exercise and benefit of fundamental economic, political and social human rights, aimed at reducing poverty, unemployment, the fight against discrimination and exclusion, strengthening the presence in the ancestral territory, care for Afro communities suffering conditions of displacement, confinement, and constraint in regards of their individual and collective rights. In addition, it works for the physical, emotional, psychological, spiritual, cultural, ethnic and collective integrity of the black community in northern Cauca, with commitment in the Human rights and ethnic and cultural integrity, as well as the axis of Humanitarian Crisis, Victims, Post-conflict of the Plan of Good Living 2015 – 2035. It trains the community councils about human rights, ethnicterritorial rights, international human rights, collects complaints and reports on violation of human rights, ethnic-territorial rights, international humanitarian law and draw up alerts or communications, builds and activates a tool to monitor threats or risks suffered by the members of the Black People in Northern Cauca. It coordinates actions with DDHH delegates from the micro areas of the community councils in Northern Cauca, realizes activities based on dialogue to reflect about the situation of human rights in such territories, supports the coordination of common actions from organizations and institutions from national and international level, aiming to favour the ethnic cause in peace processes and agreements. Moreover, it participates to the dialogue with the national government for promoting and implementing 300 signed agreements supporting the black and Afro Colombian cause that are still unaccomplished for 33 years.

#### **APPENDIX X: Interview with Nestor Hernandez**

Interview type: semi structured Date interview: Main theme: Defender's biography Interviewee: Nestor Hernandez Organization: Honduras Diversa, Honduras Place: Spain, Bilbao (via Skype) Role of the interviewee: Executive Director

#### Interview themes:

- 1. LGBTQI situation in Honduras;
- 2. Defender's biography;
- 3. Temporary relocation programme.

#### Objectives:

Documenting the defender and his organization's life history, and collecting suggestions, expectations and ideas over the temporary relocation programme by the point of view of the guest.

Evaluation:

Still waiting the answers.

#### Questions:

1. According to the National Commissioner for Human Rights (Conadeh), at least 325 members of the lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans and intersex (LGBTI) community have been murdered in Honduras between 2009 and July 2019. In addition to this terrible data, it results a 95% impunity for cases of crimes against LGBTI people. Starting from these data, can you tell us a bit about the general situation in Honduras? In order to understand what is the framework in which you work.

2. Can you tell us the story of Honduras Diversa? How it started, with what objectives, what are the main activities? Can you explain to us what the Comisión juvenil contra la Corrupción (Youth Commission against Corruption) is?

3. How did you starte working with your organization? What did you do before?

4. In your role as Executive Director, what are the biggest challenges? How does this role affect your private life?

5. Can you share your strategies to fight in defence of human rights?

6. What could help increase the safety of you, your organization and the LGBTI community?

7. What does it mean to you to be a defender of human rights? How do you define yourself?

8. Why did you apply for a temporary relocation programme? What were your expectations?

9. What are the activities you prefer?

10. How are you experiencing this special pandemic situation?

11. Italy is developing a temporary relocation programme similar to the one in Bilbao, what would you advise us?

12. Do you have anything to add?

#### **APPENDIX XI: Interview with Paola Ararat Nazarit**

Interview type: semi structured Date interview: June 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020 Main theme: Defender's biography Interviewee: Paola Andrea Ararat Nazarit Organization: Palenque DDHH, Colombia Place: Spain, Bilbao (via Skype) Role of the interviewee: Spokesperson

#### Interview themes:

- 1. Afrodescendants community situation in Northern Cauca;
- 2. Defender's biography;
- 3. Temporary relocation programme.

#### Objectives:

Documenting the defender and his organization's life history, and collecting suggestions, expectations and ideas over the temporary relocation programme by the point of view of the guest.

#### Evaluation:

The answers and information provided by Paola are exhaustive and interesting. There have been no particular issues, besides the impossibility to be face to face due to the restrictions for COVID-19 pandemic.

#### Questions:

# 1. According to a public announcement of the Regional Indigenous Council of Cauca (CRIC), among the major issues in this area is the highest number of murdered leaders in all Colombia, and a strong social, political and economic crisis that strikes all communities and indigenous and farmers organizations. Can you tell me more about this situation?

The extended humanitarian crisis depends from structural racism, discrimination and exclusion that Afro descendants' communities have always suffered from part of the Colombian State. This crisis has developed from the armed conflict, the failure to respect the peace agreement and the failure of the state to respect the agreements signed with the Black community ("Pueblo Negro"), against which it has continued to implement a process of denial, expropriation of rights and territories. This situation has worsened because of the systematic use of homicides, persecutions, sentences, threats, evacuations, confinement, recruitment of minors, and violence against women as methods of annihilation of the community and its rights. The State, on all its levels (local, regional, national) did not act as rights guarantor, but instead it behaves according to financial interests, being the main actor and promoter of the war for the expropriation of communities' lands and rights.

The situation did not change during the isolation measures (for COVID-19), since the conflict for territorial control among various armed groups (dissidents of the FARC-EP, ELN, EPL) and the military response from the State continue to increase the level of inequality and injustice.

- At the beginning of April, on social networks, there were some threating vocal messages, in which, men identifying as FARC-EP members, announced their presence in the municipalities of Buenos Aires and Suarez, Cauca, declaring the citizens of Munchique, Honduras, Palo Blanco and Portogallo as military target, because they did not respect the restriction rules for preventing COVID-19 spreading.
- On April 13<sup>th</sup> 2020 a threat to the integrity and life of Rossana Mejía Caicedo, current ACONC Senior Advisor, and Alfredo Bonilla Balanta was disclosed. In addition, some accusations and violence against the Guardia Cimarrona, from part of the public forces, were reported.
- On April 18<sup>th</sup>, during legitimate territorial prevention checks carried out by the Guardia Cimarrona "Kekelo Ri Tielo Prieto" for COVID-19 containment, at Caloto Santander street in Quilichao Cauca at 20:30 - Alfredo Bonilla Balanta, representing Yarumito Community Council of Caloto, has been victim of an attempted murdered. Luckily, he and the man with him have resulted uninjured, and the attack is currently under investigations.
- On April 22<sup>nd</sup>, in the night, several armed people on motorcycle have threaten various groups of the Guardia Cimarrona on Lomita and Balsa trails, while they were busy with a territorial check for COVID-19 containment, in Buenos Aires municipality. An hour before this happened, the army went through the area supervised by the Guardia Cimarrona.
- On April 22<sup>nd</sup>, at 19:00, two strangers on a motorcycle entered La Balsa village, Buenos Aires municipality, area 5. The men fired indiscriminately at everything and everyone and then fled. The same day, in a rural area on Suarez municipality, Cauca, the presence of illegally armed people was reported. In the following days, the presence of the national army was reported, on sidewalks and people's house entrances, violating international human rights and increasing the risk for the population. The community has reported its concern regarding a possible conflict between the parts.
- On April 26<sup>th</sup>, around 21:00, an hour after the Guardia Cimarrona finished its territorial check for the COVID-19 containment in Chambimbe village, Buenos Aires municipality, some heavily armed men raided the village in El Alto sector. These men used long-range weapons against the population, causing three deaths and four wounded, and then they threw two grenades, which luckily did not kill anyone. Few days before, an audio was shared on social medias, in which FARC threatened various communities, including Munchique village, declaring them military target for violating the mandatory quarantine. After the attack, a flayer was distributed, where the FARC claimed the attack and declaried that whoever will not respect the mandatory quarantine, would be considered military objective.

These are only some of the events representing the humanitarian crisis suffered by the ancestral territory in northern Cauca, as well as in other areas of the country where the situation has impoverished, marginalized and stigmatized the territories.

### 2. Can you tell us the history of ACONC? How it started, what are the objectives, and what are the main activities?

In 1995, the first community council of black communities in Colombia was created (Cerro Teta), in Cauca department, in the Northern sub-region of Cauca, as recognized by the law 70 of 1993, chapter 3. ""The community councils of Black communities are legal entities whose creation is registered in article 5 of law 70 of 1993, regulated by decree 1745 of 1995. A black community can establish a Community Council which, as a legal entity, exercises the highest authority for the internal administration of the Black Community Lands, in accordance with the constitutional and legal mandates that govern it and with the others assigned by the specific legal system of each community". Since this date, various community councils were created in Northern Cauca, in the areas where the majority of the population is Afro descendants. Later on, some municipality spaces for meetings were developed, in order to discuss and deliberate about environmental issues and the reinforcement of the communities. In 2003, a community leader started the process of articulation of all councils of Northern Cauca, creating the Association of Community Councils of the North Cauca (ACONC). ACONC officially started in Suarez Cauca municipality and it leads to the first organizational political process for the black community. This resulted on the "Ethnographic Development Plan of the black People of Northern Cauca", valid for 2015-2035. The plan is organized on 11 themes that indicate the programmes and paths to reach human and ethnical territorial rights recognition. Each theme is developed by a group ("Palenque"), who become responsible for the related programmes.

Palenque for Human Rights objectives:

- Legal assistance to guarantee collective and individual compensation by the Colombian state in favour of the victims of the black conflict in the northern part of the Cauca.
- Promote the guarantee and respect of human rights, territorial ethnic rights and the particular protection of the practices, customs and ancestral knowledge of the communities of the black people of the northern part of the Cauca.

#### Activities

- Memory for Peace
- Popular consultation and cultural objection ("objecion cultural")
- Humanitarian agreement and international humanitarian law.
- Post-conflict: reconciliation, forgiveness and opportunity.
- Human rights, ethnic and cultural integrity.
- System of collective and integral protection of the territory.
- Meeting of the municipal councils of the northern part of the Cauca.
- Care of the territory.
- Protection of culture, customs and ancestral knowledge.
- Historical reparation of the decade of African descent.

#### 3. How did you start to work/collaborate with your organization? What did you do before?

Since when I was at school, I always participated to meetings, discussions, teachings and celebrations organized in the community spaces; in this way, after helping on some activities for my Community Council in the Agua-Blanca-Aslazia river basin, I began to participate more assiduously and to be delegated to regional spaces. In one of the regional meeting, a group member invited me to participate to their meetings and since that time I am working with them. Since 2016 I worked for the fulfilment of the objectives and programmes.

#### 4. What is your role? What are your activities?

I worked in the "human rights and ethnic and cultural integrity" group. My main activities are: train members of community councils on human rights, ethno-territorial rights; collect reports of threats and violations of human rights, ethno-territorial rights and international humanitarian law; write and disseminate notices or communications regarding these complaints; build and activate awareness-raising paths on the threats and risks that the members of the Black People of Northern Cauca encounter every day; organize activities based on dialogue for reflection on the human rights situation in the territories of community councils, help in the coordination of joint actions with organizations and institutions on the national and international territory for the implementation of some of the points present in the peace agreement and other peace processes.

### 5. In which way your participation to Palenque influence your personal life? What are the biggest challenges?

What is related to my personal safety represents one of the aspects that changed the most, since, due to actions that we took, threatening messages and flyers started to come. These threats bring a radical change in daily life and the study of self-protection strategies.

The biggest challenges for me are: the restitution of ethnic territorial rights, the implementation of a system of collective and integral territorial protection, and the possibility to establish an humanitarian agreement that allow us to mitigate the organizational-communitarian sufferance that we are currently experiencing, in order to focus on more important needs for the wellbeing of everyone.

#### 6. Can you share/tell your strategies for fighting in defence of human rights?

We follow our inheritance, our ancestral traditions, claiming our dignity, human and ethnical rights as black community victim of racialization.

### 7. What could increase the safety of you, your organization and the Afro descendants community in general?

- The effective implementation of the peace agreement;
- Establishing a humanitarian agreement between the actors present in Colombia;
- Continuing to strengthen our self-care plans;
- The strengthening of our organizational process;
- International accompaniment;

#### 8. What does it means to you to be a human right defender? How would you define yourself?

Working for the dignity and equity of every men and woman.

I define myself as a black woman, a Christian (Efesini 4:5-6 Reina-Valera 1960 (RVR1960)) who is getting to know the inheritance of the elderlies, though a learning, freedom and recognition process of my cultural identity, which allows me to contribute for fighting in defence of our dignity as black community.

#### 9. Why did you apply for a temporary relocation programme? What were your expectations?

The risks that we encounter in the territory - because of our activity of reporting a human right violation, confronting who violates it, proposing a different point of view – constantly bring us threats from part of illegal groups, a situation in which my organization offered me to leave the territory for a while, for protecting my life, rest from fears and rehabilitate myself emotionally, psychologically and mentally. A second reason is making visible the extended humanitarian crisis that my ancestral territory is going through.

I expected to heal from fears in psychological, emotional and physical terms; to discover new visions, to discover, for the first time, a developed country, its culture, its people, to understand how the territory is seen from the outside, to learn new strategies and tools that can contribute to our community's resilience, and my personal life, as a young black woman. Strengthening and creating new solidarity networks...and many other expectations.

#### 10. What are your favourite activities/parts?

- Participating in activities that generate knowledge, which allow us to see the diversity of the realities in which we live, in which they all form a single whole.
- Activities of reflection, of political impact.
- Training activity
- Recreational activities.

#### 11. How are you experiencing this pandemic situation?

I am at home, following the heath authorities' recommendations, and helping my organizations with some ideas. Here, we are living within uncertainty, fearing a possible contagion, economic and social consequences, but in my country, there is more to fear: the humanitarian crisis has worsened. Because of territorial conflicts, and rules imposed by outlaw groups, the armed forces of Colombian State attacked our community members, even with homicides.

### 12. Italy is developing a temporary relocation programme similar to the one in Bilbao, what would you advise us?

- Collaborate / learn from the wonderful CEAR team. Leire and Veronica and the support organizations (Red de apoyo) who have been with us since we got here are great at making the defenders' stay a success.
- Psychological accompaniment is very important.
- Free time is very important
- Accompaniment for visibility and political impact.
- Activities and training moments in different areas.

#### 13. Do you have anything to add?

I wish to have full support from the government, as I have in this case (the Basque government), since these protection strategies help to protect everyone's life, to mitigate the risk and to keep on defending the territories.

#### Original language questions and answers

1. Según un comunicado del Consejo Regional Indígena del Cauca (CRIC) entre los problemas mas grandes de esta zona hay el numero mas alto de líderes y lideresas asasinadoas de toda Colombia y una fuerte crisis política, económica y sociales que afecta todas las comunidades y las organizaciones indígenas y campesinas. ¿Nos puedes contar algo mas de la situación general en el Cauca?

La crisis humanitaria prolongada tiene sus orígenes en el racismo estructural, la discriminación y la exclusión a la que fue sometida las comunidades negras por el Estado colombiano a lo largo de la historia. Dicha crisis se agudiza con el conflicto armado, el incumplimiento del acuerdo de paz, incumplimiento de acuerdos firmados con el Pueblo Negro; con el cual dio continuidad a un proceso de negación, expropiación de derechos y territorios. Crisis se agudiza hasta llegar a la práctica sistemática de homicidios, persecuciones, judicializaciones, amenazas, desplazamiento y confinamiento, reclutamiento a menores, y violencia contra la mujer como método de aniquilación, expropiación de la comunidad y sus derechos. El Estado, en todos sus niveles (local, regional, nacional) no ha cumplido su papel de garante de los derechos, sino que ha sido funcional a los intereses económicos, como actor y promotor principal de la guerra, de la expropiación de los territorios, y de los derechos de las comunidades.

Situación que no ha sido diferente en las medidas de aislamiento, dado que la disputa por el control territorial entre los diferentes grupos armados (disidencias de las FARC-EP, ELN, EPL) entre otros, y La respuesta militar por parte del Estado que hay en el territorio sigue profundizando los niveles de desigualdad.

Algunos de los hechos presentados en la cuarentena en municipios del norte del Cauca.

- Al inicio del mes de abril, circularon audios amenazantes por redes sociales, donde hombres identificándose como integrantes de las FARC-EP, anunciaron su presencia en los municipios de Buenos Aires y Suarez, Cauca, declarando de forma directa objetivo militar a los habitantes de las veredas Munchique, Honduras, Palo Blanco y Portugal, por no acatar las órdenes de confinamiento para evitar la propagación del COVID-19.
- 13 de abril de 2020 se tuvo conocimiento de una amenaza en contra la integridad y la vida de la Rossana Mejía Caicedo actual consejera Mayor de ACONC y Alfredo Bonilla Balanta; hechos que fueron denunciados y también son materia de investigación. También se suma la estigmatización y señalamiento irresponsables de los que ha sido víctima la guardia cimarrona por parte de la fuerza pública situación denunciada en su memento.
- El sábado 18 de abril de 2020; en el marco de los legítimos controles territoriales de prevención que adelantan la guardia cimarrona Kekelo Rí Tielo Prieto para evitar la propagación del COVID19; en la vía Caloto Santander de Quilichao Cauca, a las 8:30 pm

Alfredo Bonilla Balanta quien representa al Consejo Comunitario Yarumito de Caloto, fue víctima de un atentado contra su vida, afortunadamente él y el hombre de protección salieron ilesos; este hecho es materia de investigación.

- En la noche del 22 de abril, hombres armados que se movilizaban en motocicletas de alto cilindraje hostigaron de manera simultánea a las Guardia Cimarronas en el punto de la vereda Lomitas y en La Balsa, mientras ésta se encontraba ejerciendo control territorial y contención para evitar la propagación del virus COVID-19, en el municipio de Buenos Aires. Una hora antes del hecho, el ejército había pasado por los puntos de control de la Guardia Cimarrona.
- El 22 de abril, siendo aproximadamente las 7:00 de la noche, dos sujetos desconocidos que se movilizaban en una motocicleta, irrumpieron la tranquilidad en el corregimiento de la Balsa, municipio de Buenos Aires Cauca, sector del cinco. Los hombres llegaron y dispararon indiscriminadamente y luego se retiraron del lugar. El mismo día se registró presencia de actores armados ilegales en zona rural del municipio de Suarez, Cauca, días después hizo presencia en el territorio el Ejército Nacional, ubicándose en los andenes de las viviendas de la población civil, violando el derecho Internacional Humanitario y aumentando los riesgos para la población. La comunidad alerta sobre el riesgo de enfrentamiento entre los dos actores.
- El 26 de abril, siendo aproximadamente las 9:00 p.m, una hora después de que la guardia cimarrona levantara el control territorial para prevenir la propagación del covid19 de la vereda Chambimbe, en el Municipio de Buenos Aires, Cauca, hombres fuertemente armados irrumpieron en la vereda en el sector el Alto. Los hombres accionaron indiscriminadamente sus armas de largo alcance contra las personas, dejando un saldo de 3 personas muertas y 4 heridos, acto seguido lanzaron dos granadas que afortunadamente no dejaron pérdidas humanas. Días antes circuló un audio por redes sociales donde las FARC amenazaban varias comunidades entre ella la vereda Munchique y los declaraban objetivo militar por irrumpir el aislamiento obligatorio. Posterior a la masacre, circulo un panfleto donde las FARC se atribuyen este hecho, y manifiestan que es solo el comienzo, que siguen siendo objetivo militar las personas que no cumplan con el aislamiento preventivo obligatorio.

Estos son solo algunas especificaciones de la crisis humanitaria por las que pasa el territorio ancestral del norte del departamento del Cauca, asi como de otras partes del pais donde han empobrecido, marginado, estigmatizados los territorios.

### 2. Nos puedes contar la historia de ACONC? ¿Como nació, con cuales objetivos, cuales son las actividades principales?

En 1995 se crea en Colombia, departamento del Cauca; en la subregión norte del Cauca, el primer consejo comunitario (Cerro teta) de comunidades negras reconocido en la ley 70 del 1993 capitulo 3° "Los Consejos Comunitarios de las Comunidades Negras son personas jurídicas cuya creación se registra en el artículo 5° de la ley 70 de 1993, reglamentada en el decreto 1745 de 1995. Una comunidad negra podrá constituirse en Consejo Comunitario, que como persona jurídica ejerce la máxima autoridad de administración interna dentro de las Tierras de las Comunidades Negras, de acuerdo con los mandatos constitucionales y legales que lo rigen y los

demás que le asigne el sistema de derecho propio de cada comunidad. que tienen entre sus funciones las de administrar internamente las tierras de propiedad colectiva que se les adjudique, delimitar y asignar áreas al interior de las tierras adjudicadas, velar por la conservación y protección de los derechos de la propiedad colectiva, la preservación"

A partir de esta fecha se fueron creando los consejos comunitarios en el norte del Cauca, por los diferentes municipios donde mayoritariamente su población es Afrocolombiana. Luego de este proceso seguían los espacios municipales de encuentro para discutir, deliberar por temas ambientales, fortalecimientos organizativos entre otros temas; fue así como en el 2003 una lideresa, inicia todo el proceso para la articulación de todos los consejos comunitarios de la región norte del Cauca, naciendo La Asociación De Consejos Comunitarios Del Norte Del Cauca -Aconc en el municipio de Suarez Cauca, dando paso a todo un proceso político organizativo del Pueblo Negro, años más tarde 2009 se registra por primera vez la personería jurídica de la organización. Durante todo este proceso en los diferentes encuentros de deliberación y construcción se fue diseñando la ruta que se llamó para ese entonces El Plan De Etnodesarrollo Del Pueblo Negro Del Norte Del Cauca, esta construcción significo muchos encuentros, esfuerzos y trabajo regional, obteniendo como resultado la primera versión del plan 2015-2035. El plan está organizado en 11 ejes temáticos que trazan las rutas y los programas para llevar acabo el desarrollo de cada derecho humano y étnico territorial que corresponda. Cada eje temático en lo operativo se vuelve un palenque; que es quien se encarga de desarrollar los programa que contiene.

Los ejes 1. crisis humanitaria, victimas y post acuerdo, 2. Derechos humanos integridad étnica y cultura en lo operativo se conoce como El Palenque De Derecho Humanos Integridad Étnica Y Cultural de ACONC quien se encarga de la operatividad estos dos ejes **Del Plan De Buen Vivir Del Pueblo Negro Y Afrocolombiano Del Norte Del Cauca 2015 – 2035 ¡cambios para vivir mejor!** *Versión actualizada.* 

#### **Objetivos del Palenque**

Incidir ante el Estado colombiano para que garantice la reparación colectiva e individual a favor de las víctimas del conflicto del pueblo negro del norte del Cauca.

Promover la garantía y respeto a los derechos humanos, a los derechos étnico territoriales, a la especial protección de las prácticas, los usos, las costumbres y los saberes ancestrales de las comunidades del Pueblo Negro del Norte del Cauca.

#### Actividades

- Memoria para la Paz
- Consulta previa y objeción cultural
- Acuerdo humanitario y Derecho Internacional Humanitario.
- Postconflicto: reconciliación, perdón y oportunidades.
- Derechos humanos, integridad étnica y cultural
- Sistema de protección colectiva e integral del territorio
- Encuentro de consejos comunitarios del norte del Cauca.

- Cuidando al cuidador del territorio
- Protección de la Cultura, usos, costumbres y Saberes Ancestrales
- Década de Afrodescendiente (pasos para la reparación Histórica)

#### 3. Como llegaste a trabajar con tu organización? ¿Que hacías anteriormente?

Desde que cursaba la escuela he participado en espacios comunitarios de reuniones, discusiones, de enseñanzas y celebraciones; es así como después de venir ayudando a realizar las tareas en mi Consejo Comunitario Cuenca Del Rio Agua Blanca - La Alsacia, inicio a participar y ser delega a los espacios regionales; donde en uno de ellos, una integrante del palenque me invito a participar de una reunión y me quede participando en este palenque, desde el 2016 a la fecha he ayudado para que sus objetivos y programas se cumplan.

#### 4. Cual es tu rol? ¿Cuales son tus actividades?

- Dinamizo el palenque de derechos humanos integridad étnica y cultural de Aconc
- Las actividades están en marcadas en: capacitar a los integrantes de los consejos comunitarios sobre los derechos humanos, derechos étnico territoriales, recepcionar quejas y denuncias sobre violación a los derechos humanos, derechos étnico territoriales, derecho internacional humanitario y sacar las respectivas alertas o comunicados, construir y activar una ruta de atención sobre amenazas o riesgos que sufran los integrantes del Pueblo Negro Del Norte Del Cauca, realizar actividades basadas en el dialogo para reflexionar en torno a la situación de los derechos humanos en los territorio de los consejos comunitarios, co-adyudar en la coordinación de acciones con organizaciones, e instituciones del territorio nacional e internacional para la implementación del capítulo étnico del acuerdo de paz y otros procesos de paz.

### 5. Tu participación en Palenque como afecta tu vida privada? ¿Cuales son los retos mayores?

- Altero más mi seguridad como persona, dado que por las diferentes acciones que desempeñamos iniciaron a llegar panfletos amenazantes, lo que implico hacer cambios y dedicar más tiempos analizar y proponer propuestas de autoprotección.
- Los retos mayores son restitución de los derechos étnico-territoriales, el sistema de protección colectiva e integral del territorio y poder establecer un acuerdo humanitario que nos permita mitigar el sufrimiento organizativo comunitario por el que pasamos para avanzar en otros que son muy importantes e integran la ruta para el buen vivir.

#### 6. Puedes compartir vuestras estrategias de lucha en la defensa de los derechos humanos?

Seguimos el legado ancestral por la reivindicación de nuestra dignidad, por los derechos humanos y étnicos como Pueblo Negro racializado.

7. ¿Cosa podría ayudar en incrementar la seguridad tuya, de tu organización y de la comunidad negra?

- La implementación efectiva del acuerdo de paz.
- Establecer un acuerdo humanitario.
- Seguir fortaleciendo nuestros planes de autocuidado.
- El fortalecimiento del proceso organizativo.
- El acompañamiento internacional.
  - Entre otros.

#### 8. Que significa para ti ser una defensora de los derechos humanos? Como te defines?

- Trabajar por la dignidad y equidad para todo-as.
- Me defino como una mujer negra, cristina (Efesios 4:5-6 Reina-Valera 1960 (RVR1960)) que está conociendo el legado de mayores y mayoras, en un camino de aprendizajes, de libertad, de reconocimiento de mi identidad cultural que me permite aportar a la lucha por nuestra dignidad como Pueblos Negros.

#### 9. Porque aplicaste por un programa de acogida temporal? Cual eran tu expectativas?

- Los riesgos por los que pasamos en el territorio por el simple hecho de documentar una violación a los derechos humanos, por enfrentar a alguien cuando los violenta, por plantear un punto de vista diferente, nos vuelve objeto de constantes amenazas y monitoreo por parte de grupos al margen de lay, situación por la que la organización decidió proponerme que me alejara un tiempo de forma física del territorio para proteger mi vida, descansar de los miedos y rehabilitarme emocional, psicológica, mentalmente; por otro lado visibilizar la crisis humanitaria prolongada por la que pasa el territorio ancestral.
- Mis expectativas estaban al alrededor de sanar un poco los miedos en cuanto a lo psicológico, emocional, físico; conocer nuevas visiones, conocer por primera vez un país desarrollado, su cultura, su gente, entender como se ve el territorio desde afuera, aprender estrategias y herramientas que nos sigan aportando a la resiliencia de nuestras comunidades, a mi vida como persona, como mujer negra y joven. Fortalecer y crear nuevas redes de solidaridad..., muchas expectativas más.

#### 10. Cuales son las actividades que prefieres?

- Participar de espacios que generen conocimiento, que permitan ver la diversidad de realidades en las que vivimos en la cual todas forman un solo conjunto.
- Espacios de reflexión, de incidencia política.
- Espacios formativos
- Espacios de recreación.

#### 11. Como estas viviendo esta situación extraordinaria de pandemia?

En casa siguiendo las recomendaciones de las autoridades sanitaria, también ayudando con algunas ideas para mi organización. Aquí se vive la incertidumbre, el miedo a un posible contagio, a las consecuencias económicas, sociales, pero en mi país no es solo esto, sino la crisis humanitaria agudizada; que hay por la disputa del control territorial, las reglas que imponen los grupos al margen de la ley, también las fuerzas armadas del Estado colombianos han violentado los integrantes de nuestras comunidades llegando a asesinatos..., bueno son muchas las situaciones por las que se pasa allí.

### 12. Nosotroas en Italia estamos construyendo un programa de acogida similar a lo de Bilbao, cosa nos aconsejarías?

- Una asesoría con el maravilloso equipo de CEAR, estaría bien. Leire y Verónica, las organizaciones de apoyo o (red de apoyo) quienes siempre nos han acompañado desde que llegamos aquí son geniales para sacar adelante la estadía de los defensores y defensoras.
- El acompañamiento psicológico es muy importante.
- El tiempo de descanso que se contempla es muy importante
- El acompañamiento para la visibilizacion e incidencia política.
- Los espacios de formación en diferentes áreas.

#### 13. Tienes algo que añadir?

Espero que puedan contar con todo el apoyo del gobierno, igual que aquí; ya que es un proceso muy importante el que adelantan, estas estrategias de protección ayudan muchísimo a todo-as para proteger su vida, mitigar los riesgos y seguir la defensa por los territorios.

#### **APPENDIX XII: Defenders' sheets**

#### **DEFENDER PROFILE #1**

Name: Svitlana Valko

**Profession Project Coordinator** 

Country: Ukraine

Temporary Relocation programme: Shelter City - Middelburg

Year: 2016

Specialisation: war crimes, crimes against humanity, monitoring and report

The work done by Svitlana and her organization plays a very important role in the defence of human rights and those who defend them. The political situation of the region, with the entrance of Russia into the already unstable situation, got worse and human rights violations became systematic and more brutal. In Crimea, Russia imposed a strong limitation to freedom of expression, assembly and association, making the activists of pro-Ukraine possible victims of both paramilitary and official authorities. Svitlana is the coordinator of a project aiming to report war crimes and crimes against humanity in the conflict area of Est Ukraine and Crimea, since 2014. Her work includes: field work missions, training of reporters and reports writing; all these activities expose her to risk of violence, torture, kidnapping and arbitrary detention. She, as many defenders, had the opportunity to take part of the temporary relocation programme offered by Justice & Peace in the Netherlands, in which she spent 3 months resting, continuing her work and sharing her story and the one of her country during public events<sup>270</sup>. After her return to Georgia, she decided to open the first international Shelter City in Tbilisi, the capital, where defenders from Russia, Byelorussia, Kirghizstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Iraq and some areas of Ukraine can rest for a few months.

<sup>270</sup> Svitlana Valko, https://sheltercity.nl/en/mrv/svitlana/

Name: David Gómez Gamboa,

Profession University professor and director of Aula Abierta NGO

Country: Venezuela

Temporary Relocation programme: Shelter City - Utrecht

Year: 2020

Specialisation: defence of academic rights and freedoms.

The organizations working for human rights defence and promotion in Venezuela are aften facing episodes of reprisals and retaliation by the government, who considers defenders and activists as dangerous and unwelcomed people. David Gómez Gamboa, university professor and human rights defender, works on the defence of academic freedom and the autonomy right of universities. With his colleagues of "Aula Abierta" NGO, he is committed to reporting and denouncing human rights violations in the academic context, and in training students and professors interested in human rights. Since the beginning of his work as director of Aula Abierta, in 2013, it has been noticed an increasing repression against critical intellectuals and universities that are not in line with the government politics. The University of Zulia, where David works, has suffered few attacks, for instance the police entered in the academic buildings, the funds have been cut, and the student demonstrations have been criminalized. The budget cuts makes it extremely difficult to guarantee the basic services of the university, among which the possibility to conduct independent research, an activity that is now almost totally cancelled. David's participation to the Shelter City – Utrecht programme allowed him to keep on working, wiritng and promoting the importance of academic freedom in a safe and quite space. During his stay in the Netherlands, which from three become six months due to the COVID-19, David could recover part of his work that he couldn't execute in Venezuela because of the situation of his city. Since 2016 Venezuela suffers lack of resources and basic necessities, interruptions in the supply of drinkable water, electricity and other public services. In Utrecht, David could write and publish an essay on academic freedom in Latin America and he started to work following his most recent book "Libertad Academica y Autonomia Universitaria: una mirada desde los Derechos Humanos. Refeferencia en Venezuela (2010-2019)" published in 2019.

For the full interview, see: Appendix XVII

Name: Paola Ararat Nazarit,

Profession: ACONC spokesperson - Palenque DDHH

Country: Colombia

Temporary Relocation programme: Temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders of CEAR Euskadi - Bilbao

Year: 2020

Specialisation: Trainings for Afro descendants' communities on their rights and human rights in general. Reporting and monitoring of human rights violations; organizing activities of cooperation between communities, institutions and international organizations.

In recent years, the extended humanitarian crisis of Cauca area - which originates in the structural racism, discrimination and exclusion of the Afro descendants' communities from all the decisional process, as planned from the Colombian State - has been aggravated by the disrespect of the peace agreement and the other agreements signed by the State with the Black People ("Pueblo Negro"). Within this crisis situation, which entailed a high number of homicides, persecutions, threats and violence of every kind, the Colombian government did not guarantee citizens' rights and safety, instead revealing itself as an actor of the conflict against Afro descendants' communities for their land expropriation. In this context, the work of Paola and the "Asociación de Consejos Comunitarios del Norte del Cauca (ACONC)", of which it belongs, is very important in the defence and promotion of communities and Afro descendants' communities rights. Active from a young age, Paola has always participated in initiatives, discussions and celebrations organized by the Community Council in the Agua Bianca river basin, the territory where she grew up. In 2016 she officially joined the human rights workgroup of ACONC, taking various responsibilities, especially within education and reporting of human rights violation. Among the daily activities of Paola, there are: the training of the members of the various community councils on the subject of human rights and laws; the organization of awareness events on the issues of threats and risks experienced by the Afro descendant populations; the implementation of joint actions with other local associations, institutions and international organizations; and the dissemination of reports of violations collected. Due to her work, Paola, as many other colleagues, has often suffered from threats and she got the attention of various hostile groups. For this reason, the ACONC decided to propose her for the Basque temporary relocation programme managed by CEAR Euskadi, during the first semester of 2020. During her stay in Bilbao she could rest and work on her psychophysical well-being thanks to a personalized programme of psychological support, besides networking for ACONC and sharing her story to a new and international audience.

For the full interview, see: Appendix XI

Name: Anna Artemeva

Profession: Photo reporter - Novaya Gazeta

Country: Russia

Temporary Relocation programme: Journalists-in-Residence Lipsia

Year: 2020

Specialisation: press freedom and human rights

Novaya Gazeta, one of the last online independent newspaper in Russia, it does not avoid critiques to the president Vladimir Putin and its government, and consequently, the security of both the newspaper and its journalists is in constant danger. During the last 25 years, six journalists and collaborators of Novaya Gazeta have been killed due to their job. In Russia, the journalists and the media workers operate in an explicitly hostile environment, controlled by a government that in the last year enacted a law (with the complicity of the COVID-19 pandemic) which has further restricted both the autonomy and press freedom<sup>271</sup>.

Anna Artemeva works for this newspaper as photo-reporter since 2009; during this period, she received pressures and threats and she saw harassed and arrested colleagues, as well as she, received envelopes with unknown substances, severed animal heads and funerary wreaths. As the consequence of her heavy situation, Anna fell in depression and discouragement in 2019, incapable of continuing her job due to the threats occurred in the last 10 years, yet also incapable of leaving journalism forever. Therefore, she decided to participate in the JiR programme in Leipzig, that allowed her to go away from a hostile context for six months and resting and recovering. The psychological assistance represented one of the most useful and important services, also thanks to the continuation of that after her return to Russia.

"After a permanence of 6 months in the beautiful city of Leipzig, I go back to my career – I fell in love with journalism again – now I feel renewed, inspired and excited. It does not matter how much you have been desperate and traumatised – the programme Journalists in Residence by ECPMF will bring you to life again and will help you to recharge your professional enthusiasm.". This was the thought of Anna at the end of her stay in Germany<sup>272</sup>.

For the complete interview, see appendix XIX

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> For more info on the argument: https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/09/03/the-change-of-power-in-russia-will-be-very-similar-to-my-arrest-a67119 and https://www.mappingmediafreedom.org/2020/07/09/journalist-found-guilty-of-justifying-terrorism/
 <sup>272</sup> JiR Alumni: https://www.ecpmf.eu/support-programmes/journalists-in-residence/anna-artemyeva-photojournalist-from-russia-jir-in-2020/

Name: hidden name

Profession: Philosopher

Temporary relocation programme: temporary relocation programme for scholars- SAR Trento

Year: 2020

Specialisation: intercultural philosophy, body and disease philosophy, African philosophy

Cameroonian philosopher emigrated due to both the conflict in the English-speaking part of the country and the persecutions against the English-speaking minority and the continuous attacks to the academic staff and the students. Its expertise is intercultural philosophy, body and disease philosophy, African philosophy. He is at his first experience outside Africa. His wife and 2 children are still stuck in Cameroon due to issues with the obtaining of the family reunification.

#### DEFENDER PROFILE # 6

Name: hidden name

Profession: Nutritional scientist

Country of origin: Yemen

Temporary relocation programme: temporary relocation programme for scholars- SAR Trento

Year: 2020

Specialisation: healing properties of the prickly pears, and nutritional science in general

Yemenite nutritional scientist emigrated due to the conflict in the country and because of being discriminated as a woman with an international experience in her university. She was returned in Yemen after having studied in Syria, Malaysia, United States, Sweden and this fact – besides being a woman – made her unpopular at the eyes of her department's chief. After the worsening of the conflict, she joined a protection programme in Germany for 2 years, and for that, she was fired by her university since she was a "traitor". Her field of expertise is the healing properties of the prickly pears, as well as of nutritional science in general. Her husband is still stuck in Egypt waiting for the obtaining of the reunification.

### APPENDIX XIII: Questions and answers from Javier Arjona's interview, ONGD Soldepaz Pachakuti

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: June 3rd, 2020

Main theme: The Asturian temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders

Interviewee: Javier Arjona

Organization: ONGD Soldepaz Pachakuti

Place: Spain, Asturias

Role of the interviewee: Spokesperson for the organization managing the protection programme

#### Interview themes:

- 1. When and why the programme was created;
- 2. What is meant by "diplomacia ciudadana por la paz";
- 3. How the Asturian delegation is formed and how does it work?

#### Objectives:

Analyse some aspects of the Asturian model of temporary relocation not present on the website or in the documents available on the internet.

#### Evaluation:

Questions have been sent by email, with the option of written or oral answers, through online platform such as Skype or Jitsi. The interviewee preferred to answer by writing and did so comprehensively and clearly. He has also made himself available in the future for further questions or clarifications.

### 1. When did the "Programma de Proteccion" started? What are the reasons that brought to it?

In 2001. In a context of persecution against unionists, with high numbers of homicides and threats, it was attempted, together with the unions, to find a way for temporary protection of some of the activists, since the Spanish government decreased the possibility of exile, in accordance to Colombian organizations, which did not intend to let depart their directors, through exile or death, and considering that a temporary stay abroad could reduce the persecution.

#### 2. What is meant by "diplomacia ciudadana por la paz"?

The social and political actions of defenders arriving to the Asturian programme, with the approval of their organizations. When they reach Asturias, they are called as Luciano Romero collective, in memory of a refugee that was murdered after returning to Valledupar. If there is agreement, they can address the public (and the media), organizations and institutions, to tell their experiences, expectations for democracy, peace and guarantees for life. This is called "diplomacia por la paz y los ddhh".

#### 3. What is, who forms it, and how does the "Delegación Asturiana de Verificación" work?

Together with PAV-DDHH it was considered useful to have an annual visit to understand the situation of human rights, since sometimes it could appear exaggerated and surprising by what is told by the people hosted in the programme. How it could exist such level of cruelty and terror against social activities? The visits started in 2005 and continued up 2020, in March, and the report is already available (Asturian, Spanish and English). So the Delegation have travelled for 16 years and its reports constitute a systematic support that was quoted in different occasions (including two times for negotiations in Havana). The reports have been presented to the European Parliament, the Spanish Congress and Senate, to the Asturian Parliament, and to the Asturian Council of Cooperation. The delegation is diverse, being composed by unions and social organization, between 8-14 components. Representants of Cataluña, Basque countries, Madrid and Burgos participated too. The visit agenda is planned by the Selection Committee of PAV-DDHH, i.e. the 9 Colombian organizations that select the people entering the Asturian programme. Due to the situation, each year they chose by consensus the most suitable areas to visit, in order to study the human rights situation thanks to the direct involvement with communities and organizations. In addition, there are institutional meetings with government and military authorities.

#### APPENDIX XIV: Acta de compromiso de la entidad solicitante en Euskadi

The \_\_\_\_\_\_ organization, with full knowledge of the Basque Program for the Temporary Protection of Human Rights Defenders and its implications.

UNDER THE BASQUE PROGRAM OF TEMPORARY PROTECTION FOR HUMAN RIGHTS DEFENDERS, I TO:

- 1. Inform the organization of the defender about the objectives of the Program and commitments assumed.
- 2. Maintain a respectful and caring treatment with the people hosted, the "Red de Apoyo" and the Programme coordination.
- 3. Maintain permanent and fluid communication with the organization at origin and with the Programme coordination.
- 4. Manage the defender's departure from the country, in coordination with the organization at origin and with the Programme coordination.
- 5. Carry out the necessary administrative tasks to justify the expenses related to the process of leaving the country (e.g. visa processing), in coordination with the organization at origin.
- 6. Actively collaborate in framing the political and training agenda of the defender, in coordination with the organization at origin and the Programme coordination.
- 7. Carry out the administrative tasks necessary to justify the expenses related to the political and training agenda.
- 8. Participate, together with the Programme coordination, in the reception process and in the return process of the defender.
- 9. Share with the Programme coordination the monitoring of the situation at origin (context) during the reception process and the return process of the defender.
- 10. Actively collaborate in the risk analysis and in the design of action plans after return, in coordination with the organization at origin and the Programme coordination.

- 11. Provide timely information on any change in the socio-political context that may affect the return of the defender.
- 12. Maintain permanent communication with the organization at origin in order to monitor the personal and organizational situation of the defender after the return.

#### APPENDIX XV: Questions and answers Tessa van Bommel, Justice & Peace

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: June 9th, 2020

<u>Main theme</u>: The Dutch temporary relocation programme for human rights defenders during the COVID-19 pandemic

Interviewee: Tess van Bommel

Organization: Justice & Peace

Place: The Netherlands, Utrecht

Role of the interviewee: Shelter City Programme Officer

#### Interview themes:

- 1. Defenders' agenda during Coronavirus;
- 2. Health insurance";
- 3. Return of the guest.

#### Objectives:

Analyse the Dutch model of temporary relocation and its functioning during the emergency of COVID-19 pandemic. How the planned activities were carried out, what are the challenges related to health, what are the prospects for the return of the people hosted.

#### Evaluation:

The main goal of the interview was reached. Tessa has also made himself available in the future for further questions and to keep in touch for updates and possible collaborations.

#### 1) Are you currently hosting any HRDs?

Yes, we are hosting two HRDs from Venezuela. One arrived in January together with the former group of defenders and the second joined us one week before the lockdown started in the Netherlands, she was the first participant of the new group. Afterwards, we decided to cancel the arrival of the rest of the second group of HRDs, expected for late March, due to the unclear and unstable situation. We are still not sure about the future of the program for the 2020.

### 2) how the agenda has been affected by the Covid-19 pandemic and how are you "saving" the activities already planned?

Due to the situation we had to organize all the possible activities through online platform. Both the HRDs have participated in different events, such as webinars, meetings and lectures with the government, universities and local organizations. We are still offering psychological support; our expert team are providing the HRDs with the possibility of having private therapy sections.

We were also able to maintain the holistic security training for both the HRDs currently hosted in the Netherlands and those who were supposed to arrive late March.

#### 3) Did the regular health insurance covers extraordinary treatment/test?

We didn't need any special upgrade or particular request. We only extended the health insurance for three more months.

#### 4) How are you organizing HRDs return?

We are still waiting for news and updates from both sides, Venezuelan and Dutch governments. So far there are no safe and sure flights from the Netherlands to Venezuela, so we have to wait. The legal status of the HRDs has been confirmed by the government so we don't have any issues regarding visa/documentation and both the accommodations/coordinator organizations have agreed to keep hosting them.

### APPENDIX XVI: Biography of the defender hosted in the Netherlands in the context of the Shelter City temporary relocation program

DAVID GOMEZ GAMBOA Right to education and Civic & Political Rights

Since 2014, David has been the director of the NGO Aula Abierta and coordinator of the Human Rights Commission of the University of Zulia (Venezuela), working on initiatives that promote and defend human rights in the university contexts, especially academic freedom, university autonomy and the right to quality education. Since 2002 he has developed an international background on human rights research (with NGOs and Universities) and he represents Venezuelan and Latin American civil society before the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights System and some Universal Human Rights System bodies.

#### **APPENDIX XVII: Interview with David Gomez Gamboa**

Interview type: semi structured Date interview: June 19<sup>th</sup>, 2020 Main theme: Defender's biography Interviewee: David Gomez Gamboa Organization: Aula Abierta ONG, Venezuela Place: The Netherlands, Utrecht Role of the interviewee: Director Interview themes:

- 1. Defender's biography;
- 2. Temporary relocation programme.

#### Objectives:

Documenting defender's life history and his organization, collecting suggestions, expectations and ideas on the temporary relocation programme from the point of view of a guest.

#### Evaluation:

The answers provided by David are exhaustive and interesting. There were no particular issues.

#### 1. As director of the "Aula Abierta" NGO, what are the biggest challenges you have to face? How this role influences your private life? And your professional life?

Aula Abierta organization is an association for human rights, working for the defence of academic rights. So, there are two roles in my life, one is being an university professor, a scientific researcher, and the other one is being human rights defender, specifically the rights and freedom of professors, researchers, students and the actors defending democracy. In the Venezuelan context, of a dictatorship, where the government fights against critical universities, critical professors and students, and criminalizes the demonstrations, besides carrying out human rights violation and tortures. It also establishes numerous targets, such as political opponents, human rights defenders, journalists (I am also a journalist) and university professors. So, there is a complex situation of high risk. The government is aiming to disrupting civil society and institutions, as in the Cuban case. What does it meant to disrupting the population? Disrupting the population means creating government's parallel institutions, delegitimizing the official ones, using the Macchiavelli's strategy "dividi et impera", creating a political of disinformation. From the ministry platform all the information related to economy, health, resources and education have been cancelled...This has brought chaos, disruption and demotivation within the population, I am referring to the social actors, which is guite difficult to face. What I am telling you, in my opinion, is the most challenging, because to re-build the social structure it takes time. When trying to work with people, the first answer would probably be "I don't want", "I can't", "I want to leave the country". One of the objectives of the government is for troublesome people to leave the country, which is an interesting and terrible thing at the same time, to see how the strategy is to disrupt society by motivating those people to leave. This government wants to create chaos, generalized chaos. Now I'm going to describe you the daily life in Venezuela. In my city, electricity is off 10-15 hours per day, since more than a year, and it has been already several years that we have suffered interruptions of 3-4 hours, few times per week. Lacking power is terrible! My city is the hottest in Venezuela, in summer every day is around 35-40 degrees, so you can imagine how it is living in such a city without power. Moreover, this also means that there is no phone service, internet, that after 7 p.m. when you come back home it looks like a cave. You need to organize your life depending on the few hours that you have power. Planning to survive, when to cook, when to wash the clothes. Before participating to the Shelter City programme, I couldn't work or write, because we had power at 3 a.m. and I had to do everything during the night. It's a shift for daily surviving. This kind of regime influences you psychologically, I could start writing only after leaving Venezuela, obviously this was one of the main reasons to join the programme. It's hard, really hard. Currently we have hyperinflation, we gain 4-5 dollars per month, which is worth a chicken. So, university professors have either leave the country or find ways to survive, such as selling food or goods bought in Colombia.

Data of people that left the country are quite impressive: 6-8 million of people left Venezuela (we are less than 30 million), around 50% of university professors left the country, and around 70% of university students left their studies.

#### 2. Can you share your strategies to fight for human rights defence?

At Aula Abierta we developed a multilevel strategy for the defence and promotion, at international level, of human rights. For the education, we organized workshops, courses, trainings for students, professors and civil society. The idea is that strengthening the social structure in Venezuela, we rebuild the concept of responsible citizens for the defence of democracy, and the report of human rights violation. Another strategy is to report the violations, we cannot only complain for violations, we need to analyse what is happening, studying if there are violations, patterns, general practices, verifying witnesses and sources, how is the victim doing and developing reports, that we realize thanks to international technology, with the language of international organizations and agreements. As a third and last strategy, is the international influence, since these reports on human rights are directed to UN bodies, the Pan-American system for human rights defence and to Inter-American court and its rapporteurs. In the recent years, we built a direct relation with them, participating to hearings, in 2017 there were 7 hearings about Venezuela and the regional issue.

### 3. What could help to increase the safety of yourself, your organization and the academic community?

This is a very complex question because it entails various levels. The personal safety of defenders of the organization could be improved through technology. In Venezuela we don't have good mobile phones, or safety tools in the offices, such as good doors, locks, security camera or laptops. For instance, it could be important to have money to buy software and pay licences. We don't have the possibility to own a personal vehicle, in my case I have one, but the majority of people have to take the public transport. Sometimes we don't have internet, which is necessary to keep contact with international organizations and reporting threats at real time. There are programmes that offer support to defenders, but they work through mobile phone and internet, and in Venezuela defenders are obviously limited in this sense. There aren't plans for having security staff in the offices. In relation to guaranteeing safety in the universities - in the last weeks Aula Abierta reported 115-120 accidents of safety and theft during the lockdown – the government is actually leaving the universities even more at risk. Universities are affected by a budget token policy, according to which there is a 99% budget deficit, that is, it works with 1% of what they would need. The research projects in Venezuela are cancelled, in fact they receive funds for one, two, three, five dollars per year. Obviously, this happens because of the State policy, who wish to limit the academic freedoms. Part of the solution would be to shift this policy into a new one supporting academic research, education and wellbeing of professors.

### 4. What does it meant to you to be a human rights defender? How would you define yourself?

I define myself as a citizen, as a human rights defender, and as a university professor, since I am a citizen that, through my job, combines the academic teaching and the human rights defence, especially regarding academic and civil society rights.

#### 5. Why did you apply for a temporary relocation programme? What were your expectations?

I needed to take a short break, that's why the three months offered by the Shelter City programme are perfect, because I have many responsibilities in my country, within my organization, my university and my family (I have a son). So I thought about a temporary protection programme to allow me to take a break, because the situation is really difficult, not only because it is dangerous to face such a government, but also because living in Venezuela turned out to be a nightmare, the country is experiencing an humanitarian crisis, where there are 15 hours of daily blackout., there is shortage of medicines and goods, it is really stressing to live in Venezuela. As I want to keep living in Venezuela because my life project for human rights defence is there, I also needed a temporary rest in order to return to my country after being refreshed and having written and thought. This temporary relocation is also very important on the academic perspective, since it means networking not only as NGO but also as a professor and researcher. All this helps to strengthen our work and the Shelter City has been very positive in this respect and has reached its objectives.

#### 6. What are your favourite activities?

Activities of mental regeneration. There is a weekly psychological session, I have at least an hour per week session with a psychologist, in which I can talk not only about human rights defence but also about my personal worries, fears and family issue. It's a great help. Regarding the trainings, the English course is very useful, I am very thankful for that because it is very important for human rights defender to be able to talk in English to reach United Nations bodies and international community. I also participated to educational activities as professor, guest lecturer, in a university, telling what we do in Venezuela with Aula Abierta, describing the general situation in my country and the one of academic freedoms. I joined webinars during the quarantine, and before I joined many seminars and events. I am professor of constitutional right, so I can elaborate a deconstitutional map of my country, which can be very interesting for European community. Other activities that I appreciate are the visits to the nature, especially during the lockdown, where I had my mind and body filled up with positive energy, I took advantage of this time to write and follow with my work, I wrote a paper for a journal about academic freedom in Latin America, and I am writing a new book. It has been a really interesting experience.

#### 7. How are you experiencing this special pandemic situation?

The Coronavirus issue split my stay in two parts: before and after. Before I has many meetings with activists, NGOs and journalists, I worked a lot with universities. After, we simply kept the majority of planned activities from home, through internet. I started the course of cyber security offered by Justice & Peace, we did it online during many weeks, since they were able to adapt it and it was very interesting.

### 8. Italy is developing a temporary relocation programme similar to the one of Shelter City, what would you suggest us?

The programme usually covers only the defender, not his/her family, so sometimes the defenders do not join the programme only because they don't want to leave their relatives in the countries where there are threats and risks. It could happen that who is staying will encounter a higher risk situation compared to the one of the defenders.

I think this element should be considered, because the defender's wellbeing is also influenced by the lack of the family, causing stress and fear, since his/her peace is linked to having the family nearby. Another thins that often is lacking is the protection measures for the defender's relatives (mother, father, siblings...) and his/her colleagues. Depending on the country situation and context, it would be good to develop protection and support tools for them too. For instance, in Venezuela it can be quite difficult, since sending money from abroad is challenging, due to the government control on the bank accounts. There are programmes as Scholars at Risk that welcome professors at risk, ad that I could offer, together with other protection programmes, partial mechanisms of support, such as a certain amount of money to implement activities on the place. Depending on the situation of defenders and countries, it would be good to indicate different forms of temporary relocation, some with full programme and other with partial support.

#### APPENDIX XVIII: Interview Stephanie Koch, European Centre or Press and Media Freedom

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: July 24th, 2020

Main theme: The temporary relocation programme for journalists and media workers

Interviewee: Stephanie Koch

Organization: European Centre or Press and Media Freedom

Place: Leipzig, Germany

Role of the interviewee: Programme Manager

Interview themes:

- 1. Context in which the programme started;
- 2. Characteristics of the programme;
- 3. Gender issues.

#### Objectives:

Analysing the temporary relocation programme through the direct experience of the coordinator, who can provide updated data and information that are not included within the documents and manuals published by the various organizations and associations joining the programme.

#### Evaluation:

The answers provided by Stephanie Koch are exhaustive and interesting. She also made herself available to answer any further questions or doubts.

### Questions and answers from the interview with Stephanie Koch, European Centre for Press and Media Freedom

### 1. Who select the candidates? How does the selection works? How many people do you host per "open call"?

The JiR-Programme Manager checks together with one or more colleagues the application documents. The vetting process often takes a few weeks including fact checking, getting in contact with the mentioned reference persons and the applicants.

After the fact-checking process, we are preparing a shortlist with recommendations. ECPMF forwards the shortlist to its Executive Board members. They are doing the final selection. Mostly we are offering three fellowships per call (JiR-fellowships for three people) - it depends on the fund.

### 2. Quoting your websites, "calls for applications are announced one or twice per year", why could the number of the calls changes?

The number of available fellowships and programme periods always depends on the number of funds/ the amount of available money for the project, which we get. More than one funder funds the JiR programme, normally. That means, that ECPMF manages more than one JiR programme line – currently the JiR programme consists out of three programme lines, funded by three different funders- completed

### 3. Who are ECPMF partners in JiR? (e.g. Who is in charge of the psychological support? Is the university involved?)

We are in touch with local institutions like a psychotherapy practice in Leipzig (psychological support for the fellows), with a real estate management institution (apartments for the fellows), local media outlets because of networking opportunities, with experts on digital security, mobile reporting ecc. for providing professional trainings to our fellows, lawyers for legal matters, other relocation programmes because of exchange of expertise and regarding referring cases. The network of partners and supportive institutions is large and is growing.

### 4. Besides the JiR programme manager, who is in charge of the project for ECPMF? Do you have a specific "buddy/mentor" who take care of the guest(s) daily?

Only the JiR Programme Manager is responsible for ECPMF's JiR programme – regarding organisation, administration, social support and interaction.

## 5. The JiR program aims to offer help and support to journalists/media workers under threat, what are the "standard" activities/services do you offer? (e.g German classes) Do you offer any specific training (e.g digital security)?

-support by applying for visa

-organisation of travel, accommodation and health insurance

-support by practical matters (visit of the citizen's office, practical advices for the city)

-journalism related trainings (depending on the desires and individual interests of the fellows) like digital security, mobile reporting, social media management

-psychological support, trauma therapy

-language courses (German or English)

-networking possibilities

-If the fellows would like to have, they could use a desk in ECPMF's office and work there.

-If they would like to work together with our press team on a special project, they could do it.

6. Quoting your website, the person hosted by JiR program will be offered with a "rent-free furnished apartment", is it shared with other people/other journalists or media workers participating in the project or is it private?

It is a private apartment. Only the fellow is living there. No shared flat.

7. Is the health insurance public or private?

It is a private health insurance (travel insurance).

8. The "after residence" part of the program. The return of the journalist/media worker to his/her country of origin is probably the most sensitive phase of the entire project. How do you manage this step? How do you keep in contact/follow up with the journalist/media worker?

We aware of this challenging part of the programme and we try to prepare it already during the last period of the stay in Leipzig together with our fellows as far as possible. We are talking about future plans, about the opportunity to join ECPMF's alumni network for exchange. Sometimes – depending on funding – we could arrange a few more therapy sessions via phone or video call with the Leipzig based therapist afterwards. We are in contact with our former fellows via Mail and sometimes we are sending a newsletter to them to share ECPMF news as well as information on projects, articles, of former fellows and training possibilities. We also invite our alumni to join online trainings on journalism related topics organized by ECPMF.

9. About the economic part of the program, considering that hosting a person needs a considerable amount of money, how much does the entire program costs? Which are the most expensive invoices of the budget? Which are your main sources of funds?

#### 2.200 EUR per grantee per month

most expensive: stipend (1.000 EUR per month) -> rent -> practical support (e.g. psychological therapy); as we depend on project funding, we have a fluctuation in funding streams so that it is impossible to provide an average number for our JiR programme per year. On average the monthly costs for grantees are the same in all our JiR projects - independently of the funding source.

main sources: National Endowment for Democracy fund (NED) + EU commission+ city of Leipzig+ the Free State of Saxony

### 10. Does the JiR program collaborate with other programs? If yes, what are the results and what the difficulties?

We work together with other relocation programmes in terms of exchange of knowledge and experiences, but also to refer fact-checked cases of journalists under threat.

I didn't have any bad experiences or difficulties with other programmes. Rather, the opposite is the case.

At the beginning of 2020 ECPMF invited coordinators of different organisations based in Germany, which supports media workers under threat, to built up a working group on journalism and trauma. Within this working group we are talking and working on challenges of working together with traumatized journalists to support each other and to share strategies.

A gender point of view

## 11. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics on how many women/men apply for protection/temporary relocation? And about how many of them are member of a gender minorities?

No. But it seems to be more men, who apply for a fellowship. I think it is because of family responsibilities (children, taking care of aging parents), which often don't "allow" it for women to go in another country for max. 6 months.

Gender minorities: very rare

### 12. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics about journalists/media workers that you have hosted? How many of them were men/women? And how many LQBTQI?

ECPMF hosted fellows in Leipzig, until today (status July 2020) 18:

female: 8

male: 9

transgender: 1

13. Have you noticed any special need or particular aptitude among men/women/gender minorities?

no

14. About ECPMF, does your organisation adopt a gender policy or a gender-based approach?

Not really.

We are running a women's reporting point. https://www.ecpmf.eu/support-programmes/womens-reporting-point/

15. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics about your internal organisation? How many women/men/LGBTQI work and with what job/responsibility?

Please have a look on our website, team section: https://www.ecpmf.eu/about/team/

16. Do you have disaggregated data or gender statistics of your employees that are working on these activities?

No

17. Do you have a gender budgeting?

No

18. Can you please tell me something about how did you manage, and still managing, the journalists-in-residence program during the COVID-19 pandemic? Were you hosting someone during the quarantine period? if yes, what strategies did you use to maintain the activities/program?

Two fellows arrived in February and March, before the shutdown came. Both of them are still in Germany.

We had to extend their fellowships because they couldn't return due to travel restrictions and "closed borders". Other invited fellows couldn't come to Germany because of visa process and travel problems due to COIVD-19. We had to withdraw fellowships, unfortunately.

Our fellows had to cope some weeks with the situation of self-isolation. For this therapy was an essential part of the programme and helpful.

Journalism related trainings had to take place virtually/online.

The JiR programme manager was still in contact with the fellows via mail and telephone.

#### APPENDIX XIX: Interview to Anna Artemeva, journalist hosted by the ECMPF programme

Interview type: semi structured

Date interview: September 7<sup>th</sup>, 2020

Main theme: Defender's biography

Interviewee: Anna Artemeva

Organization: Multimedia department "STUDIO"

Place: Russia

Role of the interviewee: Director

#### Interview themes:

- 1. Defender's biography;
- 2. Temporary relocation programme.

#### Objectives:

Documenting defender's life history and hes organization, collecting suggestions, expectations and ideas on the temporary relocation programme from the point of view of a guest.

#### Evaluation:

The answers provided by Anna are exhaustive and interesting. There were no particular issues.

### 1) What does it mean for you to be a journalist in Russia? How is the situation for journalists/ media workers in your country?

World Press Freedom Index for Russia is 48,92 (it's the 149-th place out of 180 countries). Six journalists of Novaya Gazeta (the media I'm working for) were killed because of their professional activities in the last 25 years.

My colleagues were beaten, most of them are getting personal threats constantly (https://cpj.org/2017/04/chechen-official-and-preachers-threaten-novaya-gaz.php)

We usually get some post boxes with funeral wreaths, dead animals' heads, envelopes with unknown powder inside, etc at Novaya Gazeta's office. (https://cpj.org/2018/10/russias-novaya-gazeta-sent-funeral-wreath-and-goat.php)

Novaya Gazeta's journalists feel constantly threatened by the Chechen authorities because of our publications. (https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/europe/reports-about-torture-of-gays-in-chechnya-produces-no-investigation-just-threats-against-journalists/ 2017/04/16/7870de24-21e6-11e7-be2a-3a1fb24d4671\_story.html? noredirect=on&utm\_term=.f0d909f99c42)

My colleague Elena Milashina, who covers Chechen stories, has been attacked several times. Photojournalists of Novaya Gazeta's often get hit with batons by the police while shooting protest actions on the streets. This summer me and other photographers were injured while covering the Moscow protests. https://rsf.org/en/news/police-violence-against-reporters-becoming-normalrussian- protests

My colleague Svetlana Vidanova was beaten, and her camera was broken by the owners of an illegal docking station, where they trained hunting dogs using live foxes, which is prohibited. The photographer managed to photograph hundreds of dead dogs and foxes near the station though. (https://novayagazeta.ru/news/2019/10/19/156252-na-territorii-pritravochnoy-stantsii-v-

moskovskoy-oblasti-napali-na-na-zoozaschitnikov-i-zhurnalistov-novoy)

On December 2019 my colleague Yulia Polukhina was arrested for one day because of her investigation about Crimean/Donbass activists and their senior curators in Russian federal security service. (https://novayagazeta.ru/news/2019/12/26/157962-k-spetskoru-novoy-gazety-yulii-poluhinoy-prishli-s-obyskami-zayavlenie-redaktsi)

At the same time Russian government legislates punishment for «contempt to the authorities» just as for «producing fake news» and «inciting extremism» – and this legislation is often used against journalists' critical publications. Bloggers and journalists are going on trial for their opinions (https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/09/03/the-change-of-power-in-russia-will-be-very-similar-to-my-arrest-a67119, https://www.mappingmediafreedom.org/2020/07/09/journalist-found-guilty-of-justifying-terrorism/)

In this situation over the past years many independent Russian media and journalists are moving to the European countries and broadcast from there to protect themselves – legally and physically (for instance Meduza is based in Riga, or The Current Time is based in Prague)

Politician and blogger Alexey Navalny make high-profile investigations about corruption among the Russian government. In the end of August 2020, he barely survived after he had been poisoned.

### 2) Why did you choose a temporary relocation programme like the ECPMF's Journalists in Residence and not a more stable/ long term option?

I applied for the first programme I could find – so depressed and desperate I was in the end of 2019, after 10 years of being staff journalist of Novaya Gazeta.

I was feeling totally exhausted and anxious. Living under an immense pressure and in danger for a long time caused me to burn out professionally. I very much needed to take a break and fix myself.

I just couldn't continue working anymore. I was searching for a way to escape. I didn't care neither about the location nor the duration of my staying at that time. Fortunately, ECPMF confirmed my application and provided me with the greatest support.

#### 3) What were your expectations?

I was looking for a safe and stressless place to calm down and renew myself. That's exactly what I got in Leipzig.

#### 4) What were the activities/ services you liked most?

Accommodation was great. The city of Leipzig is green and leafy. My apartment was near a park, so I walked there for hours every day. I realized that being connected with nature was one of the most important components of mental health and a source of creative energy for me.

Spending time on my own is another great gift of the Programme. I could never afford it while I was working. Time spent with me heals.

Care, hospitality and everyday support of ECPMF's brilliant staff were amazing as well. I felt like I was among good old friends from the very first day.

And weekly professional psychotherapy (with the best trauma specialist in the city) made recovery happen (sessions have also continued online for a few weeks after my return to Russia after my staying in Leipzig which is extremely important and needed for a sensitive return period).

#### 5) How the COVID 19 pandemic affected your staying in Liepzig? And your work?

I enjoyed the lock down and was happy to slow down. I worked online, but not very much, and it was fun.

6) In Trento (Italy) we are working for creating a temporary relocation programme for Human Rights Defenders under threat (journalists included), what do you suggest to us? What is necessary in a program like Journalists in residence in order to be effective and helpful?

I would recommend you inform your invitees about all the details and conditions of their stay before they come. So that they don't worry and know exactly what to expect.

I'm seeing time for rest in a safe location and with friendly and supportive people around as the most important component of the relocation programme.

It would be great if your invitees could choose (or refuse) the activities/masterclasses/ workshops depending on their needs or interests. That what we had on offer at ECPMF programme. And a good psychotherapist as a great help for renewing.

### APPENDIX XX: Interview with Christian Elia, responsible of the Journalists in Residence – Milan programme

Type of interview: semi-structured

Date of interview: 16th September 2020

Main topic: The Journalists in Residence Milan programme

Interviewed: Christian Elia

Organisation: QCode Mag

Location: Milan

Position of the interviewed: Programme responsible

Topics of the interview:

- 1. Analysis of the programme in the perspectives either not clear or present in the articles already published by QCode Mag and its partners;
- 2. Consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic

Goals: an in-depth analysis of Milan's temporary location programme "Journalists in Residence"

<u>Evaluation</u>: The main purpose of the interview has been achieved. Christian was available to answer additional questions and to maintain the contacts through updates and potential collaboration proposals.

Questions and answers:

### 1) Which are the involved actors in the Milanese programme "Journalists-in-residence", and what are the responsibilities and activities of each of them?

The actors involved are many: let us start from QCode Mag, the association to which I belong, that represents the container of the plan and more. Indeed, we take care of both the logistic and the practical part of the programme; we select the candidates, and we handle the permanence in both the activities and the daily necessities. Then, there is Naga, a historic Milanese association that has been involved for years in supporting refugee people on a medical and psychological level, and at the same way, Naga will be responsible for these spheres in the programme. Besides, there is IRPI, an investigative journalism network that owns the physical means for guaranteeing the cybersecurity and that will help us in the formation of the hosted people about this topic. The CILD will work for the recognition of the JiR programme at the European and national levels. Finally, the group Data Ninja is an expert in data analysis and visualisation, and it will contribute to the formation of the hosted people.

#### 2) How does the candidate selection procedure function?

QCode Mag manages the participant selection; we check that the requested requisites are fulfilled, we prepare a candidate to shortlist and, in consultation with the other partners of the project, we choose who will have the access to the programme. Qcode Mag is composed of more than 400 freelancers, 25 of which form the directive council that works on the candidates' selection.

#### 3) Who are the programme financers? What are the costs?

The funds come directly from the ECPM of Leipzig, whereas the monthly cost per person (pocket money and accommodation) is around 2200 euros as in Germany.

### 4) How do you imagine the phase following the end of the programme? How do you think to remain in contact with the hosted people after their permanence in Milan?

Considering that this first edition of JiR Milan will host people already resident in Italy, that is people that will not leave Italy for returning to their home countries, we are going to create an *ad hoc* journalistic project shared between Qcode Mag and the interested person during his/her permanence in order to create a strong relationship.

### APPENDIX XXI – Workshop on good practices for the defence and promotion of human rights women defenders

On 15 September 2020, a workshop on good practices for the defence and promotion of human rights defenders was held at the International Women's House in Rome and on the Zoom digital platform. This event is included within a bigger framework of initiatives organised name by the Centro Studi di Difesa Civile of Rome and the Centro di Ateneo per I Diritti Umani "Antonio Papisca<sup>273</sup>" of Padua, with the support of the Farnesina named as "Donne Human Rights Defenders – dal 141uadro istituzionale alle buone pratiche della Società Civile per la loro difesa e promozione<sup>274</sup>". The workshop was conducted in the afternoon and it was divided in a first part of a presentation of the representatives of the civil society organisations committed to the issue, such as PBI Europe, Yaku, A Sud<sup>275</sup>, Mosaico di Pace<sup>276</sup> and Amnesty International.

The women speakers illustrated the past and present activities of their organisations, offering to the people connected to the seminar a complete image of the biographies and the modalities and goals of each of the present experiences. In this regard, this research was presented as well focusing on the fundamental role of civil society in the ideation, implementation, and management of the temporary relocation programmes in Europe, specifically in Spain and The Netherlands. The second part of the workshop was dedicated to the discussion and reflection on the good practices and the encountered obstacles in the realisation of initiatives and activities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> Centro di Ateneo per i Diritti Umani "Antonio Papisca", website: https://unipd-centrodirittiumani.it/it/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> The initiative is included within the project "Comunicare esperienze e buone pratiche di attuazione dell'agenda Donne Pace e Sicurezza. Il contributo della società civile italiana" (Communicating experiences and good practices of implementation of the agenda Women Peace and Security. The contribute of the Italian civil society), promoted by the Centro di Ateneo per i Diritti Umani "Antonio Papisca", Cattedra UNESCO "Diritti Umani, Democrazia e Pace", Università degli Studi di Padova, in collaboration with the Centro Studi Difesa Civile. The project contributes to the realisation of the III Piano Nazionale d'Azione Donne Pace e Sicurezza dell'Italia (Naional Plan of Action Women Peace and Security), and it is realised with the support of the Foreign and International Cooperation Ministry.

<sup>275</sup> A Sud, website https://asud.net/

<sup>276</sup> Mosaico di Pace, website https://www.mosaicodipace.it/

Numerous comments were asked by the audience, both in presence and online. The final part of the workshop consisted of an exercise for identifying the good practices and obstacles that were most prominent in the working activity of the participants, both during the pandemic and during the period before. The result highlighted that the greatest obstacles encountered were the lack of political and militant culture, the precarious sustainability in periods of economic crisis, the persistency of the patriarchal society, the lack of a goal and a common strategy, as well as the difficulty in communicating, meeting, and working together due to the COVID-19 pandemic. During the sharing of the good practices encountered during the working activity of the participants, it was highlighted that empathy, the convergence of struggle, the solidarity, listening and sharing experiences both positives and negatives, the involvement of civil society and the capacity of adaptation and transformation are common points among the different associations and organisations, as well as starting points for a positive change of both the quality of results and the life of the people involved in the project and connected to the civil society and the human rights defence.

### APPENDIX XXII: Interview to Ester Gallo, coordinator of the SAR Trento's protection programme for scholars

Type of interview: structured

Date of the interview: 4<sup>th</sup> December 2020

Main topic: The SAR Trento's protection programme for scholars

Interviewed: Ester Gallo

Organisation: Scholars at Risk Italy

Location: Trento

Interviewed role: Programme coordinator

Topics of the interview:

- 1. In-depth study of the program in the unclear aspects or not present in the manuals published by SAR International;
- 2. Consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic

Goals: In-depth study of the SAR Trento model of temporary protection for academics

<u>Evaluation:</u> The main objective of the interview has been achieved. Professor Ester Gallo made herself available to answer further questions and to keep in touch through updates and any collaboration proposals.

## 1) The temporary relocation programme is an initiative led by the collaboration between SAR and the University of Trento: how are duties and responsibilities divided and shared? Which other actors are involved in the project?

The SAR protection programme at the University of Trento – as all the other activities of SAR (advocacy, formation) – are organised within the Equity & Diversity Office (https://www.unitn.it/ateneo/52060/equitadiversita), specifically, they are part of the rectorate's mandate to the *International and academic Solidarity*, dispatched to the associated professor at DSRS Ester Gallo since 2019. The mandate includes both the activities of SAR, those related to the implementation of the UNHRC's Inclusive University Manifesto (https://www.unhcr.it/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/Manifesto-dellUniversita-inclusiva\_UNHCR.pdf), and the activities connected to the Network of Italian Universities for peace (RuniPace: https://www.runipace.org/). Currently, The Equity & Diversity Office (E&D) is constituting a "working group for the Refugees Projects and SAR – Scholars at Risk" that include the following offices: Dean Office, Equity & Diversity Office, Real Estate Management for the logistical aspects of receiving scholars, External Relations Communication Department, Didactic Direction and Student Services.

At the national level, the University of Trento coordinates its activity with the Italian national pole of Scholar at Risk (https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/sections/sar-italy/) which currently consists of 28 universities and research centres that operate in the country; further, the national pole is structured upon a National Coordination (Trento and Padua) and an executive (Trento, Padua, Trieste, Scuola Normale Superiore, Cagliari). The coordination, the executive and the network are important for involving the scholars at risk in the scientific activities of other universities (seminars, lectures, conferences, research groups) as well as for creating the opportunities for the researchers involved in relocation programmes in different Italian cities to meet among themselves.

At the international level, the University of Trento relates to the SAR International's Protection Office in NY (https://www.scholarsatrisk.org/). The latter supplies the universities with various functions: it provides a list of anonymous profile for a first evaluation and selection to the universities which want to host scholars; assistance during the selection process; monitoring and support during the fellowship period; support during the relocation process in another university when the protection programme in the receiving university is terminated.

## 2) According to the handbook "How to host. A handbook for higher education partners", one of the requirements for being able to join the programme is being recognised as a threatened scholar by SAR: how does the recognition process take place?

#### At the International SAR level:

**Determination of qualifying risk**: SAR's determination of qualifying risk is based on SAR's best efforts given available resources and information and draws on SAR's experience with thousands of at-risk individuals worldwide. In deciding, SAR reviews materials provided by candidates for assistance including first-hand accounts of risk faced by the individual (a "risk statement"), available corroborating documentation (including court records, letters of dismissal, and police reports), media and other reports about the individual's situation or local or country conditions (including reports from the SAR Academic Freedom Monitoring Project), and where needed,

external expert review and risk assessments, including where practical third parties who can personally attest to an individual's risk. SAR evaluates risk to determine whether an individual's professional or personal well-being has been improperly threatened, not whether they are the most threatened person in a particular location.

**Qualifying risks**: therefore, range widely from attempts on one's life to much more subtle harassment or intimidation; they may also be of long-duration, episodic, or short-term. SAR also requests professional references, work samples, CV's, and publication lists to understand a candidate's scholarship and connection to academia. SAR's risk and scholarship determinations are subject to review should additional or contrary information becomes known to SAR at a later date. SAR invites submission of any such information. Institutions receiving and reviewing SAR's determination should consider it together with other available candidate information when determining what, if any, assistance to offer in a particular case. SAR invites any institutions with questions about SAR's determination or reaching contrary determinations based on their assessments to contact SAR. Please note, we are also working on a new organizational document that describes this process for the network, but it may not be ready for some time. In terms of measuring risk, the approach we take is to evaluate both risk and scholarship for qualification for SAR's services, as opposed to comparative ranking.

For example, and as noted above, we evaluate the risk to determine whether someone's professional or personal well-being has been threatened, not whether they are the most threatened person in a particular location. Further, we evaluate scholarship to determine whether someone has been connected to the academic community and can be understood to be a scholar, not whether they are the best scholar in the field. It is worth mentioning, though, that after the Turkey crises began, we began to prioritize for placement those facing criminal investigation and charges, in large part due to the volume of applicants needing help and the limited number of placements in the network. This is a representation as well of how we regularly assess our review process and make changes where necessary, whether in response to arising conflicts or our determination that additional measures would be appropriate.

The University of Trento relies on SAR International for the recognition of danger and neither evaluate nor produce any certificate in this sense (as any other Italian university). However, during the applications' evaluation, the recognition of international protection at the Italian and European level are taken into account.

### 3) Besides the offer of temporary protection and a research grant, what are the services, goods and activities considered by the programme?

The University of Trento provides free accommodation for the researchers and their families for the entire period of the grant (comprehensive of bills and internet costs); covering of the health insurance costs for the researchers and their families; relocation costs (flight and transport from the airport to Trento); budget for the research activity and conferences (variable depending on the discipline).

### 4) What was the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the conduction of the programme? What changes are expected in light of this unexpected situation?

The COVID-19 has created numerous difficulties to the programme, in terms of both administrative and relational/social levels:

- Prolonged delays on the issue of the residence permit and the obtaining of the visa for the family reunification;

- Closed borders for the family reunification;
- Quarantine within their accommodation for the researchers from their day of arrival;
- Difficulties to meet colleagues but also to create a friendship network in the city;
- Difficult access to the library and laboratories for research, now partially resolved.

### 5) What are the reference figures for the hosted person during its permanence? What are the roles and competencies?

#### The reference figures are mainly four:

<u>University SAR coordinator (Professor Ester Gallo)</u>: he/she follows the programme implementation from a contractual point of view, as well as the renewal of funds at central (university) and local level (PAT, Municipality, Private Foundations); he/she represents the contact person for the scholars in case of problems or emergencies by contacting the interested offices especially during the first months after the scholar's arrival; he/she sometimes accompanies the scholars to the police station or to the bank if the 150 hours student is not available; he/she coordinates with the SAR representatives of the single departments regarding the scholars' performance; he/she informs SAR Italy and SAR International about the project's evolution and for receiving feedback.

<u>SAR Representative of the Academic structure</u>: The University of Trento is divided into 13 academic structures among departments, specialistic schools and research centres. Each structure has nominated a SAR representative, who deals with following: the selection process by being part of an interdepartmental selection commission; the administrative procedures for contracts, the issue of digital signatures and university badges introducing the scholars to the department colleagues.

<u>Academic tutor</u>: he/she usually comes from the same structure of the representative, but his/her field of academic interest is similar to the one of the protected scholars. He/she monitors the scholar's activities, he/she follows the procedures for the renewal of the second year asking for a report of research, he/she supports the scholar in the laboratory or research work.

<u>"150 hours student"</u>: he/she supports the scholars mostly during the first months by introducing them in the university spaces and the city; he/she helps the scholars during their purchases and for other daily necessities.

6) In the announcement of the protection programme it is said that the accommodation is offered by the University of Trento, what kind of accommodation is that?

The accommodations are the university residences. Currently, those in Mosna Square.

### 7) Many temporary protection programmes offer a working place external from the offered accommodation. Does your receiving model include that?

The programme offers an office shared with other colleagues within the academic structure and an extra workplace in the laboratories for what concerns the STEM disciplines.

### 8) Who are the main financiers of the programme? What is the cost budgeted for the entire reception of one person?

<u>2019/2020 edition:</u> 50% of the costs have been covered by the Dean Office and 50% by the PAT – Instruction, University and Culture department.

<u>Next editions</u>: we have contacted PAT, CARITRO. We want to contact the municipality of Trento and the foundation/consortium of Savings banks.

The average annual cost including the salary and the benefits described above varies between 35,000 and 45,000 euros.

#### 9) How do you organise the re-entry? What are your strategies for follow-up?

A protection programme led by SAR International usually lasts up to 5 years. On the other hand, the grants have a duration between 12 and 16 months. This implies that often it is needed to find alternative solutions when the grant is ending. The protocol establishes that SAR International contacts other universities in the same country or in countries close to allow the scholars to be relocated within or near their previous accommodation. This is not always possible, but in this regard, the national pole should have an important role. Currently, we have not managed the reentries yet since the scholars have arrived a few months ago.

## 10) Do you have disaggregated data or statistics about the number of women/men that sent their candidature for the programme? And what about the number of members of gender minorities?

We have received 8 candidatures in Trento: 6 men and 2 women. Unfortunately, we do not have the data on the international level, but SAR recently communicated that only 20% of the applications are made by women. This is not since women are less affected, but it is due to the difficulties that women encounter in escaping from their country for continuing with their academic career. Currently, we are hosting in Trento 1 woman and 1 man, whereas in Italy are currently hosted 4 men and 2 women. The University of Rome "La Sapienza" has opened a new call, but we do not know the outcome yet.